

APPLICATION FOR MODIFICATION ASSESSMENT REPORT

Application Number:	Mod2021/0636	
Responsible Officer:	Catriona Shirley	
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 189 DP 11162, 129 Upper Clontarf Street SEAFORTH NSW 2092	
Proposed Development:	Modification of Development Consent DA2020/0116 granted for alterations and additions to an existing dwelling house, including a new driveway, parking area and ancillary works	
Zoning:	Manly LEP2013 - Land zoned R2 Low Density Residential	
Development Permissible:	Yes	
Existing Use Rights:	No	
Consent Authority:	Northern Beaches Council	
Land and Environment Court Action:	No	
Owner:	Justin Paul Caruana Rowena Mary Caruana	
Applicant:	Justin Paul Caruana	

Application Lodged:	27/08/2021	
Integrated Development:	No	
Designated Development:	No	
State Reporting Category:	Residential - Alterations and additions	
Notified:	10/09/2021 to 24/09/2021	
Advertised:	Not Advertised	
Submissions Received:	1	
Clause 4.6 Variation:	Nil	
Recommendation:	Approval	

PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT IN DETAIL

The modification application seeks approval to amend condition No. 9(a), (b) and (c) from approval DA2020/0116 and undertake design changes to the southern boundary access stairs.

DA2020/0116

Condition No. 9 applied in DA2020/0116 was as follows:

The following amendments are to be made to the approved plans

a) The proposed pool, screening and associated decking located adjacent to the southern boundary do not form part of this application and shall be deleted from all plans.

b) The proposed fence located on the northern boundary shall have a maximum height of 1.5m.

c) The proposed fence located on the northern boundary shall have a maximum length of 10.0m when measured from the rear wall of the proposed mudroom.



d) The proposed gate in located on the northern boundary, adjacent to the proposed awning shall be 1.6m in width.

Details demonstrating compliance are to be submitted to the Certifying Authority prior to the issue of the construction certificate.

As a result, of a new agreement with the owners of No. 131 Upper Clontarf, to improve amenity between the sites this modification seeks to remove Condition No. 9(a), (b) and (c).

It noted after site inspection that a boundary fence up to 1.8m in height has been constructed on the subject site, with the fence having no gate between the sites as per the original approval.

This boundary fence is not considered as part of this application and has been constructed under the Dividing Fences Act 1991.

The modification also seeks to undertake design amendments to the approved access stairs located within the southern side area of the subject site. These access stairs allows connectivity between the front decking area to the lower lawned portion of the subject site.

No other works are proposed as part of this modification.

ASSESSMENT INTRODUCTION

The application has been assessed in accordance with the requirements of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 and the associated Regulations. In this regard:

- An assessment report and recommendation has been prepared (the subject of this report) taking into account all relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, and the associated regulations;
- A site inspection was conducted and consideration has been given to the impacts of the development upon the subject site and adjoining, surrounding and nearby properties;
- Notification to adjoining and surrounding properties, advertisement (where required) and referral to relevant internal and external bodies in accordance with the Act, Regulations and relevant Development Control Plan;
- A review and consideration of all submissions made by the public and community interest groups in relation to the application;
- A review and consideration of all documentation provided with the application (up to the time of determination);
- A review and consideration of all referral comments provided by the relevant Council Officers, State Government Authorities/Agencies and Federal Government Authorities/Agencies on the proposal.

SUMMARY OF ASSESSMENT ISSUES

Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013 - 6.8 Landslide risk Manly Development Control Plan - 3.4.2 Privacy and Security Manly Development Control Plan - 4.1.9 Swimming Pools, Spas and Water Features Manly Development Control Plan - 4.1.10 Fencing

SITE DESCRIPTION

Property Description:



	NSW 2092
Detailed Site Description:	The subject site consists of one (1) allotment located on the western side of Upper Clontarf Street. Upper Clontarf Street is a partially unformed road located above Clontarf Street to the south.
	The site is considered irregular in shape with a frontage of 12.52m along Upper Clontarf Street and a depth of 43.84m The site has a surveyed area of 531.1m ² .
	The site has vehicular access via an suspended driveway from Upper Clontarf Street. This driveway is subject to a right of carriageway easement with the adjoining neighbour at No.131 Upper Clontarf Street.
	The site is located within the R2 Low Density Residential zone and accommodates a three-storey dwelling positioned to the rear of the site. The subject site is currently under construction with the active consents of DA2020/0116 and DA2020/0884 approved via REV2021/0011.
	The site slopes steeply down from the northern to southern side boundary with a fall of approximately 6.0m.
	The site contains large rock outcrops, canopy tress and a grassed lawn area within the front setback.
	Adjoining and surrounding development is characterised by one and two storey detached dwelling of varying ages withi landscape settings.



SITE HISTORY



A search of Councils records have revealed the following relevant Development Applications:

DA2020/0116

Development Application **DA2020/0116** for the alterations and additions to an existing driveway, parking area, swimming pool and ancillary works was approved with specific design conditions on the 21 May 2020.

A condition of consent was imposed to delete the proposed swimming pool and decking, and provide height, length and width requirements for the northern boundary fence and access gate, which read as follows:

9. Amendments to the approved plans

The following amendments are to be made to the approved plans

a) The proposed pool, screening and associated decking located adjacent to the southern boundary do not form part of this application and shall be deleted from all plans.

b) The proposed fence located on the northern boundary shall have a maximum height of 1.5m.

c) The proposed fence located on the northern boundary shall have a maximum length of 10.0m when measured from the rear wall of the proposed mudroom.

d) The proposed gate in located on the northern boundary, adjacent to the proposed awning shall be 1.6m in width.

Details demonstrating compliance are to be submitted to the Certifying Authority prior to the issue of the construction certificate.

DA2020/0884

Development Application **DA2020/0884** for the alterations and additions to a dwelling house including a swimming pool was submitted to Council.

The application was primarily seeking approval for a new swimming pool. This application was subsequently was refused by the Development Determination Panel on 9 December 2020.

The reasons for refusal were as follows:

1. Pursuant to Section 4.15(1)(a)(iii) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 the proposed development is inconsistent with the provisions of Clause 3.4.2 Privacy and Security of the Manly Development Control Plan.

2. Pursuant to Section 4.15(1)(a)(iii) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 the proposed development is inconsistent with the provisions of Clause 4.1.8 Development on Sloping Sites of the Manly Development Control Plan.

3. Pursuant to Section 4.15(1)(a)(iii) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 the proposed development is inconsistent with the provisions of Clause 4.1.9 Swimming Pools, Spas and Water Features of the Manly Development Control Plan.

4. Pursuant to Section 4.15(1)(a)(iii) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 the proposed development is inconsistent with the provisions of Clause 4.4.5 Earthworks (Excavation and Filling) of the Manly Development Control Plan.

REV2021/0011

Review of Determination **REV2021/0011** was summited to Council of application **DA2020/0884** that was refused by the Development Determination Panel at the meeting of 9 December 2020.

The review proposal was for alterations and additions to a dwelling house to construct a swimming



pool. The Panel considered the amended design and was satisfied that the amended swimming pool design satisfactorily address the reason for refusal of **DA2020/0884**.

As a result application **REV2021/0011** for **DA2020/884** was approved by the Development Determination Panel on the 9 December 2020.

ENVIRONMENTAL PLANNING AND ASSESSMENT ACT, 1979 (EPAA)

The relevant matters for consideration under the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979, are:

The application has been assessed in accordance with the requirements of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 and the associated Regulations. In this regard:

- An assessment report and recommendation has been prepared and is attached taking into all relevant provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 and associated regulations;
- A site inspection was conducted and consideration has been given to the impacts of the development upon all lands whether nearby, adjoining or at a distance;
- Consideration was given to all documentation provided (up to the time of determination) by the applicant, persons who have made submissions regarding the application and any advice given by relevant Council / Government / Authority Officers on the proposal;

In this regard, the consideration of the application adopts the previous assessment detailed in the Assessment Report for DA2020/0116, in full, with amendments detailed and assessed as follows:

The relevant matters for consideration under Section 4.55(1A) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979, are:

