Flora & Fauna Assessment, Stoney Range Regional Botanic Garden as impacted by the proposed development of 4 Delmar Parade & 812 Pittwater Road, Dee Why. July 2023.



Introduction

In August 2021 Ecological Surveys and Planning (ESP) prepared a flora and fauna assessment report for a proposed redevelopment at 4 Delmar Parade and 812 Pittwater Road, Dee Why. In response to the development application lodged by Landmark in relation to this proposal, North Beaches Council has advised that ESP (2021) did not address the impacts of shading over native vegetation in Stony Range Regional Botanic Garden, and that the proposal is inconsistent with one of objectives of the Warringah Development Control Plan Clause E5(3), namely the maintenance of natural shade profiles.

Aquila Ecological Surveys (AES) was contracted by Landmark Group to address the concerns raised by Council and assess the impact of the proposed neighbouring development of 4 Delmar Parade and 812 Pittwater Road, Dee Why upon the Heritage Conservation Area of Stoney Range Reserve. In order to determine the potential indirect impacts of shade, that part of Stony Range Regional Botanic Garden that would be affected by the proposed development during autumn, winter and spring were surveyed by Paul Burcher¹ (B.App.Sc.) between 11 a.m. and 1 p.m. on 12 June 2023. As this date is approximately one week away from the winter solstice, it is considered to accurately cover the period of most concern. Detailed notes were made of the nature of the vegetation that could potentially be affected and the component species therein.

Description of the Affected Area

Extents of overshadowing presented by the proposed development were prepared by Rothelowman Architects, who have prepared the shadow diagrams on Drawings TP05.03 to TP05.14 (addendum A). The highest proportion of shading and hence effect on the reserve is during the winter solstice, and this area, although highly conservative as it is only applicable for a single day, was taken to form the measure of the affected area.

Vegetation within the affected part of the reserve is composed of a mix of remnant locally occurring native plant species and a wide variety of Australian plants that have been planted in the reserve since its establishment.² The planted specimens are mostly comprised of species from the eastern seaboard including some that occur locally. The affected area also includes a vehicular entrance lane, walking paths, a barbecue area and a pond.

The vegetation has a canopy to 25 metres tall that is dominated by the locally occurring native plant species Smooth-barked Apple (*Angophora costata*) and Sydney Peppermint (*Eucalyptus piperita*) along with Bangalay (*E.botryoides*), Lemon-scented Gum (*Corymbia citriodora*) and Red Cedar (*Toona ciliata*).

There is a moderately dense to very dense understorey that includes locally occurring native plant species Cheese Tree (*Glochidion ferdinandi*), Saw Banksia (*Banksia serrata*), Lilly Pilly (*Acmena smithii*), Cabbage Tree Palm (*Livistona australis*) and NSW Christmas Bush (*Ceratopetalum*

¹ Paul is the principal of Aquila Ecological Surveys (ABN 75 407 030 097). He has been an independent environmental consultant for over 30 years. He is a practicing member of the Ecological Consultants Association of NSW and is a signatory to its Code of Business Practice, Professional Conduct and Ethics.

² In relation to State legislative definitions, some of the plant species in the affected part of the reserve are not "native vegetation." Native vegetation in NSW under the *Local Land Services Act 2013* and thus the *Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016* and *State Environmental Planning Policy (Biodiversity and Conservation) 2021* is defined as trees, understorey plants, groundcover and wetland plants that are native to New South Wales. Plants in the affected area of the reserve that are not native to NSW include species that constitute a significant amount of foliage cover, namely Lemon-scented Gum and Queensland Tree Waratah, the natural distributions of which are confined to Queensland. A similar definition of 'native vegetation' was in force under the Native Vegetation Act 2003 in 2011 when the DCP was adopted.

gummiferum). There is a wide variety of planted rainforest trees the most common of which are Illawarra Flame Tree (*Brachychiton acerifolius*) and Queensland Tree Waratah (*Alloxylon flammeum*), and there is a grove of planted Macaranga (*Macaranga tanarius*) near the northern boundary west of the barbecue area.

The shrub stratum mostly consists of planted Narrow-leaved Palm Lily (*Cordyline stricta*), *Grevillea* cultivars, Blackthorn (*Bursaria spinosa*), Mint-bushes (*Prostanthera spp*), Blueberry Ash (*Elaeocarpus reticulatis*), Bolwarra (*Eupomatia laurina*) and Pink Wax Flower (*Eriostemon australasius*).

