

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2019/0849
To:	Benjamin Price
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 1 DP 965161 , 9 Denison Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 1 DP 965161 , 11 Denison Street MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
<p>This application has been forwarded for heritage comment as the site is located within the Pittwater Road Conservation Area, listed in Schedule 5 of Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013.</p> <p>The site is also located in the vicinity of a listed heritage item, being: Item I254 - St Mary's Church, Presbytery and School - Whistler St (corner Raglan Street), Manly</p> <p>Comments were previously made on this application on 20 September 2019 by Council's Heritage Advisor and the application has now been referred for further heritage comment.</p>
Details of heritage items affected
<p>Details of the item as contained within the Pittwater heritage inventory:</p> <p>Pittwater Road Conservation Area: <u>Statement of significance:</u> This street pattern is distinctive and underpins the urban character of the area. The streets remain unaltered in their alignment, although the names of Malvern, Pine and North Steyne are now names for what were Whistler, Middle Harbour and East Steyne respectively.</p> <p><u>Physical description:</u> The streetscape provides a 19th century atmosphere due to it's scale, width and the number of extant Victorian structures. Within the streetscape there are a number of individually significant buildings which are listed separately. Adjacent streets generally comprise a consistent pattern of one and two story residential cottages, with the occasional terrace. Some streets have intermittent street plantings and remnant stone kerbs. The flat topography is accentuated by the escarpment to the west which provides an important visual, vertical and vegetated backdrop.</p> <p>Item I254 - St Mary's Church, Presbytery and School: <u>Statement of significance:</u> The listing covers a significant group of five religious and school buildings dating from circa 1890 to the 1950s, complementary in style. The group is of significance for Manly area for its historical, aesthetic and social reasons, and for the rarity and representativeness. The site has a long and ongoing spiritual association with the local Roman Catholic community since c.1890 when the church building was created. The site is a major landmark visible from a distance from both Raglan Street and Whistler Street.</p> <p><u>Physical description:</u> A group of five buildings, two to three storeys in height, one sandstone and four brick, on a large site with boundaries to Whistler Street, Raglan Street, and Denison Street. The boundary is defined by a</p>

low dark brick c.1930's wall.

Other relevant heritage listings

Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	No	

Consideration of Application

Pittwater Road Conservation Area is generally characterised by a consistent pattern of 1 and 2 storey residential cottages, with the occasional terrace. Almost all buildings in the conservation area were extant at 1933 including small terraces of houses, single detached houses, small apartment buildings and shops. Many single storey cottages have upper level additions, some appropriately recessive but some intrusive, being too close to the street. The site is in the Pittwater Road Conservation Area, part of a group terrace houses at 9-13 Denison Street and is on a highly visible corner location. It is also in the close proximity of Presbytery across Whistler Street. This application has been reviewed, along with the plans and other documentation and the site has been visited to view the context. The application has also been assessed in relation to relevant heritage provisions contained within the Manly Development Control Plan (DCP) 2013.

It is considered that the application is inconsistent with the Heritage Objectives 1, 2 and 3, outlined in Section **3.2 Heritage Considerations** of Manly DCP 2013 as detailed below:

Objective 1) To retain and conserve environmental heritage and cultural significance of Manly including:

- *significant fabric, setting, relics and view associated with heritage items and conservation areas;*
- *the foreshore, including its setting and associated views; and*
- *potential archaeological sites, places of Aboriginal significance and places of natural significance.*

Comment: The proposal does not affect the fabric at the front of the original terrace but it proposes significant changes to the fabric at the rear as it proposes demolishing the complete rear section of the dwelling including the existing chimneys. It is considered that the design of the first floor addition is not appropriate and will have a negative impact upon the heritage significance of the Pittwater Road Conservation Area.

Objective 2) To ensure any modification to heritage items, potential heritage items or buildings within conservation areas is of an appropriate design that does not adversely impact on the significance of the item or the locality.

Comment: It is considered that the design of the new first floor addition, is not recessive and, in its current form, is considered to have an adverse impact upon the view of the dwelling in the context of the Pittwater Road Conservation Area and the 1930's single level terraces.

Objective 3) To ensure that development in the vicinity of heritage items, potential heritage item and/or conservation areas, is of an appropriate form and design so as not to detract from the significance of those items.

Comment: Given the exposure and visibility of the corner location with a long street frontage facing Whistler Street across the heritage item - Presbytery, this rear addition will be highly visible and therefore will be affecting the visual curtilage of the Pittwater Road Heritage Conservation Area.

It is also considered that the application is inconsistent with Section **3.2.2 Alterations or Additions to Heritage Items or Conservation Areas** of Manly DCP 2013, as detailed below:

3.2.2.1. Complementary Form and Scale that Distinguishes Heritage Significance

- a) Alterations or additions to heritage items or buildings within a conservation area will not necessarily seek to replicate, overwhelm, dominate or challenge heritage details or character of the building or structure of heritage significant buildings. However, a contemporary response which complements and respects the form and scale of the original buildings may be considered if the heritage significance is retained.*
- b) Consideration should be given to whether making a house bigger will ruin its appearance. Additions to small houses can easily overwhelm them and use up garden space needed for private open space and impact the setting and pattern of development in the locality. **Modest additions work best** and can be organised as wings or pavilions to the existing house. All additions must be at the back of the house, not the front.*

As outlined above this section requires that any alterations or additions to buildings within a conservation area do not overwhelm, dominate or challenge the heritage details or character of a building or area. It is considered that the design of the proposed addition dominates the heritage details of the existing building along Whistler Street and challenges the heritage character of the conservation area.

3.2.2.2 Retaining Significant Features and Landscape Setting

Alterations or additions to heritage items or buildings within a conservation area must:

- a) retain original and traditional roof form, roof pitch with any alterations to the roofs to be sympathetic to the style of the heritage item or building within a conservation area;*
- b) retain original architectural detailing such as barge board, finial trim, window awnings and front verandas. New detailing must be complementary to the character of the item or place;*

As outlined above this section requires that alterations or additions to buildings within a conservation area must retain the original features and any new detailing should be complementary with the character of the item or conservation area. Contemporary additions should be complementary with the character of the item or area.

The proposed addition, facing Whistler Street, is not recessive and not complementary with the original architectural detailing of the house, or that of the overall conservation area. The first floor extension, following the ground floor external walls diminishes the existing single level conjoined terraces appearance, therefore the additions are not considered complementary especially due to the location of the site, having exposure to 2 street frontages, making the rear addition more visible.

Conclusions:

The subject building is located on a highly visible corner location. The longest street frontage to Whistler Street across the heritage item St Mary's Church, Presbytery and School, is highly visible within the Pittwater Road Conservation Area. It is considered that the external proposed design, including the building form and the roof form, does not respect the form and proportions of the

original terraces. The design of the first floor addition is considered dominating the existing building by diminishing the existing roof along Whistler Street. As part of conjoined terrace houses, the design should be recessive in character and be complementary in design, form, roof shape, fenestration, materials and finishes.

Therefore, this application for Review cannot be supported on heritage grounds.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of MLEP.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

Further Comments

COMPLETED BY: Oya Guner, Heritage Advisor

DATE: 18 November 2019

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

Nil.