Section 4.55(1A) - Other Modifications	Comments		
A consent authority may, on application being made by the applicant or any other person entitled to act on a consent granted by the consent authority and subject to and in accordance with the regulations, modify the consent if:			
(a) it is satisfied that the proposed modification is of minimal environmental impact, and	Yes The modification, as proposed in this application, is considered to be of minimal environmental impact for the following reasons: The modifications do not change the building envelope, streetscape appearance, car parking, drainage or landscape outcomes. There are no significant change to the built form controls, and the spatial relationship of the proposed works to adjoining properties is maintained with a similar compatible streetscape presentation.		
(b) it is satisfied that the development to which the consent as modified relates is substantially the same development as the development for which consent was originally granted and before that consent as originally granted was modified (if at all), and	The development, as proposed, has been found to be such that Council is satisfied that the proposed works are substantially the same as those already approved under DA2020/0116.		
(c) it has notified the application in accordance with:	The application has been publicly exhibited in accordance with the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, Environmental Planning and		



Section 4.55(1A) - Other Modifications	Comments
(i) the regulations, if the regulations so require,	Assessment Regulation 2000, and the Northern Beaches Community Participation Plan.
or	
(ii) a development control plan, if the consent authority is a council that has made a development control plan under section 72 that requires the notification or advertising of applications for modification of a development consent, and	
(d) it has considered any submissions made concerning the proposed modification within any period prescribed by the regulations or	See discussion on "Notification & Submissions Received" in this report.
provided by the development control plan, as the case may be.	OR
	No submissions were received in relation to this application.

Section 4.15 Assessment

In accordance with Section 4.55 (3) of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, in determining an modification application made under Section 4.55 the consent authority must take into consideration such of the matters referred to in section 4.15 (1) as are of relevance to the development the subject of the application.

The relevant matters for consideration under Section 4.15 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979, are:

Section 4.15 'Matters for Consideration'	Comments
Section 4.15 (1) (a)(i) – Provisions of any environmental planning instrument	See discussion on "Environmental Planning Instruments" in this report.
Section 4.15 (1) (a)(ii) – Provisions of any draft environmental planning instrument	Draft State Environmental Planning Policy (Remediation of Land) seeks to replace the existing SEPP No. 55 (Remediation of Land). Public consultation on the draft policy was completed on 13 April 2018. The subject site has been used for residential purposes for an extended period of time. The proposed development retains the residential use of the site, and is not considered a contamination risk.
Section 4.15 (1) (a)(iii) – Provisions of any development control plan	Manly Development Control Plan applies to this proposal.
Section 4.15 (1) (a)(iiia) – Provisions of any planning agreement	None applicable.
Section 4.15 (1) (a)(iv) – Provisions of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Regulation 2000 (EP&A Regulation 2000)	<u>Division 8A</u> of the EP&A Regulation 2000 requires the consent authority to consider Prescribed conditions of development consent. These matters have been addressed via a condition in the original consent.



Section 4.15 'Matters for Consideration'	Comments
	<u>Clauses 54 and 109</u> of the EP&A Regulation 2000 allow Council to request additional information. Additional information was requested in relation to in regards to amended plans reflective of DA2020/0116.
	<u>Clause 92</u> of the EP&A Regulation 2000 requires the consent authority to consider AS 2601 - 1991: The Demolition of Structures. This matter has been addressed via a condition in the original consent.
	<u>Clauses 93 and/or 94</u> of the EP&A Regulation 2000 requires the consent authority to consider the upgrading of a building (including fire safety upgrade of development). This matter has been addressed via a condition in the original consent/This clause is not relevant to this application.
	<u>Clause 98</u> of the EP&A Regulation 2000 requires the consent authority to consider insurance requirements under the Home Building Act 1989. This matter has been addressed via a condition in the original consent.
	<u>Clause 98</u> of the EP&A Regulation 2000 requires the consent authority to consider the provisions of the Building Code of Australia (BCA). This matter has been addressed via a condition in the original consent.
Section 4.15 (1) (b) – the likely impacts of the development, including environmental impacts on the natural and built environment and social and economic impacts in	(i) Environmental Impact The environmental impacts of the proposed development on the natural and built environment are addressed under the Manly Development Control Plan section in this report.
the locality	(ii) Social Impact The proposed development will not have a detrimental social impact in the locality considering the character of the proposal.
	(iii) Economic Impact The proposed development will not have a detrimental economic impact on the locality considering the nature of the existing and proposed land use.
Section 4.15 (1) (c) – the suitability of the site for the development	The site is considered suitable for the proposed development.
Section 4.15 (1) (d) – any submissions made in accordance with the EPA Act or EPA Regs	See discussion on "Notification & Submissions Received" in this report.
Section 4.15 (1) (e) – the public interest	No matters have arisen in this assessment that would justify the refusal of the application in the public interest.

