STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

The Ivanhoe Hotel



23 The Corso, Manly

03 JUNE 2019

NBRS&PARTNERS PTY LTD

nbrsarchitecture.com

Milsons Point NSW 2061 Australia

ABN 16 002 247 565

Sydney: +61 2 9922 2344 Melbourne: +61 3 8676 0427 architects@nbrsarchitecture.com

DIRECTORS

Andrew Duffin NSW reg. 5602 (Nominated Architect), James Ward MDIA, Garry Hoddinett NSW reg. 5286, Rodney Drayton NSW reg. 8632, Andrew Leuchars LA reg. 035, Geoffrey Deane NSW reg. 3766

STUDIO PRINCIPALS

Anthea Doyle, Trevor Eveleigh, Sophie Orrock, Samantha Polkinghorne, Brett Sherson , Andrew Tripet, Jonathan West, **SENIOR ASSOCIATE** Barry Flack **ASSOCIATES** Hung-Ying Foong Gill, David Heap, Derek Mah, Craig Stephen

NBRS & PARTNERS Pty Ltd Level 3, 4 Glen Street Milsons Point NSW 2061 Australia

Telephone +61 2 9922 2344 - Facsimile +61 2 9922 1308

ABN: 16 002 247 565

Nominated Architects Geoffrey Deane: Reg No. 3766; Andrew Duffin: Reg No. 5602; Garry Hoddinett: Reg No 5286

This report has been prepared under the guidance of the Expert Witness Code of Conduct in the Uniform Civil Procedure Rules and the provisions relating to expert evidence

This document remains the property of NBRS & PARTNERS Pty Ltd. The document may only be used for the purposes for which it was produced. Unauthorised use of the document in any form whatsoever is prohibited.

ISSUED	REVIEW	ISSUED BY	
24 October 2018	Draft for Review	Grazi Prada	
19 February 2019	Final	Grazi Prada	
22 March 2019	Revised Final	Grazi Prada	
25 March 2019	Revised Final 2	Grazi Prada	
03 June 2019	Revised Final 3	Grazi Prada	

CONTENTS

1.0	INTRO	DDUCTION	1
	1.1	Background	1
	1.2	Methodology	1
	1.3	Site Location	
	1.4	Heritage Management Framework	
	1.5	Authorship	
	1.6	Limitations	
	1.7	Copyright	2
2.0	DOCU	MENTARY EVIDENCE	3
	2.1	Summary History of the Site Context	3
	2.2	19-23 The Corso	4
	2.3	25 The Corso	
	2.4	27 The Corso – The Ivanhoe Hotel	9
3.0	PHYS	ICAL EVIDENCE	16
	3.1	Site Context	16
	3.2	Description of the buildings	
	3.3	Views	17
4.0	ESTA	BLISHED HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE	
	4.1	Heritage Status	18
	4.2	Significance of the Subject Site	18
	4.3	Significance of the town centre Conservation Area	
	4.4	Significance of Items in the Vicinity	19
5.0	THE F	PROPOSAL	20
	5.1	Documentation Evaluated	22
6.0	ASSE	SSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT	23
	6.1	Introduction	23
	6.2	Overview of Potential Heritage Impacts	
	6.3	Evaluation of the Guidelines of the NSW Heritage Division	
	6.4	Heritage Objectives of the Manly LEP 2013	
	6.5	Heritage Guidelines of the Manly DCP 2013	
7.0	CONC	LUSION	27
	7.1	Conclusion	27

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Aerial map with the subject site circled red. (Source: NSW LRS, SIX Maps, maps.six.nsw.gov.au)
Figure 2 - Brighton Manly Beach, 1855. (Source: National Library of Australia: MAP F 642A, nla.obj- 229982496)
Figure 3 – Detail from Brighton Manly Beach, 1855. Approximate location of subject site circled red. (Source: NLA, MAP F 642A, nla.obj-229982496)4
Figure 4 – 1899, C. J. Carroll Chemist at 19-21 The Corso, Manly. (Source: Manly – The Queen of Australian Watering Places, Australian Town and Country Journal, 25 February 1899, p34)5
Figure 5 – 1899, Interior view of C. J. Carroll Chemist at 19-21 The Corso, Manly. (Source: Manly – The Queen of Australian Watering Places, Australian Town and Country Journal, 25 February 1899, p34)5
Figure 6 – Late 1930s, photograph showing the 1922 Exeter Flats (misleadingly, a section of the building is duplicated on the right), with the ground floor occupied by chemist W. G. Fegent. The adjacent double-storey building at 23 The Corso (on right) was occupied by Dickinson, photographers. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats')
Figure 7 – 1999, Exeter Flats, with a small portion of the heavily altered double storey building at 23 The Corso just visible on the right. Soul Pattinson Chemist occupied the ground floor at that time. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats')
Figure 8 – 2009, Exeter Flats on the left, with the extensively altered 23 The Corso visible on the right. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats')7
Figure 9 – 25 The Corso, Manly, at centre right, occupied by the 'Nursery Nook – Mary Martin', said to be dated c1960s. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, File 009642)
Figure 10 – Undated, rear of 25 The Corso, Manly. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, File 009642) 9
Figure 11 – Undated photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel, originally known as the Colonnade Hotel, built by John Farrell in c1875. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies Collection, MAN07030)
Figure 12 – 1911 - Ivanhoe Hotel, The Corso, Manly, Present and proposed ground and first floor plans, side elevation, Applicant/owner, Mrs Adrian, Architect F Trenchard Smith, Pitt Street, Manly, Signed 25 May 1911. (Source: NSW State Records and Archives, Digital ID 9590_62825)
Figure 13 – Photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel, dated August 1930. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 2 Side 2, N60-YC-533)
Figure 14 – Photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel, dated June 1936, after Tooth's took over the hotel. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 2 Side 2, N60-YC-533)
Figure 15 – Photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel, dated 1949. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 4 Side 2, N60-YC-533)