The groundcover is composed of a range of species tolerant of the heavy shade cast mostly by the small tree layer. Common species are Harsh Ground Fern (*Hypolepis muelleri*), Bracken (*Pteridium esculentum*), Maidenhair Fern (*Adiantum aethiopicum*), Basket Grass (*Oplismenus aemulus*), Native Violet (*Viola hederacea*), Climbing Guinea Flower (*Hibbertia scandens*), Weeping Grass (*Microlaena stipoides*) and Sword Sedge (*Lepidosperma laterale*).

Intact remnant bushland, less subject to planting, occurs on the slope in the east of the affected area (Figure 1). Here there is a canopy of Smooth-barked Apple and Grey Gum (*Eucalyptus punctata*) with a shrub layer that includes Black She-oak (*Allocasuarina littoralis*), Black Wattle (*Callicoma serratifolia*), Blueberry Ash, Hairpin Banksia (*Banksia spinulosa*) and Bushy Needlebush (*Hakea sericea*). Groundcover species include Sword Sedge, Spiny-headed Mat-rush (*Lomandra longifolia*), Wiry Panic (*Entolasia stricta*), Forest Grass-tree (*Xanthorrhoea media*), Apple Berry (*Billardiera scandens*) and Trailing Guinea Flower (*Hibbertia dentata*).



Figure 1. Extract from shade diagram illustrating worst-case scenario for shading of intact bushland (stippled) at 3 p.m. in winter.

This vegetation conforms to Plant Community Type (PCT) 3592 Sydney Coastal Enriched Sandstone Forest. The State Vegetation Type Map (Department of Planning and the Environment 2023) erroneously indicates that whole of the reserve is vegetated with this PCT.



Photo 1. Intact bushland (PCT 3592) on the north-west-facing slope east of the barbecue area.

Discussion

As evidenced by the shade profiles prepared by Rothelowman on behalf of Landmark Group (Addendum A), the proposed development would modify shade profiles in the northern part of the reserve. However, it is considered impacts of this shading are likely to be minimal.

The canopy trees in the affected area are as tall or taller than the proposed building height. Given the angle of the shadow cast, this mean that access to light for leaves in the canopy would not be diminished by the proposed building, even at the winter solstice. Hence there is unlikely to be any effect on the vigour of the canopy trees.

It is also considered unlikely that any of the plants in the understorey, shrub or groundcover strata would be significantly affected by the shade cast by the proposed buildings. In the affected area, there would still be access to the extant level of light during the main growing season (late spring to early autumn). Groundcover and shrub species are already heavily shaded by the small tree layer which is mostly composed of the rainforest/wet sclerophyll forest species Cheese Tree, Illawarra Flame Tree and Queensland Tree Waratah, each of which is also tolerant of shade. It should also be noted that the extent of shading moves throughout the day and shading is inconsistent, thereby further decreasing any impact. Although shading would be exacerbated by the proposed building

during late autumn to early spring in a minor portion of the affected area, the species composition and health of individual plants is unlikely to be modified.

Some species, for example ferns, may proliferate during the affected months at the expense of species adapted to higher light levels such as Basket Grass and Bordered Panic. Nevertheless, most if not all of the component species in the groundcover, including these grass species, are adapted to low light levels.

This is equally applicable to the intact bushland in the east of the affected area. On this western facing slope constituent plant species would still be subject to full afternoon sun during summer. There would be decreased penetration of light into the groundcover in this area, and likely increased soil moisture. Again, this may have a temporary seasonal impact favouring some species adapted to lower light levels (e.g. Trailing Guinea Flower) at the expense of species such as Wiry Panic.

However, this would be negated by the full sun effects experienced during summer which would not be modified by the proposed development. When overlain on the shade diagram it is estimated that the partial winter shading would affect at the most approximately $1000m^2$ of this vegetation (of which just above 200m2 would be subject to shade throughout the whole day). However, the model does not take into account that ground level elevations in the reserve increase moving eastward from just east of from the barbecue area; or that the easternmost building is 15 m above ground level, some 8 m lower than that part of the proposed development that affects the more modified areas of the reserve. Therefore the affected area is likely to be considerably less than a maximum of $1000 m^2$ and likewise the area subject to shading throughout the day to be considerably less than $200m^2$.

