

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2022/0469
Date:	03/11/2022
To:	Jordan Davies
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 11 DP 1207743 , 1102 Barrenjoey Road PALM BEACH NSW 2108

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS		
Discussion of reason for referral		
<p>The proposal has been referred to as the site adjoins a local heritage item and is located opposite another, which are both listed in Schedule 5 of Pittwater LEP 2013:</p> <p>Item 2270076 - "Barrenjoey House" (restaurant and accommodation) - 1108 Barrenjoey Road Item 2270037 - Norfolk Island Pines – Barrenjoey Road, Pittwater Park (opposite Barrenjoey House)</p>		
Details of heritage items affected		
<p>Details of these heritage items in the vicinity, as contained within the Heritage Inventory are:</p> <p>"Barrenjoey House"</p> <p><u>Statement of Significance</u> Barrenjoey House is historically significant as it has been in nearly continuous use as a restaurant and guest house since it was built in 1923 by Albert Verrills. It was also the first place in Palm Beach to have a telephone and as such it holds social significance for the Palm Beach community.</p> <p><u>Physical Description</u> This plastered two-storey plastered brick building with pitched roof was built as a guest house in 1923. It features a sunny dining room with windows the length of one wall overlooking the water and a large terrace with canvas canopy for outdoor dining. The interior retains traditional character including wallpaper and emu chandeliers.</p> <p>Norfolk Island Pines</p> <p><u>Statement of Significance</u> The Norfolk Island Pines are of local historic and aesthetic significance as a fine representative example of the widespread use of this species for ornamental plantings in coastal areas.</p> <p><u>Physical Description</u> A fine planting of mature specimens of Araucaria heterophylla (Norfolk Island Pine) in Pittwater Park, adjacent to the public wharf at Palm Beach and across Barrenjoey Road from Barrenjoey House. The trees are along the western and southern edges of this park which includes a children's playground and car park. The trees provide welcome shade for picnickers using the Pittwater beach</p>		
Other relevant heritage listings		
Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th	No	

Century Buildings of Significance		
Other	No	

Consideration of Application

The site is not a heritage item but is located adjacent to a heritage item and within a key urban setting of Palm Beach. The heritage item critically affected by the proposal is Barrenjoey House, whose significance is not in dispute and for which its historical details and aspects of that significance can be found in Council’s heritage inventory entry for the property. Across Barrenjoey Road the stand of Norfolk Island Pines along the western and southern ends of the Park and associated carpark area is also listed. The significance of these trees is also not disputed.

The original proposal for this application could not be supported on heritage grounds, for a number of reasons. These comments respond to a new proposal for development of the subject site, following earlier schemes and a modification proposal relating to the former (and current) development approval for the site. The applicant has sought to develop a new design proposal for the site, with consideration for its site in Palm Beach and its current context.

The scheme now submitted follows extended discussions with Council officers in which all participants have sought to achieve a mutually satisfactory and better development outcome for the property and the Palm Beach locality in which it is so prominent. The heritage issues which surround the proposal, given this site, together with its contextual importance and adjacency to Barrenjoey House, are front and centre in its assessment.

While saying that, it must be acknowledged that the site is not a heritage item but is located adjacent to a heritage item and within a key urban setting of Palm Beach. The proposed development of the site is both enabled by the applicable planning controls under the LEP, and qualified by the heritage and planning controls flowing from Council’s LEP and DCP. This referral comment reviews and considers earlier heritage comment and the stages of negotiation following.

As the now lodged plans show, Council’s concerns that the building should be “broken up” in design, and should better relate to the height and key scalar lines and elements of Barrenjoey House, have been taken seriously and explored to the advantage of what is now submitted. The central, forward-standing “breakfront” element is also broken up into three elements and at each end the building is stepped back, adding a small public foreground space adjacent to Barrenjoey House, and stepping back the car parking access at the southern end. While overall the central breakfront is still wider than Barrenjoey House, it is broken up so that no one element is comparable in façade length to the heritage listed building. Above, in the third (in-roof attic) level, the dormer forms are also broken up and are now simplified, and more understated in their design.

Overall, the character of the building is less overtly allusive to historical or fashionable styling which was an earlier concern. The scale of the colonnaded main elevation is helped by the proportions of its column spacing, the varied balustrade treatment and valances to reduce opening heights. Suggestions are made below to a revision in the materials and finishes schedule, that would hopefully achieve a better contextual relationship in addition to the measures that have been adopted.

In summary, the achievement of a development outcome which defers to the local historical importance and until now, the prominence of Barrenjoey House in the “western village” of Palm Beach, is qualified by the zoning of the site and the permissibility of development which can only present a challenge to the existing scale, character and “atmosphere” of the “village”.

With the implementation of all the recommended measures that have been put to the proponents, the

proposal is supported for planning assessment as a better heritage outcome for the site than earlier proposals. In this, the support of Council's DSAP must be noted, and these heritage comments added to their consideration.

The scheme before Council as a new proposal, is far preferable to the scheme earlier approved for the site, and in heritage terms, would be supported in preference to that proposal.

It is suggested that the presentation of the building could be assisted by an alternative roofing material for the main roof planes, such as traditional slate or some of the reconstituted slate products which used in a "proper" traditional fixing method, have similar advantages in appearance, recessiveness, colour and scale. Metal would be appropriate and in keeping for the attic dormer forms in mid grey toning. Concrete tiles are not supported as appropriate for this building and context.

The proposed colour scheme references that of Barrenjoey House (currently) and might be subtly differentiated by use of a darker sandstone cream wall colour, encouraging the building to visually recede.

It is noted that this proposal also involves relocation of an electricity substation to the other side of Barrenjoey Road, to be located within the Council carpark. This relocation will not impact upon the heritage listed row of Norfolk Island Pine trees as they are located along the waters edge. Therefore, this relocation will not have an adverse impact upon this heritage item. It is suggested however, that consideration should be given to the possibility of moving the substation to the southern side of the carpark entrance, to minimise its visual impact on views when driving north along Barrenjoey Road.

Therefore, taking everything into consideration, the proposal can now be supported on heritage grounds, subject to the imposition of a condition requiring full details of external finishes, materials and colours to be submitted for approval prior to issue of CC.

Further Comments

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of PLEP 2013:

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No Has a CMP been provided? N/A

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

The proposal is therefore supported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

CONDITIONS TO BE SATISFIED PRIOR TO THE ISSUE OF THE CONSTRUCTION CERTIFICATE

External finishes, materials and colours

Full details of external finishes, materials and colours are to be submitted to Council's Heritage Officer for approval prior to the issue of a Construction Certificate. Details demonstrating compliance with this condition are to be provided to the Principal Certifying Authority.

Reason: To ensure compatibility with the historical character of Palm Beach and the heritage context of the adjoining "Barrenjoey House".