Figure 19 – View of The Corso from the Ocean end. (Source: https://www.sydney.com.au/the-corso- manly.htm)	
Figure 20 – View of The Corso from the Harbour end. Subject building noted in red. (Source: Google Maps, https://www.google.com/maps)	16
Figure 21 – The Corso elevation of the subject site. Subject building noted in red. (Source: Google Maps, https://www.google.com/maps)	17
Figure 22 – Market place elevation of the subject site. Subject building noted in red. (Source: Google Maps, https://www.google.com/maps)	
Figure 23: Excerpt from the Manly LEP 2013 heritage map. Heritage items are shown brown and the Name Conservation Area is hatched red. The subject site is circled blue. (Source: Manly LEP 2013, Heritage Maps HER_03, HER_04, HER_05 and HER_06)	
Figure 24 – Proposed The Corso Elevation. Source: Paul Kelly Design	20
Figure 25 – Proposed Market Place Elevation. Source: Paul Kelly Design	20
Figure 26 – Proposed Ground Floor Plan. Source: Paul Kelly Design	20
Figure 27 – Proposed Corso Signage. Source: The Bar Brand People	21
Figure 28 – Proposed Market Place Signage. Source: The Bar Brand People	21
Figure 29 – 1970 photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel and adjacent premises. This image was used as inspiration for the proposed changes to the façade. Subject building noted by a red arrow. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 7 Side 2, N60-YC-533)	22

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT FOR THE IVANHOE HOTEL, 23 THE CORSO, MANLY

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND

This Heritage Impact Statement has been prepared in accordance with the standard guidelines of the NSW Heritage Division to accompany an application for proposed works at 23 The Corso, Manly. The site comprises a late 20th Century shop infill fronting The Corso and Market Place.

The proposal involves alteration of The Corso façade, new Market Place façade, minor extension of the building towards Market Place and new signage. It also includes changes to the interior fit out, including separation from the adjacent retail space and opening to the existing lvanhoe Hotel.

Details of the development proposal have been prepared by Paul Kelly Design and signage by The Bar Brand People.

The subject property is listed as an item of local heritage significance on Schedule 5 of the *Manly Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2013* as part of a group of commercial buildings, Item no. 1106. It is also located within the Town Centre Conservation Area and in the vicinity of several other listed items.

Accordingly, this Heritage Impact Statement reviews the proposal in terms of the relevant heritage provisions of the *Manly LEP 2013* and the requirements of the *Manly Development Control Plan (DCP) 2013*, and the Impact Assessment Criteria guidelines endorsed by the NSW Heritage Council.

1.2 METHODOLOGY

This Heritage Impact Statement has been prepared in accordance with the guidelines set out in the *Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance*, 2013, known as The Burra Charter, and the New South Wales Heritage Office (now the Heritage Division of the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage) publication, NSW Heritage Manual.

The Burra Charter provides definitions for terms used in heritage conservation and proposes conservation processes and principles for the conservation of an item. The terminology used, particularly the words *place, cultural significance, fabric,* and *conservation,* is as defined in Article 1 of The Burra Charter. The NSW Heritage Manual explains and promotes the standardisation of heritage investigation, assessment and management practices in NSW.

1.3 SITE LOCATION

The site is located on the north side of The Corso, across from the intersection with Darley Road, Manly. The site runs through to Market Place at the rear. It is identified as SP 12989 by the NSW Land Registry Services Information (LRS) (see below).



Figure 1: Aerial map with the subject site circled red. (Source: NSW LRS, SIX Maps, maps.six.nsw.gov.au)

1.4 HERITAGE MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK

The subject property is listed as an item of local heritage significance on Schedule 5 of the *Manly Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2013* as part of a group of commercial buildings, item no. 1106. It is also located within the Town Centre Conservation Area and in the vicinity of a number of other listed items, including:

- St. Matthew's Church and Church Hall Item No: I113;
- Commercial Building Item No: 107;
- Group of Commercial Buildings Item No: I109; and
- The Corso street trees Item No: I104.

Other heritage listed items in the vicinity of the subject site are visually and physically separated from the site by roadways / distance, and do not warrant assessment as part of this report.

1.5 AUTHORSHIP

This report was prepared by Grazi Prada, Senior Heritage Architect, using research and a history written by Dr Martina Muller, Historian, all of **NBRS**ARCHITECTURE.

1.6 LIMITATIONS

This report is limited to the assessment of potential impacts on the European cultural heritage values of the site and does not include Aboriginal and Archaeological assessment. This report only addresses the relevant planning provisions that relate to heritage.

1.7 COPYRIGHT

Copyright of this report remains with the author, **NBRS**ARCHITECTURE. Unless otherwise noted, all images are by the author.

2.0 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

2.1 SUMMARY HISTORY OF THE SITE CONTEXT

The subject site is located in Section B of the Brighton Estate, which was originally part of 100 acres granted to John Thompson on 13 April $1842.^{1}$

In 1853, Henry Gilbert Smith purchased John Thompson's 100-acre grant in Manly, bounded on the south by the present alignment of The Corso, for the sum of £800. Smith then set about turning the little village of Manly into his grandiose vision for a beachside resort town to be called, "New Brighton".² The subject property lies partly within this grant and was included in the land purchased by Gilbert Smith on 9 March 1853.

