

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2023/0998
Proposed Development:	Alterations and additions to a Community Facility. Crown land - Part Lot 2797 DP820312, Lot 1 DP909023 & Lots 21 to 23 Section 2 DP975183 - Part Reserves D500403 and R64997 for Public Recreation - Freshwater Surf Life Saving Club
Date:	30/01/2025
To:	Maxwell Duncan
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 1 DP 909023 , 9999 The Esplanade FRESHWATER NSW 2096

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS		
Discussion of reason for referral		
The proposal has been referred to Heritage as it involves works to a heritage item		
I66 - Freshwater Surf Life Saving Club		
Details of heritage items affected		
<p><u>Statement of Significance</u></p> <p>A building of strong social significance which continued on from earlier clubhouses in this location. Historically evidence of the development of popular beach culture in the inter-war years. Good example of inter-war mediterranean style of architecture.</p> <p><u>Physical Description</u></p> <p>Two storey cement rendered building on rear dunes of beach. Hipped tiled roof, with gable at top. Observation tower with hipped tiled roof. Arched & square headed openings.</p>		
Other relevant heritage listings		
SEPP (Biodiversity and Conservation) 2021	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register		
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance		
Other	N/A	
Consideration of Application		
The proposal seeks consent for works to the surf club. This includes the substantial reworking and extension to the rear 1986 portion as well as the removal of the 2006 Heritage Room and its replacement with the new entry and 'Museum of Surf'. Proposed works to the 1935 section include a balcony extension towards the ocean with a new awning and a new members deck to the south,		

removal of a staircase at ground level, removal of internal walls at the first level, and the reinstatement of the western elevation including windows and doors based on photographic evidence. Other works include the removal of the concrete roof tiles and their replacement with terracotta Marseille pattern tiles and external painting based on paint scraping works.

Heritage is unable to support the proposal due to the components that negatively affect the building and its significance which will be detailed below. The proposed eastern balcony extension including the metal railings and awning at the eastern elevation is a poor approach that will interrupt the original form and design of the building. The conclusions in the HIS that these works are supportable is not agreed with. These works must be removed from the plans. Additionally the metal railings to the members terrace will need to be amended to timber.

The proposed 'Museum of Surf' join between the retained section and rebuilt rear section will also need to be amended to reduce the bulk and scale of this component and its negative impact upon the retained heritage section. It will need to have its height lowered as well as its southern and northern extents where it sits out over the roof line of the retained section pulled back. The proposed glazing line to the northern and southern verandahs at the second floor will also need to be amended to step back in away from the corners of the retained section showing a clearer break between the old and new. The columns will also need to be amended to be internal.

The timber cladding around the new rear section appears to sit out beyond the building's wall. It should be amended to be flush to the wall to reduce the impact of the width of the building and its negative impact upon the retained heritage section.

The proposal is also silent on the treatment to the new Freshwater Room and members lounge ceiling noting that the wall currently separating the room and the office to be removed upon which its braces sit. The current acoustic tiles are an incongruous element and no consideration or information has been provided about the reinstatement of a more traditional ceiling, or if the original ceiling is in place behind the tiles. Given the substantial works proposed this is an opportune time to resolve this element with a more sensitive and respectful approach.

Additionally the documents are silent on how impacts to the heritage components are to be managed during construction, including the removal of the roof and pile driving.

Heritage will note that it does support some elements of the proposal, including the reinstatement of the western wall of the 1935 component and the replacement of the roof tiles.

Given the above, Heritage is unable to support the proposal as it is not considered to appropriately address the heritage item or its significance.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of WLEP.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? A conservation management strategy will be required for this building

Has a CMP been provided? A CMS has not been provided

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? A HIS has been provided but its conclusions are not supported.