In relation to likely impacts on fauna movement, existing buildings on the site already compromise ingress and egress of birds and bats north of the reserve. The proposed development site offers little function as a wildlife corridor as apart from a few plantings it contains buildings and hard surfaces and adjoins the shopping centre to the north, Pittwater Road to the west and a residential area to the east. The flora reserve represents more of a stepping stone for fauna movement and that function is unlikely to be compromised by the development.

The following threatened plant species occur within the affected area (Figure 2):

- Rough-shelled Bush Nut (*Macadamia tetraphylla*) listed as vulnerable on the Commonwealth *Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999* (EPBC Act) and the NSW *Biodiversity Conservation Act 2016* (BC Act).
- Chef's Hat Correa (Correa baeuerlenii) listed as vulnerable on the EPBC Act and BC Act.
- Queensland Tree Waratah listed as vulnerable on the EPBC Act (not indicated on Figure 2).
- Grevillea shiressii listed as vulnerable on the EPBC Act and BC Act.



Figure 2. Locations of threatened flora species in the affected part of the reserve.

None of these species occur naturally in the reserve nor the local area. All specimens of these species in the reserve have been planted and it is considered that that under the EPBC Act there are no important populations of any of the species. Therefore, there would not be a significant impact on any of the four EPBC Act listed species. Under the BC Act there are no viable local populations of the three listed species. The proposed development would not significantly affect any of the species, or their habitats.

Conclusion

An assessment was undertaken of the potential impacts shading from the proposed development would have on vegetation within Stony Range Regional Botanic Gardens. It was found that the impacts are likely to be negligible and seasonal in nature. There is unlikely to be any appreciable long-term impact on the composition of native vegetation within the reserve.

References

Department of Planning and the Environment (2023) *State Vegetation Type Map.* Accessed June 2023. https://datasets.seed.nsw.gov.au/dataset/nsw-state-vegetation-type-map/resource/anzlic-web-map.

Ecological Surveys and Planning (2021) *Flora & Fauna Assessment, 4 Delmar Parade & 812 Pittwater Road, Dee Why.* Unpublished report prepared for Willow Frank Architects, Kogarah.

Report prepared by

Paul Burche

Paul Burcher 03/07/2023

Addendum Shadow Diagrams

(page intentionally left blank)



DA SUBMISSION			EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM EXISTING BUILDING								
Revisions A 11.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE	10		EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM MAXIMUM ENVELOPE TO LEP HEIGHT LIMIT	Project 4 Delmar Pde & 812	SHADOW PLANS -	Project No 221054 Date 05.06.23	Author DM	5cale: @ ^1/1 : 750	Drawing No.		/
B 22.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE C 05.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE	30 21		EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM PROPOSED FORM	Pittwater Rd, Dee Why	WINTER	221034 05.06.23	DW	1.750	TP05.03 C	· ,	rothelowman
		_	MAIN TRACK								/
			SIDE TRACK		a all common law, statutory law and other rights including cop Property Pty. Ltd. against all claims resulting from use of this						Brisbane, Melbourne, Sydney
7/06/2023 2:09/26 PM			SENSORY TRACK	unsuthorized changes or reuse of the document on a	Property Pty. Ltd. against as cleans resulting from use of this other projects without the permission of Rothe Lowman Prope of the license to use this document. ABN 76 005 783 997	document for any purpose other than its intended use, ify Pty. Ltd. Under no circumstance shall transfer of this					www.rothelowman.com.au
			APPROXIMATE LOCATION OF TRACKS								



DA SUBMISSION			EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM EXISTING BUILDING							
Revisions A 11.05.23 COUNCILISSUE			EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM MAXIMUM ENVELOPE TO LEP HEIGHT LIMIT	Project 4 Delmar Pde & 812	SHADOW PLANS -	Project No 221054 Date 05.06.23	Author JC	5cale: @ A1 1 : 750	Draveling No.	/
8 22.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE C 05.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE	10	22	EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM PROPOSED FORM	Pittwater Rd, Dee Why	WINTER	221054 05.06.23	JC	1:750	TP05.04 C	rothelowman
		_	MAIN TRACK							/
			SIDE TRACK	Disclaimer: Rothe Lowman Property Pty. Ltd. retain	ns all common law, statutory law and other rights including cop 1 Property Ptr. Ltd. acainst all claims resulting from use of this	yright and intellectual property rights in respect of this				Brisbane, Melbourne, Sydney
7/05/2023 2:09:52 PM			SENSORY TRACK	unauthorized changes or reuse of the document on	h Property Pity, Ltd. against as clams resulting from use of this other projects without the permission of Rothe Lowman Prope in of the lowers to use this document. ABM 25:005-213, 907.	occurrent for any purpose other than its intended use, inty Pty. Ltd. Under no circumstance shall transfer of this				www.rothelowman.com.au
			APPROXIMATE LOCATION OF TRACKS							