The following year, Gilbert Smith built a small pier at Manly Cove and instigated his own regular boat service to Circular Quay. Opposite the pier he constructed the neat Italian-style Pier Hotel with an adjoining public "Pleasure Garden" for walks.³ A visitor on Boxing Day 1888 recorded how he sat on the verandah of the Pier Hotel, amid the tinkle of barrel organs and "oompahs" of a German Band, watching the streams of day trippers file off the paddle-steamboats.



Figure 2 - Brighton Manly Beach, 1855. (Source: National Library of Australia: MAP F 642A, nla.obj-229982496)

As Smith purchased more and more land in the Manly area, his ideas for the area's development grew. In 1856, Smith cleared a wide street between the harbour and the ocean frontage which he named 'The Corso' after a street he remembered from Rome. He laid the foundation stone for the first Church of England, St Matthew's in 1858 and gave land for other public buildings and public parks.

The Norfolk pines along the ocean front are said to have been planted by Smith who also established trees on the harbour foreshores and established the concept of planting trees in Manly's streets. He built a public bath house where the Manly Art Gallery would open in 1930, and erected various statues including the famous stone kangaroo (1857) which he considered would attract visitors to the area, and a "Camera Obscura" for the entertainment of day trippers.

¹ NSW LRS, Old Systems Title Bk 25 No. 609

² Ashton, Paul, Manly, Dictionary of Sydney, 2008, http://dictionaryofsydney.org/entry/manly (accessed October 2018)

³ This and the following is based on Sharp Alan, *Pictorial Memories of Manly to Palm Beach*, 1983, p8; Ashton, Paul, Manly, Dictionary of Sydney, 2008, http://dictionaryofsydney.org/entry/manly (accessed October 2018)



Figure 3 – Detail from Brighton Manly Beach, 1855. Approximate location of subject site circled red. (Source: NLA, MAP F 642A, nla.obj-229982496)

The earliest hotels on the Corso included the Pier Hotel and the Steyne, and a few weatherboard cottages, a grocery shop and post office, two other shops and a house known as 'Bolton's Cottage' were located on the north side of the Corso, together with some other small shops.⁴ The south side contained even fewer buildings, including the Church of England on the opposite side of the subject site.

2.2 19-23 THE CORSO

19-23 The Corso contains the four storey Exeter Flats which were built in 1922, and a double storey building located adjacent to the east that predated the flats but was later extensively altered.⁵ Exeter Flats was built on a site which contained a chemist since 1896, when C. J. Carroll opened a pharmacy and dentist shop.⁶ Photographs of the premises were published in the *Australian Town and Country Journal* in 1899 (Figure 4-Figure 5).

⁴ Manly Municipal Jubilee, Sydney Mail, 2 February 1927, p9

⁵ Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats'

⁶ Pandora Archive, 'Peninsula Historian – When Chemists Processed your Snaps', www.mphs.com.au (accessed October 2018)



Figure 4 – 1899, C. J. Carroll Chemist at 19-21 The Corso, Manly. (Source: Manly – The Queen of Australian Watering Places, Australian Town and Country Journal, 25 February 1899, p34)



Figure 5 – 1899, Interior view of C. J. Carroll Chemist at 19-21 The Corso, Manly. (Source: Manly – The Queen of Australian Watering Places, Australian Town and Country Journal, 25 February 1899, p34)

Mr Carroll sold his chemist business to W. G. Fegent Ltd during World War II and a chemist has subsequently been located at the site until today.⁷ By World War II, the original chemist building had been replaced by the Exeter Flats, which were nearing completion in October 1922. The front flats each contained three rooms and a kitchen, while the rear flats contained two rooms and a kitchen.

Exeter Flats only extended over part of the allotment, being located at 19-21 The Corso, with the older, separate building remaining at 23 The Corso. This building had an awning over the

⁷ If not otherwise noted, the following is based on Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats'

shop front and an upper floor balcony with two doors. It contained a decorative parapet with gabled end. The building was occupied by the late 1930 by Dickinson, photographers, while W. G. Fegent was still shown as the occupant of the adjacent chemist shop on ground floor level (at 19-21 The Corso).



Figure 6 – Late 1930s, photograph showing the 1922 Exeter Flats (misleadingly, a section of the building is duplicated on the right), with the ground floor occupied by chemist W. G. Fegent. The adjacent double-storey building at 23 The Corso (on right) was occupied by Dickinson, photographers. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats')

23 The Corso was later occupied by Norton-Trevaire, a 'great name in photography' (cf. Figure 9). The business, which had another shop in the 'Strand Arcade' in the city, specialised in exclusive wedding portraiture and in reproductions of photographs in oils in various sizes.⁸ A photograph dated 1970 shows the building still occupied by Trevaire (Figure 17).

In August 1989, the shops at 19-23 Corso were offered for sale at auction.⁹ It is likely that the double-storey building at 23 The Corso was altered shortly after the transfer to the new owners, as by 1999 the building's elevation had changed dramatically, with the original parapet removed and the gabled roof replaced by a flat roof, and the two upper floor windows replaced by a horizontal aluminium framed window.

The ground floor shops of the combined site at 19-23 The Corso subsequently became part of the same occupancy by Soul Pattinson Chemist, with connected surgery.¹⁰

⁸ Advertising, *Catholic Weekly*, 9 May 1946, p17

⁹ Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats'

¹⁰ Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats'



Figure 7 – 1999, Exeter Flats, with a small portion of the heavily altered double storey building at 23 The Corso just visible on the right. Soul Pattinson Chemist occupied the ground floor at that time. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, 'Corso, [no 19-23] Exeter Flats')





2.3 25 THE CORSO

A double storey building with a gabled roof, parapet and cantilevered awning was located at the site by the 1930s at the latest (Figure 13). This was part of a separate development until the building's replacement by a new bank building which was later altered again to become

part of the Ivanhoe Hotel site. The roof slope of the early building at 25 The Corso was facing the street and the upper floor contained three sash windows.

