

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2018/1669
To:	Benjamin Price
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot B DP 368451 , 21 Whistler Street MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS		
Discussion of reason for referral		
<p>The subject property, 21 Whistler Street, is not a listed heritage item nor is it located within a heritage conservation area.</p> <p>It is however located in the vicinity of a State heritage item, being Item I255 - Electricity substation No 15009 - 34A-36 Whistler Street. Additionally, the application was accompanied by a Heritage Impact Statement which assessed the significance of the site.</p>		
Details of heritage items affected		
<p>Details of the heritage item in the vicinity, as contained within the Heritage Inventory, are:</p> <p>Item I255 - Electricity substation No 15009 - 34A-36 Whistler Street</p> <p>Statement of Significance</p> <p>The Manly Zone substation is a fine and robust, well detailed face brick purpose designed and built structure. It is an excellent and externally intact representative example of the Interwar Art Deco style. It is considered to be a rare example of this style and of State Significance.</p> <p>Physical Description</p> <p>The Manly Zone substation is a fine and robust, well detailed face brick two storey building built on the street alignment. Stylistic elements of Interwar Art Deco include the extensive use of face brick and brick detailing in the stepped parapet and base of the projecting first floor oriel windows and the use of bold linear motifs. Decorative elements include the use of curved bricks to form unusual framing around windows and doorways. The building incorporates a residential unit titled #15101 RESIDENTIAL UNIT, 34a Whistler Street.</p> <p>The Manly Zone substation is constructed in load-bearing face brick with cement render applied to the plant doorway reveals. Original windows are double hung timber multi pane.</p> <p>Architectural style: Interwar Art Deco</p> <p>Exterior materials: Face brick, Timber Joinery, Steel Roller shutter.</p>		
Other relevant heritage listings		
Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	Comment if applicable
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	Yes	In the vicinity of a State heritage item
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th	No	

Century Buildings of Significance		
Other	No	
Consideration of Application		
<p>This application proposes demolition of all structures on site and the construction of a 5-storey shop top housing development. A Heritage Impact Statement was submitted with the DA which identified that the building had representative local heritage significance, but not enough to warrant heritage listing. The DA proposed photographic recording of the site prior to demolition and heritage interpretation as part of the new development.</p> <p>During Council's assessment of the DA, the building was identified as having potential heritage significance and independent heritage advice was sought from two heritage consultants. Full Circle Heritage carried out an initial independent heritage assessment in April 2019 and determined that the building potentially met the threshold for local heritage listing, but that further comparative research was required to substantiate this. Robertson & Hindmarsh was then engaged in June 2019 to provide further heritage advice and a comparative assessment report. This report concluded that the building on the site definitely met the criteria for local heritage listing, stating that it met four of the seven established listing criteria, being:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Criterion (a) Historical significance • Criterion (b) Associative significance • Criterion (c) Aesthetic/ Technical significance • Criterion (f) Rarity. <p>The existing building on site was considered significant due to its association with the first Mayor of Manly, Thomas Rowe and because the building formed part of the outbuilding complex of a large villa designed for his family that faced Belgrave Street. In addition to being the first Mayor of Manly, Thomas Rowe was one of the founders of the Institute of Architects. Very little survives of Rowe's body of work (between c 1868 and 1890) in Manly.</p> <p>This matter was reported to Council on 23 July 2019 and 24 September 2019, with a recommendation to place an Interim Heritage Order (IHO) over the property, to protect it from demolition during consideration of the statutory listing process. Council, at its meeting of 24 September 2019, resolved to place an Interim Heritage Order on the subject property, to protect it from harm for an initial period of 6 months, while further investigations are carried out and to enable Council to proceed with a statutory heritage listing, if appropriate, to protect the building from demolition.</p> <p>This Interim Heritage Order is due to be published in the Government Gazette on Friday 27 September 2019.</p> <p>As a result, this application cannot be supported on heritage grounds, as it proposes the demolition of a building which has been identified as being of heritage significance, meeting 4 of the 7 criteria for local heritage significance. Additionally, Council has resolved to protect this building from harm by the placing of an Interim Heritage Order on the site, to enable further investigation and possible heritage listing of the site.</p> <p>Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of MLEP2013</p> <p>Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? NO Has a CMP been provided? N/A Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? NO Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? N/A</p>		
Further Comments		

COMPLETED BY: Janine Formica, Heritage Planner

DATE: 26 September 2019

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

Nil.