DA SUBMISSION			EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM EXISTING BUILDING							
Revisions A 11.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE	10		EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM MAXIMUM ENVELOPE TO LEP HEIGHT LIMIT	Project 4 Delmar Pde & 812	SHADOW PLANS -	Project No 221054 Date 05.06.23	Author JC	5cale: @ ^/ 1 : 750	Drawing No.	/
8 22.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE C 05.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE	JC DL	222	EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM PROPOSED FORM	Pittwater Rd. Dee Why	WINTER	221034 05.06.23	30	1.750	TP05.05 C	rothelowman
		_	MAIN TRACK							/
			SIDE TRACK		ns all common law, statutory law and other rights including copy Property Ptr. Ltd. acainst all claims resulting from use of this					Brisbane, Melbourne, Sydney www.rdthelowman.com.au
7/06/2023 2:10:19 PM			SENSORY TRACK	unauthorized changes or reuse of the document on	Property Pry. Ltd. against all clams resulting from use of this other projects without the permission of Rothe Lowman Proper of the learner to use this document. ABN 76 005 783 997	document for any purpose other than its intended use, ify Pty. Ltd. Under no circumstance shall transfer of this				www.rothelowman.com.au
			APPROXIMATE LOCATION OF TRACKS							



DA SUBMISSION			EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM EXISTING BUILDING							
Revisions A 11.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE	JC DL		EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM MAXIMUM ENVELOPE TO LEP HEIGHT LIMIT	Project 4 Delmar Pde & 812	Drawing SHADOW PLANS -	Project No 221054 Date 05.06.23	Author JC	5cale: @ A1 1 : 750	Drawing No.	- • •/
B 22.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE C 05.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE	3C	222	EXTENT OF SHADOWING FROM PROPOSED FORM	Pittwater Rd, Dee Why	WINTER	221000 03.00.23		1.750	TP05.06 C	rothelowman
			MAIN TRACK						1	
			SIDE TRACK	Disclaimer Rothe Lowman Property Pty. Ltd. retain	ns all common law, statutory law and other rights including cop Property Ptr. Ltd. acainst all claims resulting from use of this	yright and intellectual property rights in respect of this			-	Brisbane, Melbourne, Sydney www.rothelowman.com.au
7/06/2023 2:10:37 PM			SENSORY TRACK	unauthorized changes or reuse of the document on	other projects whout he permission of Rohe Lownan Prope r of the loanse to use this document. ABN 76 005 783 997	ity Pty. Ltd. Under no circumstance shall transfer of this				www.scondownan.com.au
			APPROXIMATE LOCATION OF TRACKS							



DA SUBMISSION Revenues/A 20152 COMPLEXED X	^{Project} 4 Delmar Pde & 812 ^{Cranity} /SHADOW PLANS - ^{Project NU} /221054 ^{Dist} /22.05.23 ^{Adder} JC ^{Dist} 8.47 1 : 750 Pittwater Rd, Dee Why AUTUMN / SPRING	TP05.07 A rothelowman
20050033 92/07 400	Bigeletiene / Rule (answer Propert) FL 14 werden auf answerten beschlange frager erste ers	Brisbane, Mebourne, Sydney www.rothelbeuman.com.au



DA SUBMISSION							
Revisions A 22.05.23 COUNCIL ISSUE	z	^{Project} 4 Delmar Pde & 812 Pittwater Rd, Dee Why	SHADOW PLANS - AUTUMN / SPRING	Project No 221054 Date 22.05.23	Author JC 5cole: @ AV 1 : 750	TP05.08 A	rothelowman
22/05/2023 9:20:50 AM		document. The recipient indemnifies Rothe Lownan unsufforized changes or reuse of the document on	ns all common law, statutory law and other rights including cop Property Pty, Ltd. against all claims resulting from use of this other projects whoch the permission of Roths Loverann Prope of the license to use this document. ABN 76 005 783 997	a document for any purpose other than its intended use.		+	Brisbane, Mebourne, Sydney www.rothelowman.com.au



