

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2023/0208
Proposed Development:	Alterations and additions to an existing dual occupancy to create a single dwelling on each lot
Date:	26/06/2023
To:	Stephanie Gelder
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 30 DP 2427 , 184 Pittwater Road MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
<p>The proposal has been referred to Heritage as it is a heritage item, being Item I205 - House - 184 Pittwater Road and located in C1 - Pittwater Road Conservation Area, as listed in Schedule 5 of Manly LEP 2013.</p>
Details of heritage items affected
<p>Details of the heritage item and the HCA as contained in the Manly heritage inventory are as follows:</p> <p>Item I209 - House <u>Statement of significance</u> This building is an unusual example of an Arts and Crafts building. This item is of local cultural heritage significance as it demonstrates the pattern of development associated with Pittwater Road. Constructed on the main road, it is associated with the development of the area following the introduction of the tram service. An unusual Arts and Crafts style house constructed of concrete block resembling ashlar stonework, a rare example of its kind in Manly and possibly the state which contributes to the significance of the Pittwater Road Conservation Area overall.</p> <p><u>Physical description</u> Unusual concrete block single storey residence with Arts and Crafts influence. Concrete block finished to resemble rock faced ashlar stonework. Parapeted entry with recessed door and verandah. Roughcast chimney. Low front fence has matching blockwork with pipe rail. Infill to front and side verandah. Extensions to rear.</p> <p>C1 - Pittwater Road Conservation Area <u>Statement of significance</u> This street pattern is distinctive and underpins the urban character of the area. The streets remain unaltered in their alignment, although the names of Malvern, Pine and North Steyne are now names for what were Whistler, Middle Harbour and East Steyne respectively.</p> <p><u>Physical description</u> The streetscape of Pittwater Road is a winding vista of late 19th and early 20th century commercial and residential architecture of generally one or two floors - although there are exceptions such as the four storey private hotel. The streetscape provides a 19th century atmosphere due to it's scale, width and the number of extant Victorian structures. Within the streetscape there are a number of individually significant buildings which are listed separately. Adjacent streets generally comprise a consistent pattern of one and two story residential cottages, with the occasional terrace. Some streets have intermittent street plantings and remnant stone kerbs. The flat topography is accentuated by the escarpment to the west which provides an important visual, vertical and vegetated backdrop.</p>
Other relevant heritage listings

Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	N/A	

Consideration of Application

The proposal seeks consent for alterations and additions to the existing heritage listed building, located within a conservation area, which is an intact example of Arts and Crafts Style with an unusual usage of the concrete blocks. The rear façade, facing Pacific Lane, is also important as the heritage listing applies to the whole site not only to the main street frontage.

It is noted that a preliminary advice had been provided to the applicant's preliminary drawings: *A pavilion style extension to the rear - Pacific Lane side, is considered to be a more appropriate design solution rather than a first floor extension over the existing building.* However, the submitted drawings are proposing a first floor extension over the main house with a smaller setback in comparison with the preliminary drawings. The proposed dormer is significantly larger than a traditional dormer, therefore it is not considered as a dormer but a first floor extension.

Although, the rear extension removes a large portion of the original block work, it is appreciated that the submitted drawings reinstate the front verandahs and retain the original layout on the ground floor of the main house. Considerations should be given to the northern portion of the verandah to retain the original concrete blocks forming a masonry balustrade and the southern portion of the fibro infill to be completely removed. The first floor extension (which is described as a dormer in the HIS) is not considered to be compatible with the character of the existing building. The upper most level of a traditional dormer must be at least 200mm lower than the main ridge and the width of a traditional dormer must be significantly smaller than the proposed extension. The proposed new works must recognise and support the heritage significance of the house and its context, while enabling the house to respond the contemporary needs of the users. It is considered that the location of the first floor bedroom could be replaced with the proposed bathroom to minimise the impact on the heritage significance of the original building and the conservation area as this will allow the bathroom to be located within the existing roof space, therefore will allow an increased setback to the first floor extension from the main street and reduced visibility from the street. The proposed rear façade could also retain portions of the concrete blocks and/or reuse the removed walls in order to achieve the original building to be interpreted from the rear lane rather than the proposed presentation of a completely contemporary building. Considerations should be given to the retention of the significant original fabric where possible, such as the original concrete blocks, original roof form and chimneys while removing the later modifications. The proposed external colour scheme should be in keeping with the original character of the heritage building; dark colours, such as black and grey, are not acceptable within the heritage conservation area.

Revised comments - 22 June 2023

Amended drawings provided a better transition between the original building and the new additions. However, further improvements are required and will be conditioned:

- the proposed ridge level to the rear addition must be lower than the original ridge level
- the fibro infill to front verandah must be completely removed
- the location of the new gate at the southern portion of the front boundary fence and its relation with the existing tree must be clarified and colour details of the gate/front fence must be provided
- photographic archival record is required

Therefore, no objections are raised on Heritage grounds subject to four conditions.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of MLEP 2013

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) No

Required? Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

Further Comments

The proposal is therefore supported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

CONDITIONS TO BE SATISFIED PRIOR TO THE ISSUE OF THE CONSTRUCTION CERTIFICATE

Photographic Archival Record

A photographic archival record of the site is to made of all existing buildings and structures (including interiors and exteriors and their setting), generally in accordance with the guidelines issued by the NSW Heritage Division of the Department of Planning and Environment.

This record must be submitted and approved by the Council's Heritage Advisor prior to the issue of a Construction Certificate and commencement of any demolition or works on-site.

The photographic record should be made using digital technology, submitted on archival quality CD-R disc, and should include:

- Location of property, date of survey and author of survey;
- A site plan at a scale of 1:200 showing all structures and major landscape elements;
- Floor plans of any buildings at a scale of 1:100;
- Photographs which document the site, cross-referenced in accordance with recognised archival recording practice to catalogue sheets. The extent of documentation will depend on the nature of the item.

Reason: To provide an archival photographic record of the site, including any buildings and landscape elements, prior to any works.

Reduction to new ridge level

The proposed ridge level of the rear additions must be lowered to RL 13.20 in order to be lower than the ridge level of the main roof.

Details demonstrating compliance are to be submitted to the Council's Heritage Advisor prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To preserve the significance of the heritage item and minimise the visibility from Pittwater Road.

Front verandah

The fibro infill to front verandah of Unit 2 must be completely removed to reinstate the original verandah.

Details demonstrating compliance are to be submitted to the Council's Heritage Advisor prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To reinstate the original appearance of the heritage building.

Front fence and new gate

The proposal involves a new gate, which is inserted in the south section of the existing front boundary fence. The proposed location of the new gate is inconsistent between the plans and street elevation. The location of this gate and its relation with the existing tree must be clarified. The amended drawings and the details of the finishes of the new gate must be submitted to the Council's Heritage Advisor for approval prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To ensure the location and finishes/colours of the new gate are appropriate for the heritage item and the HCA.