Updated Heritage Comments 30 January 2025

Updated plans and details have been submitted by the applicant. The majority of heritage's concerns with the proposal have now been addressed with these amended plans. This includes the

removal of the balcony extension at the eastern beach elevation of the retained 1935 clubhouse, reduction in the overall height of the new works to the western rear so they sit below the ridgeline of the retained 1935 section, and changes to some materials and designs such as the new members deck area to the southern side. Heritage maintains some concerns with the design of the proposal such as the extent of the screens to the north and south verandahs and lack of details regarding the internal treatment of the proposed enlarged Freshwater Room but these can be addressed via conditions. Additionally impacts of demolition and construction works can be conditioned via the appointment of a heritage architect for the project, preparation of a temporary protection plan and then a conservation management plan for the ongoing management of the building post construction works.

Therefore Heritage can now support the proposal subject to conditions.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of WLEP.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? A conservation management strategy will be conditioned

Has a CMP been provided? A CMP will be conditioned.

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? A HIS has been provided but not updated for the amended plans.

Additional conditions to be added for prior to Construction Certificate include

Schedule of External Materials and Colours

An updated full schedule of external materials and colours are to be provided to Council's Heritage Officer for approval prior to the issuing of a Construction Certificate. This must include details of all materials and colours to the 1935 clubhouse building.

Details demonstrating Compliance with this condition are to be submitted to the Principal Certifying Authority.

Reason: To ensure external materials and colours are appropriate for the heritage item

Photographic Archival Recording

A photographic archival record of the site is to be made of all existing buildings and structures associated with the surf club (including interiors and exteriors and their immediate setting), generally in accordance with the guidelines issued by Heritage NSW (Photographic Recording of Heritage Items Using Film or Digital Capture, 2006). This recording including a digital copy and 1 physical copy must be submitted to Council's Heritage Officer for approval prior to the issuing of the Construction Certificate. 1 physical copy of the archival recording once approved must also be provided to Council's Local Studies at Dee Why Library.

The photographic record should be made using digital technology, and must include:

- Location of property, date of survey and author of survey;
- A site plan at a scale of 1:200 showing all structures and major landscape elements;
- Floor plans of any buildings at a scale of 1:100;
- Photographs which document the site, cross-referenced in accordance with recognised archival recording practice to catalogue sheets.
- Photos of each elevation, interior room, significant features and moveable heritage.
- Physical copies must be submitted on archival quality paper

Details demonstrating compliance with this condition must be provided to the Principal Certifying Authority.

Reason: To provide an archival photographic record of the site, including any buildings and landscape elements, prior to any works.

Amended Plans

Amended plans are to be submitted to Council's Heritage Officer for approval prior to the issuing of the Construction Certificate.

These amended plans must include

- Updated details of the proposed North and South Verandahs showing a reduction in the extent of the battens/sun shades.
- Details of the internal design of the proposed enlarged Freshwater Room, including elevations, floor and ceiling plans.

Details demonstrating compliance with this condition are to be submitted to the Principal Certifying Authority.

Reason: Protection of significant views and internal spaces.

Conservation Management Plan

A Conservation Management Plan is to be prepared for the site by a suitably qualified and experienced built heritage specialist in accordance with Heritage NSW Guidelines (including but not limited to Statement of best practice for conservation management plans and Guidance on developing a conservation management plan). The plan must be submitted to Council's Heritage Officer for approval prior to the issuing of the Construction Certificate. The plan must include:

- The history of the site and building.
- The heritage significance of the site and building, including its interior and exterior fabric with significance grading.
- Policies for the ongoing management, maintenance and protection of the heritage item and its significance.
- Policies for the ongoing management, maintenance and protection of moveable heritage and their significance.
- An updated statement of significance.

Details of compliance with this condition are to be submitted to the Principal Certifying Authority.

Reason: Protection of heritage significance and ongoing maintenance of the heritage item

Additional condition to be added for During Works

Unexpected Finds – Non Indigenous Archaeology

As required by the Heritage Act 1977, in the event that historical cultural fabric or deposits are encountered/discovered where they are not expected, works must cease immediately and Council and Heritage NSW must be notified of the discovery.

