

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2021/2257
Date:	15/02/2022
To:	Maxwell Duncan
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 100 DP 1069144 , 75 The Corso MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 101 DP 1069144 , 75 The Corso MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 102 DP 1069144 , 75 The Corso MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 1 DP 1034722 , 42 North Steyne MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
<p>The proposal has been referred to Heritage as part of the subject site is a heritage item, being Item I111 - Hotel Steyne at 75 The Corso and is located within the Manly Town Centre Conservation Area under Schedule 5 of Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013. The subject site is also within the Foreshore Scenic Protection Area and in the vicinity of the following heritage items:</p> <p>Item I74 – Beach Reserve—Merrett Park North Steyne and South Steyne</p> <p>Item I68 – Ocean foreshores - Manly municipal area, boundary adjacent to the ocean</p> <p>Item I110 - New Brighton Hotel - 69–71 The Corso</p>
Details of heritage items affected
<p>Details of the heritage items as contained within the Manly Heritage inventory are as follows:</p> <p>C2 - Town Centre Conservation Area <u>Statement of Significance:</u> The Manly Town Centre Conservation Area (TCCA) is of local heritage significance as a reflection of the early development of Manly as a peripheral harbor and beachside village in the fledgling colony of New South Wales. This significance is enhanced by its role as a day-trip and holiday destination during those early years, continuing up to the present time, and its association with H G Smith, the original designer and developer of the TCCA as it is today. The physical elements of the TCCA reflect this early development and its continued use for recreational purposes, most notably the intact promenade quality of The Corso and its turn of the century streetscape, as well as key built elements such as hotels, and remaining original commercial and small scale residential buildings. The beautiful natural setting of the TCCA has provided a solid foundation for its picturesque qualities. The cultural landscape, including plantings, monuments and open spaces, reflects the continued enhancement of the TCCA over time, in order to attract and sustain visitors to the area, which in turn has provided great support to the local economy. The many historic vistas which remain to this day enhance the visitor experience of the TCCA and assist with providing an interpretation of the TCCA as it has changed over time.</p> <p>The TCCA maintains a high level of social significance, as a popular destination for local, national and international tourists, as well as through its encapsulation of the Australian beach culture.</p> <p><u>Physical description:</u> The Manly TCCA has a mixed character and comprises three key zones.</p>

Significant vistas adjacent to the boundary of the Manly TCCA include:

- Vistas north east and south west along Victoria Parade from Darley Road. Despite various unsympathetic infill developments along Victoria Parade, the wide boulevard style street width, the street plantings and medium scale residential buildings reminiscent of historical use primarily as holiday accommodation, all add to the significance of the precinct.
- Vistas north and south along North and South Steyne from the north eastern end of The Corso;
- Vista south along Belgrave Street towards Manly Wharf;
- Vista north along Belgrave Street from Manly Wharf;
- Vista north west along West Esplanade.

Cultural plantings and landscaping elements also make an important contribution to the significance of the Manly Town Centre Conservation Area.

Item I111 - Hotel Steyne

Statement of significance:

This building is a fine example of Inter-War Art Deco style Hotel. Landmark building on the corner of The Corso and South Steyne.

Physical description:

Original Hotel built 1862 and rebuilt in 1936 in Inter-war Art Deco Style of polychrome brickwork with heavy brick modelling along parapet and corrugated asbestos roof. Significant elements include: fan shaped lintels to windows; tile and brick detailing beneath windows; original tiling to ground floor, octagonal corner 'tower'.

Item I174 - Beach Reserve

Statement of significance:

High significance as natural sand beach and cultural backdrop of paved promenade and first coastal plantings of Norfolk Island Pines.

Physical description:

Beachfront, promenade, sandstone retaining wall, paved, grassed And/or planting beds and remnant plantings of Norfolk Island Pines planted from the 1850's to the 1880's.

Item I110 - New Brighton Hotel

Statement of significance:

This building is an example of exotic Egyptian-like motifs and Inter-war Free Classical style. The hotel is of major significance due to its contribution to the streetscape, its visual/textural interest and its association with early 20th century development of the resort. The building is an important feature on the corner of Sydney Rd and the Corso and its eclectic design contributes to the rich collection of architectural styles in the streetscape of the Corso.