EXISTING USE RIGHTS

Existing Use Rights are not applicable to this application.



BUSHFIRE PRONE LAND

The site is not classified as bush fire prone land.

NOTIFICATION & SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

The subject development application has been publicly exhibited from 10/09/2021 to 24/09/2021 in accordance with the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979, Environmental Planning and Assessment Regulation 2000 and the Community Participation Plan.

As a result of the public exhibition process council is in receipt of 1 submission/s from:

Name:	Address:
Withheld	SEAFORTH NSW 2092

The following issues were raised in the submissions and each have been addressed below:

- Stormwater
- Illegal works

The matters raised within the submissions are addressed as follows:

• Concern has been raised in regards to the stormwater management of the subject site. <u>Comment:</u>

The approved development consents on the site were referred to Council's development engineers for comment in regards to stormwater management. Suitable conditions were imposed as part of this recommendation to ensure adequate stormwater management for the subject property and adjoining properties.

This modification makes no changes to the previously approved design for stormwater. As a result, it is considered that this matter does not warrant refusal of the application.

• Concern was raised verbally, via site visit, in regards to the consistency of the works on the site to the approved plans of both approved consents. <u>Comment:</u>

The works as part of this modification only seek to make amendments to the access stairs, removal of the northern gate and fencing requirements between the northern adjoining property and the subject site. No other changes are proposed as part of this modification.

It is recommended that any works that are not in accordance with the approved plans are referred to the sites Private Certifier, and/or Councils Compliance team for their investigation.

It is considered that this matter does not warrant refusal of the application.

REFERRALS



No referrals were sent in relation to this application

ENVIRONMENTAL PLANNING INSTRUMENTS (EPIs)*

All, Environmental Planning Instruments (SEPPs, REPs and LEPs), Development Controls Plans and Council Policies have been considered in the merit assessment of this application.

In this regard, whilst all provisions of each Environmental Planning Instruments (SEPPs, REPs and LEPs), Development Controls Plans and Council Policies have been considered in the assessment, many provisions contained within the document are not relevant or are enacting, definitions and operational provisions which the proposal is considered to be acceptable against.

As such, an assessment is provided against the controls relevant to the merit consideration of the application hereunder.

State Environmental Planning Policies (SEPPs) and State Regional Environmental Plans (SREPs)

SEPP 55 - Remediation of Land

Clause 7 (1) (a) of SEPP 55 requires the Consent Authority to consider whether land is contaminated. Council records indicate that the subject site has been used for residential purposes for a significant period of time with no prior land uses. In this regard it is considered that the site poses no risk of contamination and therefore, no further consideration is required under Clause 7 (1) (b) and (c) of SEPP 55 and the land is considered to be suitable for the residential land use.

Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013

Is the development permissible?	Yes	
After consideration of the merits of the proposal, is the development consistent with:		
aims of the LEP?	Yes	
zone objectives of the LEP?	Yes	

Principal Development Standards

Standard	Requirement	Approved	Proposed	% Variation	Complies
Height of Buildings:	8.5m	5.1m (Swimming Pool)*	up to 5.4m (access stairs) Swimming pool removed via a condition of consent	-	Yes
Floor Space Ratio	FSR: 0.45:1	FSR: 0.44:1	No Change	-	Yes

*Swimming pool removal via a condition of consent DA2020/0116.