In 1924, additions were carried out at 25 The Corso by B. A. Pickersgill.¹¹ By 1949, the building contained a cake shop (Figure 15), and by 1953 it contained the 'Nursery Nook', a baby and children's clothing shop.¹² The 'Nursery Nook – Mary Martin' is also shown in a c1960s photograph (Figure 9). On 26 March 1954, the *"Two Brick Shops, with 8 rooms over, tenanted, adjoining hotel, 1st-class position in this great shopping area, Land 25x100 approx., Lane at rear"*, were part of an auction sale.¹³ In the 1970s, a real estate agency was located at the site (Figure 17).

By 2009, the building had been demolished and a new double-storey building added for the St George Bank (see Figure 8 and Figure 18).



Figure 9 – 25 The Corso, Manly, at centre right, occupied by the 'Nursery Nook – Mary Martin', said to be dated c1960s. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, File 009642)

¹¹ Building & Construction, *Daily Telegraph*, 21 May 1924, p3

¹² Advertising, *The Sun*, 18 September 1953, p18

¹³ Advertising, Sydney Morning Herald, 6 March 1954, p36



Figure 10 – Undated, rear of 25 The Corso, Manly. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies, File 009642)

2.4 27 THE CORSO – THE IVANHOE HOTEL

The Ivanhoe Hotel was previously the Colonnade Hotel, built by John Farrell (the second) by November 1875.¹⁴ The frontage of the double storey Colonnade Hotel had a timber verandah and balcony structure, and two gables. Located opposite the church, it was noted in 1882 that "the sweet music" of the Sunday school children opposite did "not reach the bar of the hotel", where business was going strong.¹⁵

John Farrell was noted as the licensee of the Colonnade Hotel from 1876 until 1881, and Samuel Bloomfield took over in 1882-83.¹⁶ When John Farrell died in 1889, the hotel went to his son, John Farrell the third, who had to mortgage the hotel to his sister, Hannah Malcolm, in 1894, during the depression. She foreclosed on him but never occupied the hotel, instead renting it to the Adrians.



Figure 11 – Undated photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel, originally known as the Colonnade Hotel, built by John Farrell in c1875. (Source: Manly Library Local Studies Collection, MAN07030)

¹⁴ Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'; Advertising, Sydney Morning Herald, 6 November 1875, p16

¹⁵ The Slanders about Manly, Sydney Daily Telegraph, 11 November 1882, p6

¹⁶ Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'

In 1884, Thomas Adrian took over the Colonnade Hotel and renamed it the Ivanhoe Hotel.¹⁷ Adrian had previously established the Ivanhoe Park Hotel on the grounds of Ivanhoe Park by the early 1870s, but moved out when the Ivanhoe Park Hotel was being converted into the Manly Council Chambers in 1877.¹⁸ A big sale of both the Colonnade Hotel household furniture and the Ivanhoe (Park) Hotel surplus furniture was held on 23 May 1884 "on the *Premises, Colonnade Hotel and Ivanhoe Hotel, Manly*".¹⁹ By 1885, Thomas Adrian's wife Emma Adrian had taken over the hotel by which time it was known as the Ivanhoe Hotel.²⁰ Emma Adrian continued to run the hotel until 1919, when it was transferred to Frank Dimond.²¹

By 1919, the hotel had appeared in the newspapers a number of times, mostly in relation to reports of accidents and incidents. In 1905, for instance, John Adrian fell from the balcony of the hotel onto the roadway below, fracturing his skull and leaving the 38-year old son of Emma Adrian in a critical condition.²² In May 1906, 22-year old barmaid Mary Ann Rootes was shot dead at the bar of the hotel by her estranged husband who subsequently committed suicide.²³ The balcony of the hotel was sometimes used by politicians to address the crowds, and the sources suggest that the building still had a balcony by 1924.²⁴

In 1911, architect F Trenchard Smith had designed additions to the hotel, carried out by builder Frank Tolhurst (Figure 12).²⁵ These additions appear to have been limited to the public bar area of the building and do not seem to have been extensive.



Figure 12 – 1911 - Ivanhoe Hotel, The Corso, Manly, Present and proposed ground and first floor plans, side elevation, Applicant/owner, Mrs Adrian, Architect F Trenchard Smith, Pitt Street, Manly, Signed 25 May 1911. (Source: NSW State Records and Archives, Digital ID 9590_62825)

¹⁷ Ibid.

¹⁸ One of Manly's Landmarks to be Removed, *Evening News*, 8 February 1922, p1

¹⁹ Advertising, Sydney Morning Herald, 22 May 1884, p10

²⁰ Police, *Sydney Morning Herald*, 9 December 1885, p8

²¹ After 45 Years, The Sun, 6 November 1919, p7; Licensing Court, Sydney Morning Herald, 28 November 1919, p5

 ²² Casualties, Sydney Morning Herald, 7 October 1905, p14
 ²³ The Tragedy at Manly, The Age, 10 May 1906, p6; Tragedy at Manly, The Peak Hill Express, 18 May 1906, p9

²⁴ Advertising, The Australian Star, 21 August 1907, p2; Mr E. M. Clark at Manly, Evening News, 7 March 1893, p2; Rally at Manly for 'Labor

Daily', Labor Daily, 13 October 1924, p1

²⁵ Contracts, Sydney Morning Herald, 13 June 1911, p5

From 1919, Frank Dimond ran the hotel but was later sued by his business partner, Patrick White, for letting the business go downhill.²⁶ The licence was transferred to J. Studd Price in May 1921, and later licensees included John Everett and John Joseph Kelly.

