

# Statement of Heritage Impact

Development Application,  
New Carport and Driveway

Hy Brasil,  
60 and 62 Chisholm Avenue, Avalon

for Ms Nada Herman  
Issue E, Development Application, 31 May 2022



No. 60 Chisholm Avenue viewed from below.

kate mountstephens  
architecture+heritage

91 Surrey Street Darlinghurst NSW 2010 Australia  
M 0408 960 924 E kate@mountstephens.com.au

## CONTENTS

1.0	INTRODUCTION	2
2.0	HERITAGE LISTINGS	2
3.0	HISTORIC BACKGROUND	2
4.0	ANALYSIS OF SIGNIFICANCE	3
5.0	SCOPE OF WORKS AND HERITAGE IMPACT	4
6.0	CONCLUSION	6
7.0	REFERENCES	6



Plate 1: View looking east along Chisholm Avenue. The driveway leading to Hy Brasil, at No. 62 Chisholm Avenue, is on the left. The proposed new driveway to No. 60 Chisholm Avenue would lead up from the far end of the parking space visible towards the bottom right of this image.



Plate 2: View of No. 60 Chisholm Avenue from the street, looking north-east. The proposed new carport would be nestled in behind the stairs. The stairs currently lead up to an existing landscaped path that runs up to Hy Brasil at No. 62 Chisholm Avenue. The landscaped path would be retained by the proposal but would be altered where it intersects with the new driveway.

## 1.0 INTRODUCTION

The proposal for Hy Brasil, 60 and 62 Chisholm Avenue is for the construction of a new carport, driveway and inclinator that will enable separate vehicular and pedestrian access to the house at No. 60 Chisholm Avenue. The proposal includes the removal of three trees.

This report should be read in conjunction with the following drawings by Andy Lehman Design, all dated May 2022:

- SK 00 Drawing Schedule and Palette of Materials
- SK 01 Site/Roof/Analysis Plan
- SK 02 Carparking Floor Plan
- SK 03 Street (South-East) Elevation
- SK 04 South-West Sectional Elevation
- SK 05 North-East Elevation
- SK 06 South-West Elevation
- SK 07 Driveway Section

A Pre DA meeting to discuss the proposal was held on 19 November 2020 (application number PLM2020/0268).

All images in this report were taken on 14 October 2020 by the author.

## 2.0 HERITAGE LISTINGS

The property is listed as an Item of Environmental Heritage in Schedule 5 of Pittwater Local Environmental Plan 2014 as follows:

*Hy Brasil (house)*, 60 and 62 Chisholm Avenue, Lots 1 and 2, DP 1104192, Item 2270157

It is also listed on the State Heritage Register as:

*Hy Brasil*, 62 Chisholm Road, Clareville, item number I546.

The State Heritage Register listing means that a Section 60 approval must be sought from Heritage NSW.

The property does not sit within a heritage conservation area.

## 3.0 HISTORIC BACKGROUND

The State Heritage Register Listing Card provides a brief historical background for the property. In summary:

- The land on which the property sits was part of a 1200 acre grant to John Joseph Therry on 31 August 1833,
- The grant was later subdivided and the subject site became Lot 8A of the Pittwater Estate subdivision,
- The land changed hands several times but was eventually purchased by Arthur Wilson in 1935. Arthur Wilson commissioned Alexander S. Jolly to design a weekend retreat on the site,
- The house was built in 1936 and was originally known as *The Gem*,





Plate 3: Street level parking space currently used by the residents of No. 60 Chisholm Avenue. The new driveway would curve up at the eastern (far) end of this parking space.



Plate 4: Existing driveway leading to Hy Brasil, No. 62 Chisholm Avenue.

- The site was sold in February 1949 to Rachel Jane Donaldson, who owned it until it was sold to Ted Herman in 1958. The name *Hi Brasil* was given to the property at this stage.
- *Hy Brasil* was nominated for a Permanent Conservation Order in 1980 by the Herman family. The order was transferred to the State Heritage Register in 1999.
- A new residence was built on the site approximately ten years ago and in 2012, a subdivision of the site, separating No. 60 Chisholm Avenue from No. 62, was approved.