Compliance Assessment

Clause	Compliance with Requirements
4.3 Height of buildings	Yes
4.4 Floor space ratio	Yes



Clause	Compliance with Requirements
6.2 Earthworks	Yes
6.8 Landslide risk	Yes

Detailed Assessment

6.8 Landslide risk

A Preliminary Geotechnical Assessment has been prepared by White Geotechnical Group (J2532), dated 30 April 2020, was prepared as supporting documentation for DA 2020/0116. This report and its recommendations will apply to the modified works to ensure there is no adverse impacts to the surrounding properties resulting from the proposal on sloping land.

Manly Development Control Plan

Built Form Controls	Requirement	Approved	Proposed	Complies
4.1.4.1 Street Front Setbacks	Prevailing building line / 6m	10.6 (access stairs)	15.8m (access stairs)	Yes
4.1.4.2 Side Setbacks and Secondary Street Frontages	2.145m (based on wall height of 6.5m) South	2m	3m (access stairs)	Yes
4.1.9 Swimming Pools, Spas and Water Features	1m height above ground	5.1m*	Swimming pool removed via a condition of consent	Yes
	1m curtilage/1.5m water side/rear setback	1.9m (curtilage) /2.2m (water)*	Swimming pool removed via a condition of consent	Yes

Swimming pool removed via a condition of consent within DA2020/0116.

Compliance Assessment

Clause	Compliance with Requirements	Consistency Aims/Objectives
3.1 Streetscapes and Townscapes	Yes	Yes
3.1.1 Streetscape (Residential areas)	Yes	Yes
3.4 Amenity (Views, Overshadowing, Overlooking /Privacy, Noise)	Yes	Yes
3.4.1 Sunlight Access and Overshadowing	Yes	Yes
3.4.2 Privacy and Security	Yes	Yes
3.5 Sustainability - (Greenhouse Energy Efficiency, Thermal Performance, and Water Sensitive Urban Design)	Yes	Yes
3.10 Safety and Security	Yes	Yes
4.1 Residential Development Controls	Yes	Yes
4.1.1 Dwelling Density, Dwelling Size and Subdivision	Yes	Yes
4.1.4 Setbacks (front, side and rear) and Building Separation	Yes	Yes



Clause		Consistency Aims/Objectives
4.1.8 Development on Sloping Sites	Yes	Yes
4.1.9 Swimming Pools, Spas and Water Features	N/A	N/A
4.1.10 Fencing	Yes	Yes
4.4.1 Demolition	Yes	Yes
4.4.2 Alterations and Additions	Yes	Yes
4.4.5 Earthworks (Excavation and Filling)	Yes	Yes

Detailed Assessment

3.4.2 Privacy and Security

The access stairs of the original development were approved with 3m setbacks to the side boundaries, consistent with the minimum setbacks prescribed by MDCP 2011. Whilst the swimming pool setbacks where not supported, the access stairs were supported due to the specific context of the site and in circumstances where the view lines are oriented towards the rear boundary and existing landscaping minimised privacy impacts to the adjoining property owners.

The subject modification application seeks to amend the proposal by moving the access stairs further west towards the dwelling house. The amended access stairs would sit directly adjacent to the neighbouring property to the south and is considered to result in improved amenity impacts concerning privacy (visually and aurally) to this neighbour. See Photo 1 below.



Photo 1: Location of the access stairs, with screening landscaping minimising privacy impacts.

Furthermore, it is considered that the amended location will be located away from the important rock



outcrop, and therefore improve the landscaped setting of the site.

As a result, it is considered that the amended design of the stairs satisfy the clause and the objectives of this control are achieved.

4.1.9 Swimming Pools, Spas and Water Features

The swimming pool proposed pool, screening and associated decking located adjacent to the southern boundary do not form part of this modification as they were removed by Condition No. 9 (a) of DA2020/0116.

4.1.10 Fencing

The modification seeks the removal of the applied conditions in relation to the boundary fencing between the subject site and No. 131 Upper Clontarf Street.

The condition imposed to the fencing height, and northern gate width, where to address the agreement between the subject site and No. 131 Upper Clontarf Street land owners as the fencing was to be located on the boundary between the two sites. The condition was also to ensure the fencing works are carried out in accordance with that consented by the owners of No.131 upper Clontarf Street, Seaforth.