Ivy May Curran ran the hotel from March 1930. A photograph dated 1930 shows the Ivanhoe Hotel at that time (Figure 13). The photograph suggests that by then the original Colonnade Hotel building had undergone major alterations, if not complete rebuilding. A third floor with an oriel window had been added and the verandah structure had been removed. It is unclear when and by whom these alterations had been carried out but given that the building still had a balcony by 1924, at least some modifications were carried out to the building in the late 1920s, involving the removal of the balcony.

Shortly after taking over the licence of the Ivanhoe Hotel, Ivy May Curran applied for permission to erect a cantilever awning.²⁷ By that time, the building was still owned by Hannah Malcolm, however, she died on 25 January 1934, aged 80. By that time, Ivy Curran was still the licensee.



Figure 13 – Photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel, dated August 1930. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 2 Side 2, N60-YC-533)

²⁶ Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'

²⁷ Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'

The hotel was purchased by Tooth & Co in November 1934.²⁸ In March 1935 it was reported that Copeman Lemont and Keesing, architects, had let a contract to builders Paynter and Dixon for alterations to the Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso, Manly.²⁹ That year the architects were also responsible for rebuilding the Criterion Hotel and alterations to the Empire Hotel in Sydney for Tooth & Co.³⁰

A photograph dated June 1936 (Figure 14) shows that the building had an awning above the ground floor by then. It appears that the ground floor façade received new tiling and the ground and first floor fenestration was altered, likely as part of the alterations by Copeman Lemont and Keesing, including replacement of the first floor casement windows with sash windows (see Figure 14 - Figure 15).



Figure 14 – Photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel, dated June 1936, after Tooth's took over the hotel. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 2 Side 2, N60-YC-533)

In August 1938, the Ivanhoe Hotel was declared a 'gaming house', as part of a police campaign to suppress illegal SP bookmaking at the premises.³¹ In 1940, an application to

²⁸ Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 4 Side 2, N60-YC-533

²⁹ Contracts Let, Sydney Morning Herald, 5 March 1935, p3; Cf. Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'

³⁰ Contracts Let, *Sydney Morning Herald*, 17 September 1935, p3

³¹ Manly Hotel 'Declared', The Labor Daily, 30 August 1938, p2; Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'

install new fittings at the hotel was approved.³² By the 1940s, the three-storey hotel had a saloon bar, a public bar and a lounge in the trading quarters, and the private quarters contained a lounge, offices, separate bathrooms and toilets, as well as 13 double rooms, including a staff room.³³



Figure 15 – Photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel, dated 1949. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 4 Side 2, N60-YC-533)

The Ivanhoe Hotel underwent various internal alterations over time and was renamed Plaza Hotel (or Ivanhoe Plaza Hotel)³⁴ in 1978, after it had been sold to J.E. & E. J. Investments Pty Ltd and Stannian Pty Ltd in 1975.³⁵ In 1985, the hotel was sold to the Petersen family who reinstated the old name 'Ivanhoe Hotel'.³⁶

In 1993, it was reported that the Ivanhoe hotel had won Council approval for the addition of a balcony over the awning to create an outdoors entertainment area.³⁷ Council had decided to allow such balconies over awnings in 1991, with the Ivanhoe Hotel being the first to apply for this.

³² Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'

³³ Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 4 Side 2, N60-YC-533

³⁴ Advertisements, *Sydney Morning Herald*, 7 December 1984, p42

³⁵ Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 5 Side 2, N60-YC-533

³⁶ Broadsheet Sydney, 'The Ivanhoe Hotel reopens', by Brittany Lee Waller, 28 March 2013,

https://www.broadsheet.com.au/sydney/food-and-drink/ivanhoe-hotel-reopens (accessed September 2018); A long drink, Sydney

Morning Herald, 16 October 1994, p153

³⁷ Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'



Figure 16 – 1960 photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 5 Side 2, N60-YC-533)



Figure 17 – 1970 photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel and adjacent premises. The double storey building to the west was by that time in use as a real estate agency. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 7 Side 2, N60-YC-533)



It may have been as part of these works that the two side windows on the second floor were altered (Figure 18).

Figure 18 – 2009 photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel and adjacent premises, showing the hotel with a new balcony structure and altered side windows on the first floor. By that time the adjacent property had been altered extensively for use as a bank. (Source: Flickr, photograph by Ian Sanderson, dated 24 May 2009, https://www.flickr.com/photos/iansand/3557799145, accessed September 2018)

After a planning phase of 10 years, the Petersen family extensively redeveloped the Ivanhoe Hotel in 2012-13, which also included extensive alterations to the premises adjacent to the west of the hotel, which had been in use as a bank.³⁸

The redevelopment cost \$3.3 million and was given approval after a Land and Environment Court appeal in 2008.³⁹ The redeveloped building, which provided space for 900 patrons, included a new rooftop dining area, coffee shop and pizza kitchen, a balcony on the Corso, bottle shop, poker machines and TAB. The hotel was still owned by the Peterson family and Hilrok Properties Pty Ltd.

³⁸ Broadsheet Sydney, 'The Ivanhoe Hotel reopens', by Brittany Lee Waller, 28 March 2013,

https://www.broadsheet.com.au/sydney/food-and-drink/ivanhoe-hotel-reopens (accessed September 2018); A long drink, Sydney Morning Herald, 16 October 1994, p153

Morning Herald, 16 October 1994, p153 ³⁹ This and the following is based on Manly Library Local Studies, 'Ivanhoe Hotel, Corso'

3.0 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

3.1 SITE CONTEXT

The Corso, containing the subject site, acts as a low scale pedestrian corridor which links the harbour to the ocean. It is characterised by low rise commercial development dating from the 19th and early 20th centuries. Facades above the ground level are generally intact, with only a few modern obtrusive buildings.