In the event that archaeological resources are encountered, further archaeological work may be required before works can re-commence, including any the statutory requirements under the Heritage Act 1977.

Note: The Heritage Act 1977 impose substantial penalty infringements and / or imprisonment for the unauthorised destruction of archaeological resources, regardless of whether or not such archaeological resources are known to exist on the site.

Reason: Statutory requirements for the protection of archaeology

The proposal is therefore supported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

CONDITIONS TO BE SATISFIED PRIOR TO THE ISSUE OF THE CONSTRUCTION CERTIFICATE

Heritage Architect

A suitably qualified and experienced heritage architect must be appointed for this project. Details of the appointment of this heritage architect are to be submitted to Council's Heritage Officer for approval, prior to the issue of a Construction Certificate.

Details demonstrating compliance with this condition are to be provided to the Principal Certifying Authority.

Reason: To ensure that all matters relating to significant fabric and spaces are guided by heritage conservation best practice.

Temporary Protection Plan

A Temporary Protection Plan including a statement of significance with documentary and physical evidence on the existing situation and original fabric of the heritage items and requirements and measures to retain necessary to retain the significance of the item should be prepared by a suitably qualified heritage architect to ensure all retained original fabric of the 1935 clubhouse is protected during works and to guide the protection of the surrounding heritage fabric during construction works. The Temporary Protection Plan is to be submitted to Council's Heritage Officer for approval prior to the issuing of the Construction Certificate.

Details demonstrating compliance with this condition are to be submitted to the Principal Certifying Authority

Reason: To ensure the protection and retention of significant heritage fabric and the significance of the heritage item.

CONDITIONS THAT MUST BE ADDRESSED PRIOR TO ANY COMMENCEMENT

Heritage Induction

Prior to the commencement of any works, all contractors, trades persons and the like shall be given a site induction. This induction must be delivered by the appointed Heritage Architect and shall ensure that all contractors, trade persons and the like are made aware that:

- The site is a heritage item
- There is a Temporary Protection Plan and Conservation Management Plan for the site to retain and protect heritage significance fabric and heritage significance
- There are statutory obligations under the *National Parks and Wildlife Act 1974* and *Heritage Act 1977* for all works to cease and Council and Heritage NSW to be notified of any unexpected built archaeological or Aboriginal archaeological finds during works.

Reason: To ensure all persons undertaking works on the site are aware of the heritage items and obligations

CONDITIONS TO BE COMPLIED WITH DURING DEMOLITION AND BUILDING WORK

Implementation of Temporary Protection Plan

The approved Temporary Protection Plan is to be adhered to during demolition and construction works. The appointed Heritage Architect will be responsible for ensuring that the Temporary Protection Plan is to adhered to.

Details demonstrating compliance with this condition are to be submitted to the Principal Certifying Authority

Reason: To ensure the protection and retention of significant heritage fabric and the significance of the heritage item.

Heritage Architect during works

The nominated heritage architect is to be involved in the resolution of all matters where existing significant fabric and spaces are to be subject to preservation, restoration, reconstruction, adaptive reuse, recording, demolition and excavation. The heritage consultant is to be provided with full access to the site and authorised by the applicant to respond directly to Council where information or clarification is required regarding the resolution of heritage issues throughout the project. The heritage architect are also to ensure that the policies outlined in the Temporary Protection Plan and Conservation Management Plan are adhered to.

Details demonstrating compliance with this condition must be provided to the Principal Certifying Authority.

Reason: To ensure that all matters relating to significant fabric and spaces are guided by heritage conservation best practice.

ON-GOING CONDITIONS THAT MUST BE COMPLIED WITH AT ALL TIMES

Implementation of Conservation Management Plan

The approved Conservation Management Plan is to be adhered to over the life of the development. This includes policies and guidance for:

- The protection and ongoing maintenance for the building and significant fabric
- Moveable heritage, and

- Any interpretation elements