#### 4.0 ANALYSIS OF SIGNIFICANCE

The State Heritage Inventory Listing Card for the property includes the following Statement of Significance, updated on 7 January 2015:

*Hy Brasil is of local and state-wide significance as one of three 'organic' houses designed by Alexander Stewart Jolly in Avalon. Hy Brasil with its simple construction of stone and timber and set in its native bushland setting represents Jolly's architecture and philosophy regarding the built form and its relationship to the natural Australian landscape (Heritage Office, 2007).*

*The house and its landscape are of high heritage significance. The listing includes the interiors of the house; however detailed analysis and assessment should be undertaken at the time of any future changes to the interior in order to ascertain the relative heritage significance.*

The State Heritage Register listing card, dated 29 October 2007, provides the following Statement of Significance:

*Hy Brasil is of State significance as one of three 'organic' houses designed by Alexander Stewart Jolly in Avalon. Hy Brasil with its simple construction of stone and timber and set in its native bushland setting represents Jolly's architecture and philosophy regarding the built form and its relationship to the natural Australian landscape.*

The Assessment of Significance included on the State Heritage Register listing card also includes the following notes against the assessment criteria:

##### *Historical Significance (SHR Criteria a)*

*Hy Brasil is of State significance as an excellent example of twentieth century 'organic' architecture and is one of three listed works by Alexander Stewart Jolly. The unique bushland setting of the building, large itie [sic] and stone terracing form an integral part of the design philosophy. This distinctive style influenced the later 'Sydney School' architectural movement of the mid sixties.*

##### *Aesthetic Significance (SHR Criteria c)*

*The ridge-top siting of Hy Brasil is prominent from the surrounding area and takes advantage of superb panoramic views of the Pacific Ocean and Pittwater. Native bushland has been retained and enhanced by the well chosen exotic ornamental planting to provide a setting which complements the natural qualities of the house.*



Plate 5: View looking west along Chisholm Avenue. The garage building sits at the base of No. 52 Chisholm Avenue and the boundary of No. 52 and No. 60 sits just beyond the building. This garage has a substantial impact on the surrounding bushland setting.

## 5.0 SCOPE OF WORK AND HERITAGE IMPACT

### 5.1 SCOPE OF WORK

The proposal is for a new driveway and carport at the southern end of the site (Lot 2 of DP 1104192), close to Chisholm Avenue and approximately 3.5 metres above street level.

The site of No 60 Chisholm Avenue currently has no parking area and the owners use the street level parking space below the house at No. 62 (see Plate 3).

The proposed carport would sit at the south-eastern corner of the site, well below the existing dwelling and at the furthest possible distance from *Hy Brasil* (Lot 1 of DP 1104192) itself. The steepness of the site and the thick cover of vegetation mean that it is not possible to see *Hy Brasil* from the street (see Plates 4, 5, 6 and 7).

The driveway and carport have been located to fit between and around the existing major rock forms at the base of the site. The base of the driveway would curve up at the eastern end of the existing parking space at street level (see Plate 3).

The apparent height of the building has been minimised by setting it into the slope of the site at the rear and giving it a flat roof profile. The overall building form therefore allows the landscape to remain dominant in the overall setting of the house.

### 5.2 HERITAGE IMPACTS

The letter of heritage support for the proposal, prepared by the writer to accompany the pre DA application, concluded that the proposal would not have any negative impact on the heritage significance of the residence named *Hy Brasil*. The heritage comments included in the Pre-lodgement Meeting Notes concurred, stating that *the proposal is very unlikely to impact upon Hy Brasil itself*.

As outlined above, however, the bushland setting of *Hy Brasil* is considered to be an integral part of the aesthetic and historical significance of the property. In addition, the heritage comments from the Pre-lodgement meeting state that *the proposal will have an impact upon the bushland setting. This setting forms part of the listing and its curtilage so this impact must be considered and evaluated*.

The heritage comments also included the following dot points for consideration:

- *The new boundary between 60 and 62 and how different owners may respond. A simple conservation strategy or policy regarding the boundary may assist in this regards.*
- *Lowering the level of the carport to minimise visual impacts or details as to why this is not feasible or has a negative heritage impact.*



Plate 6: View looking west along Chisholm Avenue, just to the east of No. 52 Chisholm Avenue.



Plate 7: View looking west along Chisholm Avenue, just below the site of No. 60.