Figure 19 – View of The Corso from the Ocean end. (Source: <u>https://www.sydney.com.au/the-corso-manly.htm</u>)



Figure 20 – View of The Corso from the Harbour end. Subject building noted in red. (Source: Google Maps, https://www.google.com/maps)

3.2 DESCRIPTION OF THE BUILDINGS

The subject site comprises two distinct buildings, a 4 storey early 20th century apartment block with commercial space on the ground floor, and a small 2 storey infill obtrusive late 20th century commercial building. Both buildings run through to Market Place at the rear, which the smaller building being slightly set back from the lane compared to the adjacent properties.



Figure 21 – The Corso elevation of the subject site. Subject building noted in red. (Source: Google Maps, https://www.google.com/maps)



Figure 22 – Market place elevation of the subject site. Subject building noted in red. (Source: Google Maps, https://www.google.com/maps)

3.3 VIEWS

Primary views of the subject building are those of the facades on The Corso together with the adjacent buildings which form The Corso group of commercial buildings, local listed item no. 1106 and the Manly Town Centre Conservation Area.

4.0 ESTABLISHED HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

4.1 HERITAGE STATUS

The subject property is listed as an item of local heritage significance on Schedule 5 of the *Manly Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2013* as part of a group of Commercial Buildings Item no. 1106. It is also located within the Town Centre Conservation Area and in the vicinity of a number of other listed items. Details of these items are included below.



Figure 23: Excerpt from the Manly LEP 2013 heritage map. Heritage items are shown brown and the Name Conservation Area is hatched red. The subject site is circled blue. (Source: Manly LEP 2013, Heritage Maps HER_03, HER_04, HER_05 and HER_06)

4.2 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE SUBJECT SITE

The following Statement of Significance for the Commercial Buildings, at The Corso, Manly, is sourced from the NSW State Heritage Inventory database, database number 2020001:

The streetscape and its special qualities are of major significance to the state. The Corso has important historical links to the development of tourism and recreation which is still present and likely to continue. It's role as the pedestrian link between harbour and ocean, city and sea – for the tourist, is fundamental to Manly's status as a resort.

4.3 SIGNIFICANCE OF THE TOWN CENTRE CONSERVATION AREA

The subject site is located within the Town Centre Conservation Area which is listed in Schedule 5 of the *Manly LEP* 2013.

The following Statement of Significance for the Town Centre Conservation Area is sourced from the NSW State Heritage Inventory database, database number 2020838:

The Manly Town Centre Conservation Area (TCCA) is of local heritage significance as a reflection of the early development of Manly as a peripheral harbor and beachside village in the fledgling colony of New South Wales. This significance is enhanced by its role as a day-trip and holiday destination during those early years, continuing up to the present time, and its association with H G Smith, the original designer and developer of the TCCA as it is today. The physical elements of the TCCA reflect this early development and its continued use for recreational purposes, most notably the intact promenade quality of



The Corso and its turn of the century streetscape, as well as key built elements such as hotels, and remaining original commercial and small scale residential buildings.

The beautiful natural setting of the TCCA has provided a solid foundation for its picturesque qualities. The cultural landscape, including plantings, monuments and open spaces, reflects the continued enhancement of the TCCA over time, in order to attract and sustain visitors to the area, which in turn has provided great support to the local economy. The many historic vistas which remain to this day enhance the visitor experience of the TCCA and assist with providing an interpretation of the TCCA as it has changed over time.

The TCCA maintains a high level of social significance, as a popular destination for local, national and international tourists, as well as through its encapsulation of the Australian beach culture.

4.4 SIGNIFICANCE OF ITEMS IN THE VICINITY

The subject site is located in close proximity to the following heritage items listed in Schedule 5 of the *Manly LEP* 2013:

St. Matthew's Church and Church Hall - Item No: I113

The church is a well consistently detailed but sombre example of Interwar Gothic style. The interior detailing and fittings are of a high quality of design, exhibiting a contrasting lightness to the exterior. As this building is seen in the round, the spatial effect on the north eastern side is of significance and it makes an important landmark and identifies the junction of the Corso with Darley Road. It makes a major contribution to the Corso.

Commercial Building – Item No: 107

One of the most elaborate facades featured in The Corso, contributes aesthetically and historically to the Corso streetscape.

Group of Commercial Buildings - Item No: I109

Two, two-storey terrace commercial buildings. Modern architectural significance in scale and style; major significance in contribution of additional horizontal emphasis to streetscape of The Corso.

The Corso street trees – Item No: I104

Part of earliest planting on The Corso c.1850's by H.G. Smith. Historic and aesthetic importance to the streetscape.

Other heritage listed items in the vicinity of the subject site are visually and physically separated from the site by roadways or distance.

5.0 THE PROPOSAL

The proposed development, designed by Paul Kelly Design, includes the following:

- Changes to The Corso façade inspired by a previous building on site found on historical photographs;
- New minor extension towards Market Place;
- New signage; and
- New interior fit-out, including separation from number 19 The Corso and new opening to connect to the Ivanhoe Hotel.

The aim of the proposal is to alter from the current pharmacy commerce to a new gaming and storage areas for the Ivanhoe Hotel.