The modification seeks to remove the fencing and gate requirements under condition No. 9(b), 9(c) and 9(d).

The removal of the fencing and gate requirements can be considered as the owners of No. 131 Upper Clontarf have changed. As a result, a new agreement between the subject site and No. 131 Upper Clontarf has been made. The support of the removal of the fencing requirements under Condition No. 9 has been submitted as part of the modification.

The removal of the condition will allow an increased level of privacy for the areas of private open space within this setback area whilst not impacting upon the streetscape.

It is noted that a new boundary fence currently exists onsite between the two properties, see photo 2 below. This fence is not part of this application and has been constructed under the Dividing Fences Act 1991.



Photo 2: Existing fence between the subject site and No. 131 Upper Clontarf.

As such, the removal of condition 9(b), (c) and (d) is considered to be acceptable.



THREATENED SPECIES, POPULATIONS OR ECOLOGICAL COMMUNITIES

The proposal will not significantly affect threatened species, populations or ecological communities, or their habitats.

CRIME PREVENTION THROUGH ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN

The proposal is consistent with the principles of Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design.

POLICY CONTROLS

Northern Beaches Section 7.12 Contributions Plan 2021

Section 7.12 contributions were levied on the Development Application.

CONCLUSION

The site has been inspected and the application assessed having regard to all documentation submitted by the applicant and the provisions of:

- Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979;
- Environmental Planning and Assessment Regulation 2000;
- All relevant and draft Environmental Planning Instruments;
- Manly Local Environment Plan;
- Manly Development Control Plan; and
- Codes and Policies of Council.

This assessment has taken into consideration the submitted plans, Statement of Environmental Effects, all other documentation supporting the application and public submissions, and does not result in any unreasonable impacts on surrounding, adjoining, adjacent and nearby properties subject to the conditions contained within the recommendation.

In consideration of the proposal and the merit consideration of the development, the proposal is considered to be:

- Consistent with the objectives of the DCP
- Consistent with the zone objectives of the LEP
- Consistent with the aims of the LEP
- Consistent with the objectives of the relevant EPIs
- Consistent with the objects of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979

It is considered that the proposed development satisfies the appropriate controls and that all processes and assessments have been satisfactorily addressed.

RECOMMENDATION

THAT Council as the consent authority grant approval to Modification Application No. Mod2021/0636 for Modification of Development Consent DA2020/0116 granted for alterations and additions to an existing dwelling house, including a new driveway, parking area and ancillary works on land at Lot 189 DP 11162,129 Upper Clontarf Street, SEAFORTH, subject to the conditions printed below:



A. Add Condition No.1A - Modification of Consent - Approved Plans and supporting Documentation to read as follows:

The development must be carried out in compliance with DA2020/0116, and as amended by any other condition of consent with the following:

a) Modification Approved Plans

Architectural Plans - Endorsed with Council's stamp					
Drawing No.	Dated	Prepared By			
Landscape Plan CC-02 Rev A	Undated	Unauthored			
Section & Elevation AA CC-03 Rev A	Undated	Unauthored			
Section & Elevation BB CC-04 Rev A	Undated	Unauthored			
South Elevation CC-05 Rev A	Undated	Unauthored			

b) Any plans and / or documentation submitted to satisfy the Conditions of this consent.

Reason: To ensure the work is carried out in accordance with the determination of Council and approved plans.

B. Modify Condition No. 9 Amendment to the approved plans to read as follows:

The following amendments are to be made to the approved plans:

a) The proposed pool, screening and associated decking located adjacent to the southern boundary do not form part of this application and shall be deleted from all plans.

b) The access stairs (adjoining the southern boundary) are to be of a floating style construction, a wall/screening between the stairs and the ground level is not to be constructed.

Details demonstrating compliance are to be submitted to the Certifying Authority prior to the issue of the construction certificate.

Reason: To ensure development minimises unreasonable impacts upon surrounding land.

In signing this report, I declare that I do not have a Conflict of Interest.

Signed

Catriona Shirley, Planner

The application is determined on 08/11/2021, under the delegated authority of:



A.

Rodney Piggott, Manager Development Assessments