	A Dolmar Pde & 812 Denver ShADOW PLANS - New by 221054 Denv 22.05.23 Addrew JC Denver Str. TP05.09 A Pittwater Rd, Dee Why AUTUMN / SPRING	rothelowman
22(05/2023 9.21 24 AM	Distributions: Printer (An Lourner) Printer (Phy) (L. Mariani et al. and manness than address and and and the address and and address address and address address and address address and address addr	Brisbane, Mebbourne, Sydney www.sothelowman.com.au



DA SUBMISSION	^{neger} /4 Delmar Pde & 812 ^{Descy/} SHADOW PLANS - ^{neget th} /221054 ^{Des/} 22.05.23 ^{Math/} JC ^{Sold © 1/} 1 : 750 ^{Descy th} /TP05.10 A Pittwater Rd, Dee Why AUTUMN / SPRING	rothølowman
22(05/2023) 9:21-87 AM	Declarer Mexicums Proper Py. LL service dates at anomalise history are used on photo hashing copylicit at Mexicums Py. LL service of the history and photo p	Brisbane, Mebourne, Sydney www.rothelowman.com.au



DA SUBMISSION	Proper 4 Delmar Pde & 812 Deamy SHADOW PLANS - Proper Tay 221054 Dear 22.05.23 Amer JC Scale @ xl/1 : 750 Pittwater Rd, Dee Why SUMMER	TP05.11 A	rothelowman
2008/00 0 0 11 A M	Budden: Bits Laware Underschult für die miter al anzument is aufbarg bei auf oder under studies graphyte auf die bade graphyte auf d	+	Brisbane, Mebourne, Sydney www.rothelowman.com.au



DA SUBMISSION Renorm / A 12/02.3 CORCLUSE 2	^{Project} 4 Delmar Pde & 812 ^{Damey} SHADOW PLANS - ^{Project to} 221054 ^{Damey} 22.05.23 ^{Amey} JC ^{Scale} 8 ^{N/} 1 : 750 Pittwater Rd, Dee Why SUMMER	TP05.12 A rothelowman
20020112.0.4 AA	Standards (Not Learner Fragel) Ty Lis dates at Januaria tas kalkarja na načelar nje kolada povjeta se lateka kaje proving site in mesiat de na baselar de Notes en lateka kaje kaje proving kaje site proving kaje site proving kaje proving kaje na date proving kaje site proving kaje s	Bisbana Maboura, Sydney www.rothalowman.com.au



DA SUBMISSION	^{Negat} 4 Delmar Pde & 812 ^{Descrip} SHADOW PLANS - ^{Negat tor} 221054 ^{Dem} 22.05.23 ^{Amer} JC ^{Solic g st} 1 : 750 Pittwater Rd, Dee Why SUMMER	TP05.13 A rothelowman
20000018 8737 M	Stabilizer Shirk Learn Francy PL, Li deski a fammer has stability ter and effer within stability copy of an Athenne start of the descent PL and environment of the start Place PL (as a start of the st	Bitbon, Mebourn, Sydney www.rotheboman.com.au



DA SUBMISSION	^{Proper} /4 Delmar Pde & 812 ^{Createry} /SHADOW PLANS - ^{Proper to} /221054 ^{Catery} /22.05.23 ^{Addery} /JC ^{State & M} /1 : 750 ^{Catery} /1 : 750 ^{Catery} /22.05.23 ^{Addery} /JC ^{Catery} /1 : 750 ^{Catery} /1 : 750 ^{Catery} /1 : 750 ^{Catery} /22.05.23 ^{Addery} /JC ^{Catery} /1 : 750 ^{Catery} /22.05.23 ^{Catery} /JC ^{Catery} /22.05.23 ^{Catery} /JC ^{Catery} /22.05.23 ^{Catery} /JC ^{Catery} /22.05.23 ^{Catery} /22.05.	TP05.14 A rothefowman
200223 12 A M	Backeters: Not is same Parely (b), [1] is direct and common see, subtry to include on paylor solution and paylor solution of paylor solution and the p	Brisbane, Mebourne, Sydney www.rothelowman.com.au