Figure 24 – Proposed The Corso Elevation. Source: Paul Kelly Design

Figure 25 – Proposed Market Place Elevation. Source: Paul Kelly Design



Figure 26 – Proposed Ground Floor Plan. Source: Paul Kelly Design



Figure 27 – Proposed Corso Signage. Source: The Bar Brand People



Figure 28 – Proposed Market Place Signage. Source: The Bar Brand People



Figure 29 – 1970 photograph of the Ivanhoe Hotel and adjacent premises. This image was used as inspiration for the proposed changes to the façade. Subject building noted by a red arrow. (Source: Australian National University, Noel Butlin Archives Centre, Tooth's Yellow Cards, 'Plaza Hotel (ex Ivanhoe Hotel to 1978), The Corso, Manly', Card 7 Side 2, N60-YC-533)

5.1 DOCUMENTATION EVALUATED

The following drawings, prepared by Paul Kelly Design and signage by The Bar Brand People, were reviewed for the preparation of this report:

DRAWING NO.	DRAWING TILE	ISSUE	DATE
DA 0 00	Cover Page	А	21.03.2019
DA 00 1 01	Ground Floor – Existing/ Demolition Plan (Context)	С	22.05.2019
DA 01 1 01	Level One – Existing/ Demolition Plan (Context)	В	22.05.2019
DA 00 1 01a	Ground Floor – Existing/ Demolition Plan	С	22.05.2019
DA 00 1 02	Ground Floor – Proposed Plan	D	22.05.2019
DA 01 1 01a	Level One – Existing/ Demolition Plan (Context)	С	22.05.2019
DA 01 1 02	Level One – Proposed Plan	С	22.05.2019
DA 02 1 01	Roof – Existing/ Demolition Plan	A	21.03.2019
DA 02 1 02	Roof – Proposed Plan	А	21.03.2019
DA 00 2 01	Elevation (South-Eastern: The Corso) – Existing	А	21.03.2019
DA 00 2 02	Elevation (South-Eastern: The Corso) – Proposed	А	21.03.2019
DA 00 2 03	Elevation (North-Western: Market Place) – Existing	А	21.03.2019
DA 00 2 04	Elevation (North-Western: Market Place) – Proposed	А	21.03.2019
TIH002	Ivanhoe Hotel DA Signage	01	19.02.2019

6.0 ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

6.1 INTRODUCTION

This Heritage Impact Statement has been prepared in relation to the following impact assessment criteria: the *Manly Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2013*, the *Manly Development Control Plan (DCP) 2013* and the New South Wales Heritage Office (now NSW Heritage Division) guidelines, *Altering Heritage Assets* and *Statements of Heritage Impact*, contained within the NSW Heritage Manual.

6.2 OVERVIEW OF POTENTIAL HERITAGE IMPACTS

Proposed Works	Heritage Impact	
Changes to The Corso façade inspired by a previous building on site found on a	Positive heritage impact	
historical photograph.	The changes to the existing façade components enable the façade above ground level to relate to the adjacent properties and to contribute to the established character of the heritage items and conservation area.	
New minor extension towards Market Place	Neutral heritage impact	
	The extension is of a minor nature, will not be visible from The Corso, and is consistent with the remainder of the Market Place facades.	
New signage	Neutral heritage impact	
	The new signage is restrained to the awning and below and is consistent with the remainder of the signage found on The Corso.	
New interior fit-out, including separation from number 19 The Corso and new	Neutral heritage impact	
opening to connect to the Ivanhoe Hotel.	Proposed internal changes are minimal and mainly relate to shop fit out.	
Retention of commercial use.	Positive heritage impact	
	The retention of the historical uses for the buildings is a desirable outcome.	
	The use of the building by the Ivanhoe Hotel provides the opportunity to establish a future use for the building which will support the protection of the heritage significance of The Corso.	

6.3 EVALUATION OF THE GUIDELINES OF THE NSW HERITAGE DIVISION

The following assessment is based on the assessment criteria set out in the NSW Heritage Office (now Heritage Division) publication 'Statements of Heritage Impact', contained within the NSW Heritage Manual. The standard format has been adapted to suit the circumstances of this application.

The following aspects of the proposal respect or enhance the heritage significance of the item or conservation area for the following reasons:

• The changes to The Corso façade are more in keeping with the remainder buildings of The Corso and have been based on an earlier building on the site.

6.3.1	MINOR ADDITIONS
0.0.1	

Guidelines	Assessment of Heritage Impact
How is the impact of the addition on the heritage significance of the item to be minimised?	• The changes to The Corso façade have been inspired by an earlier building on the same site and will be more in keeping
Can the additional area be located within an existing structure? If not, why not?	with the remainder of the street.The minor extension towards Market
Will the additions visually dominate the heritage item?	Place is consistent with the remainder of the buildings facing that street and will have a neutral impact on the significance
ls the addition sited on any known, or potentially significant archaeological	or the heritage items or the conservation area.
deposits? If so, have alternative positions for the additions been considered?	• The small area fronting market Place may contain archaeological deposits
Are the additions sympathetic to the heritage item? In what way (eg form, proportions, design)?	although the construction of the current building is likely to have resulted in significance disturbance of any pre- existing archaeological material.
	• The changes to both street facing facades are sympathetic in character scale, form, sitting, detailing, materials

and colour.

6.3.2 NEW SIGNAGE

Guidelines	Assessment of Heritage Impact
How has the impact of the new signage on the heritage significance of the item been minimised? Have alternative signage forms been	 The new signage is in keeping with the remainder of the street and will be used to link the usage of the building to the adjacent Ivanhoe Hotel.
considered (eg free standing or shingle signs). Why were they rejected?	• Other forms of signage have not been considered as the signage to and below
Is the signage in accordance with Section 6, 'Areas of Heritage Significance', in Outdoor Advertising: An Urban Design-Based Approach? ⁴⁰ How?	the awning is typical to the street and retain the façade above the awning clear of signage.
Will the signage visually dominate the heritage item/heritage conservation area or heritage streetscape?	• The signs will be internally illuminated but in dark colours to match the remainder of the Hotel signs.
Can the sign be remotely illuminated rather than internally illuminated?	