- *Dark and earthy colours for external walls and roofs as well as lightweight materials to assist with minimising the visual appearance of the carport.*

- *Rough cut/hewn style sandstone retaining walls along the new driveway similar to those in the existing turn around zone.*

#### Boundary

The change to the boundary, which was included in the drawings submitted at pre-DA stage, has now been deleted. A new easement for access is now proposed instead.

#### Carport Level

The level of the carport has been carefully considered in relation to the topography and setting of the particular part of the site for which it is proposed. The proposed new carport has also been sited to fit between the existing rock formations.

It was considered important that the site be excavated enough to achieve an appropriate fall along the length of the driveway but not so much that it would have an undue impact on the form of the site at this point.

It is proposed that excavation be undertaken along the length of the driveway and at the back (uphill) side of the carport. In the initial scheme presented at the pre-DA meeting, the drawings showed that a 1.5m excavation (at the highest point) was required to form the driveway and an approximately 2.1m excavation was required at the back of the carport.

Subsequent to the the pre-DA meeting, the fall of the driveway was considered in more detail and the driveway slope was reduced. This was achieved by lowering the level of the carport floor to 600mm below the level shown in the pre-DA drawings. The amount of excavation required along the driveway and at the rear of the carport was correspondingly increased. This driveway configuration was included in the DA previously submitted.

The original DA was withdrawn and the current DA drawings prepared. These drawings include a driveway with a curved end at street level. This layout allows the driveway to be entered from either direction from the street and it resulted in a further lowering of the carport level. The carport now sits approximately 1.5 metres lower than in the original DA, and approximately 3.5 metres above street level. While it is considered that the carport at its original level had been sensitively sited, this lowering results in an even better result from a heritage impact perspective, reducing the impact of the carport in its setting even further.

#### Colours, Materials and Sandstone

The design of the carport is simple and contemporary. The materials selected for the building – washed concrete, dark painted fibre cement cladding and dark metal roof sheeting – would be recessive within the landscape as well as complementing the design of the existing building above.

The open-sided nature of the carport means that views through and around the structure will be possible, reducing its visual impact in the setting. A steel mesh and timber balustrade is proposed only where necessary along





Plate 8: The landscaped path leading from the street to Hy Brasil will be retained by the proposal. This view is taken looking east, towards No. 60 Chisholm Avenue.

the side of the vehicle turning area. The visually permeable nature of the balustrade design will minimise its impact in the setting, allowing the landscape behind to be seen.

The sandstone wall facing proposed along the uphill side of the driveway and at the rear of the carport will be rough-hewn and 'random coursed' with the individual pieces of stone irregularly-sized. The appearance will be similar to that of the existing retaining wall behind the street level parking space (refer to Plate 3). While the new sandstone will initially be lighter in colour than the existing stone, it will grey naturally over time to match the colour of the existing stone on site.

#### Landscape

A landscape architect has been engaged to prepare a planting plan that recreates the endemic bushland setting in the areas where it will be altered by the construction.

Four trees are proposed to be removed to allow for the construction of the carport and driveway. These trees will be replaced with new trees of a species endemic to the site.

The design also retains the existing stair and much of the landscaped pedestrian path that connects Hy Brasil to the street (see Plates 2 and 8). The path will only be altered where necessary at its intersection with the new driveway.

## 6.0 CONCLUSION

It is not considered that the proposal would have any negative impact on the heritage significance of *Hy Brasil* itself.

The carefully considered location and design for the proposed new carport building mean that the level of impact on the heritage significance of the landscape setting would be minimal.

Overall it is considered that the proposal is acceptable in terms of its impact on the heritage significance of Hy Brasil and its surrounding site.

## 7.0 REFERENCES

- State Heritage Register Listing Card, *Hy Brasil*, listing number 00079, 2 April 1999 (updated 29 October 2007)

<https://apps.environment.nsw.gov.au/dpcheritageapp/ViewHeritageItemDetails.aspx?ID=5045021>

- State Heritage Inventory Listing Card, *Hy Brasil*, listing number 2270157, (gazetted 15 August 2014)

<https://apps.environment.nsw.gov.au/dpcheritageapp/ViewHeritageItemDetails.aspx?ID=2270157>

- Pittwater Local Environmental Plan 2014