Other relevant heritage listings

Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	

Other	N/A	
Consideration of Application		
<p>The proposal seeks consent for the demolition of the heritage listed building at 41 North Steyne, partial demolition of the existing building at 42 North Steyne and the construction of a five storey shop-top housing development. The proposal has been presented to Council on a number of occasions, including two Pre-lodgement Meetings and two Design + Sustainability Advisory Panel Meetings. The current proposal is very similar to the latest prelodgement application (PLM2021/0235 - amended drawings dated 18 October 2021) with minor changes to the internal layout. Therefore, Heritage's comments, for the current proposal, are very similar to the comments provided for the PLM2021/0235.</p> <p>41 North Steyne</p> <p>The submitted Conservation Management Plan (by Architectural Projects - October 2019 - p16) states that <i>"This building is not heritage listed and is outside the Manly Town Centre Heritage Conservation Area"</i>. However, 41 North Steyne is located on the same lot with Hotel Steyne - Item I111 and is part of the heritage listing, listed in Schedule 5 of Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013. It is also located within the Manly Town Centre Heritage Conservation Area. As noted in the Design + Sustainability Advisory Panel Meeting, held on 16 December 2021: <i>"As previously noted No 41 is not only on the same site is it functionally integral to the hotel and has been since its construction."</i></p> <p>The existing building represents a three storey commercial building from the early twentieth century, built in 1910. Although, the building has been modified in time, it still is very intact and demonstrates a cohesive character with the character and significance of Manly Town Centre Conservation Area and The Corso, and it contributes to the historic character of the existing streetscape. The proposed demolition of the existing building at 41 North Steyne is not supported by Heritage as Council promotes the retention and adaptation of existing buildings rather than demolition and replacement with new structures. Therefore, Heritage recommends the retention of the existing façade and the adaptation of this Federation era building rather than its demolition.</p> <p>42 North Steyne</p> <p>42 North Steyne is not heritage listed and sits outside the conservation area. However, it adjoins both and thus considerations should be given to the context and the final appearance of the building in terms of its relationship with the adjacent heritage item and the character and significance of the existing streetscape as to not negatively impact on the heritage items and the conservation area. The proposal is not considered to respect or relate to the scale and massing of the existing buildings and structures in this historic context. It is noted in the prelodgement meeting that the proposed facade should seek to provide an appropriate transition between the heritage building to the south and the adjoining development to the north, to improve the quality of the response to the existing historic context.</p> <p>Scale, built form and articulation</p> <p>From a heritage perspective, any new design should respond to its historic context through an understanding and informed analysis of its character and quality. However, the proposal significantly exceeds the height limit especially at the street frontage to North Steyne facade and does not maintain the existing front building alignment and the existing building envelope by removing the horizontal articulation (setbacks to the upper levels) that exists in the existing facade and also by proposing a new awning to the street frontage. The overall mass and scale of the proposal significantly dominates and overwhelms the adjacent heritage item and the streetscape. Therefore, overall visual impact of the proposal, in its current form, is considered not satisfy the principles of the conservation area of <i>Manly Development Control Plan 2013 - Part 5.1 Manly Town Centre Heritage Conservation Area: "Manly Town Centre has a cohesive character resulting from a generally low scale of development on its principle streets. Construction to the property boundaries, slightly higher</i></p>		

and distinctive corner buildings and a good level of pedestrian protection and amenity generated by footpath awnings and through-block arcades has produced strongly defined and comfortable urban spaces. These spaces range from the tight enclosure of the arcades through to the openness of the Ocean Beach promenade and the Esplanade. Developments which contradict these features have not been sufficient to remove this character."

Conclusion

Heritage cannot support the proposal in its current form as it involves the demolition of the heritage listed building at 41 North Steyne and the proposed bulk and scale adversely impacts both the adjacent heritage item - Hotel Steyne and Manly Town Centre Conservation Area. The existing façade of 41 North Steyne should be retained as it provides a much better transition between the historic context of The Corso and Hotel Steyne to the south and the adjoining developments to the north of the subject site. Setbacks to upper levels can help to provide a transition between adjacent buildings and to demonstrate a respect to the character of the area. The overall mass and scale of the proposal should recognise the predominant scale of the existing streetscape and respond sympathetically to the character of the area, to improve the quality of the response to the existing historic context.

Therefore, heritage can not support the proposal in its current form.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of Manly LEP 2013.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

Further Comments

COMPLETED BY: Oya Guner, Heritage Advisor

DATE: 15 February 2022

The proposal is therefore unsupported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

Nil.