⁴⁰ A joint publication by the Department of Planning (NSW) & Department of Planning and Housing (Vic). Published by the Department of Planning (NSW), Sydney, 1991

6.4 HERITAGE OBJECTIVES OF THE MANLY LEP 2013

The proposed development is considered to be acceptable, from a heritage perspective, for the following reasons:

- The proposed façade is more in keeping with the remainder of The Corso than the existing modern obtrusive building.
- Retains views to and from the existing buildings along The Corso.
- There will be a positive impact to the appreciation of the groups of commercial buildings and the established heritage significance of the *Town Centre Conservation Area*

The proposal is, therefore, considered to be consistent with the relevant heritage objectives of the *Manly LEP* 2013, which are:

5.10 Heritage conservation

(1) Objectives

The objectives of this clause are as follows:

(a) to conserve the environmental heritage of Manly,

(b) to conserve the heritage significance of heritage items and heritage conservation areas, including associated fabric, settings and views,

- (c) to conserve archaeological sites,
- (d) to conserve Aboriginal objects and Aboriginal places of heritage significance.

6.5 HERITAGE GUIDELINES OF THE MANLY DCP 2013

The *Manly DCP 2013* supports the *Manly LEP* 2013 by providing additional objectives and development standards for properties within Heritage Conservation Areas and Special Character Areas.

6.5.1 GENERAL HERITAGE PROVISIONS

The proposed development is generally consistent with the objectives of the *Manly DCP* 2013 that relate to heritage and are set out in the following DCP Sections:

3.0 General Principles of Development

3.2 Heritage Considerations

Objective 1) To retain and conserve environmental heritage and cultural significance of Manly including:

- significant fabric, setting, relics and view associated with heritage items and conservation areas;
- the foreshore, including its setting and associated views; and
- potential archaeological sites, places of Aboriginal significance and places of natural significance.
- Objective 2) To ensure any modification to heritage items, potential heritage items or buildings within conservation areas is of an appropriate design that does not adversely impact on the significance of the item or the locality.
- Objective 3) To ensure that development in the vicinity of heritage items, potential heritage item and/ or conservation areas, is of an appropriate form and design so as not to detract from the significance of those items.
- Objective 4) To provide infrastructure that is visually compatible with surrounding character and locality/visual context with particular regard to heritage buildings/areas and cultural icons.
- Objective 5) To integrate heritage management and conservation into the planning development process including incentives for good heritage management, adaptive reuse, sustainability and innovative approaches to heritage conservation.

6.5.2 HERITAGE CONSERVATION AREAS

The subject property is located within the Town Centre Heritage Conservation Area, for which

the Manly DCP 2013 contains the following considerations:

3.2 Heritage Considerations

- 3.2.2 Alterations or Additions to Heritage Items or Conservation Areas
- 3.2.2.1 Complementary Form and Scale that Distinguishes Heritage Significance
- 3.2.2.2 Retaining Significant Features and Landscape Setting.

Comment:

The proposed Corso façade complements the remaining buildings and is sympathetic in character, scale, form, sitting, detailing, materials and colour.

6.5.3 SPECIAL CHARACTER AREAS AND SITES

The subject property is located within the Town Centre Heritage Conservation Area and The Corso, for which the *Manly DCP* 2013 contains the following guidelines:

5.1.2 The Corso

The Corso Guidelines:

- 5.1.2.1 Most existing buildings are significant and are to be conserved, not redeveloped;
- 5.1.2.2 Internal changes are important;
- 5.1.2.3 Significance is more than the depth of a façade: thus new development is to be to the rear;
- 5.1.2.4 Parapets to be read against the sky;
- 5.1.2.5 Critical views to be kept open;
- 5.1.2.6 New buildings to maintain and express the existing narrow fronted subdivision pattern;
- 5.1.2.7 New buildings, where permitted, to have vertical and generally flat but finely detailed facades;
- 5.1.2.8 Windows and balconies open to the street;
- 5.1.2.9 Building heights determined by site-specific as well as numeric requirements;
- 5.1.2.10 Existing arcades to be maintained;
- 5.1.2.11 Footpath Awnings;
- 5.1.2.12 Street Level Uses to encourage activity;
- 5.1.2.13 Shop-fronts are to be reinstated;
- 5.1.2.14 New buildings to have a clear contemporary design idiom;
- 5.1.2.15 External building colours are important to the overall presentation of The Corso;
- 5.1.2.16 New residential development constrained with noise abatement measures;
- 5.1.2.17 External details for plant, exhausts, ducts etc. to be part of the overall building structure.
- 5.1.2.18 The impact of new development on rear lane-ways and on adjacent development is important
- 5.1.2.19 Site specific controls

Comment:

The proposed Corso facade will be new but based on an earlier building found on the same site. It will continue to have openings to the street, an awning above the footpath and street level uses. The new shopfront will relate to the adjacent Ivanhoe Hotel with a contemporary feel to it. Proposed internal changes are minimal and mainly relate to shop fit out.

7.0 CONCLUSION

7.1 CONCLUSION

The proposed alterations and additions of the property at 21 The Corso, Manly, will have an acceptable impact on the heritage significance of the Heritage Items and Town Centre Conservation Area.

The design of the minor alterations has been carefully considered and is in keeping with the form and materials of the area. The new elements were inspired by the historical photograph of the site, will retain a footpath awning and a connection to the street.

All existing views to and from the heritage items in the vicinity, and the character of the Conservation Area will be retained and conserved.

The proposed minor alterations are consistent with the heritage objectives of the *Manly LEP* 2013 and the *Manly DCP* 2013. In our view, the consent authority should have no hesitation, from a heritage perspective, in approving this application.

flag. Toda

Grazi Prada Senior Heritage Architect NBRSARCHITECTURE

03 June 2019