

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2021/0119
Date:	08/03/2021
To:	Catriona Shirley
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 51 DP 1237990 , 1 West Promenade MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
<p>The proposal has been referred to Heritage as the subject property is a heritage item, and is within proximity to a number of others.</p> <p>I156 - Auckland Garage - Gilbert St (corner West Promenade and Gilbert Street)</p> <p>I2 - Stone Kerbs - (Eastern side of West Promenade adjoining Gilbert Park)</p> <p>I157 - Gilbert Park</p> <p>I252 - Residential flat buildings (3, 5, 6, 7 and 8 West Promenade)</p>
Details of heritage items affected
<p>Details of the item as contained within the Manly inventory is as follows:</p> <p>Auckland Garage <u>Statement of significance:</u> A well preserved and rare example of a petrol service station in the Inter War Spanish Mission style dating from the 1930s.</p> <p><u>Physical description:</u> Single storey rectangular building in Inter War Spanish Mission style with roofed forecourt and garage attached at the rear. Gabled tiled roof with slightly off centre gabled bay to the façade., brick walls with white painted stucco. The building is set at a diagonal to the two streets, the forecourt forming a triangle at the street corner. The gabled bay to the façade and the end walls feature stepping brickwork, windows and doors have semi-circular fanlights, and windows are 12-paned timber framed double hung.</p> <p>Stone Kerbs Statement of significance: Stone kerbs are heritage listed.</p> <p>Physical description: Sandstone kerbing to streets relating to paving and kerbing of streets in the nineteenth century. Mostly located within Manly Village area and adjacent lower slopes of Eastern Hill and Fairlight.</p> <p>Gilbert Park <u>Statement of significance:</u> High significance as part of HG Simth's 1850's promenade system and integral with Manly's first planting.</p>

Physical description:

Open space bounded by Belgrave Street, West Promenade leading from Gilbert Street to Sydney Road and Ivanhoe Park. Significant elements are mature trees; Araucaria Heterophylla and Ficus Macrophylla probably dating from the mid 19th century and Edwardian split stone edged raised planting beds.

Residential Flat Buildings

Statement of significance:

Significance in terms of building mass and scale but major significance as a backdrop to Gilbert Park.

Physical description:

Streetscape consists of five three storey blocks of brick flats with tile roofs and the Manly Uniting Church (no.4). The flats have a variety of decorative devices but show many signs of Spanish Mission influence. No.6 provides a good example of polychrome brickwork used as ornament. While none of the buildings have particular architectural significance, their scale, style and grouping opposite Gilbert Park has great influence on the streetscape and as a group of similar date (c.1920-c.1930) they provide evidence of Manly's early 20th century development boom.

Other relevant heritage listings

Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register		
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	N/A	

Consideration of Application

The proposal seeks consent for new sail clothes attached to the heritage listed former garage and service station. The heritage item was retained and adaptively reused as part of the Manly Civic Club redevelopment project approved under DA0176/2016. As part of that approval a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) was prepared by NBRS + Partners in 2017 to guide the ongoing management of the heritage item. Therefore any consideration of this proposal needs to also consider that CMP.

In brief the most important parts of the CMP in relation to this proposal are listed below.

- On page 59, the statement of cultural heritage significance indicates the building has landmark significance due to its corner location adjacent Gilbert Park and has a visual relationship through to the forecourt of Manly Town Hall.
- Pages 60 and 61 of the CMP detail the heritage significance grading undertaken which indicates the front walls, windows and porte-cochere are of high significance. It also indicates the north eastern and southern western walls are of high significance except for the intrusive doorway openings.
- On page 67 under recommendation 16, the plan indicates that future uses should expose original fabric to view and remove intrusive elements.

- On page 68 under Views and Settings, recommendations 31 and 32 detail that views to the front and side of buildings along Gilbert Street and West Promenade should be retained, as well as views to the place from the southern forecourt of Manly Town Hall.

Based on the above recommendations from the CMP, Heritage cannot support the proposal. The proposed awnings along the front (awnings B1, B2 and B3) are considered to detract from the building and its significance and will interrupt views to the item as well as its significant features. As noted within the CMP, the building has landmark status and can be seen from the forecourt outside Manly Town Hall as well as the intersection of Belgrave Street and Gilbert Street. The proposed awnings along the front will obscure the view of the item and its high significance features which would diminish its landmark status. Heritage disagrees with the HIS where it states the proposal would not alter an understanding of the architectural character of the item.

Further, these awnings would be considered to run counter to Objective 1 under the Manly DCP section 3.2 Heritage Considerations to conserve significant heritage items including views. It would also run counter to control 3.2.1.1 (c) (iv) to retain and respect significant views to and from heritage items.

Conversely, Heritage can on balance support awnings A1 and C1. These sides of the building are considered more appropriate places for the awnings as views to and from these sides are less significant, these side walls have less detailing and the awnings would mostly obscure views of the intrusive doorway openings.

Heritage considers there would be no impact to the heritage listed apartment buildings on West Promenade, the stone kerbs or Gilbert Park from the proposal.

Based on the above, Heritage recommends amended plans to remove awnings B1, B2 and B3.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of MLEP.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? A CMP was provided with the previous development on the site - DA0176/2016

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes a statement from NBRS + Partners has been provided.

Further Comments

COMPLETED BY: Brendan Gavin, Principal Planner

DATE: 8 March 2021

The proposal is therefore unsupported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

Nil.