

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2021/0356
Date:	06/12/2021
To:	Alex Keller
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 87 DP 70416 , 32 Reddall Street MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
<p>The proposal has been referred to Heritage as the subject property is a listed heritage item, being Item I220 – House “Logan Brae” and adjoins heritage listed stone kerbs Item I2, along Reddall Street. The property is also within the vicinity of heritage items, listed in Schedule 5 of Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013:</p> <p>Item I131 - St Patrick’s Estate - 151 Darley Road (Primary address, alternate address 106 Darley Road)</p> <p>Item I132 - St Patrick’s Estate - Darley Road</p> <p>Item I2 - All Stone kerbs - Along Reddall Street</p>
Details of heritage items affected
<p>Details of the heritage items, as contained within the Northern Beaches Heritage Inventory are:</p> <p>Item I220 – House “Logan Brae”</p> <p><u>Statement of Significance</u></p> <p>A spectacular and finely detailed example of Inter-War California Bungalow on a corner site. Featuring cobbled front, elaborate gable ends facing each. Street frontage. A fine example of California Bungalow Style building.</p> <p><u>Physical Description</u></p> <p>Single storey Inter-War California Bungalow on a corner site, constructed of dark face brick. Features elaborate gable ends to each street frontage, cobbled finish to front verandah base and columns, diamond-pattern leadlight casement windows. Original dark face brick front fence. Diamond - pattern leadlight casement windows.</p> <p>Item I131 - St Patrick’s Estate</p> <p><u>Statement of significance:</u></p> <p>St Patrick’s Estate is a site of national heritage significance. The unparalleled grandeur of the cultural landscape, including its setting, buildings and landscape components, as well as the history it embodies, reflects a unique physical manifestation of the Catholic Church in Australia, not seen in any other location in the country. The site exemplifies an important period in the Church’s history in</p>

Australia, as well as the vision of Cardinal Moran, and for that reason has great significant to Australian Catholics, as well as the broader community.

The built elements, particularly Moran House with its Gothic Revival architectural style, reflect both the romanticism of Cardinal Moran's vision for the Australian Catholic Church, as well as the austere nature of the Church at that time. Sited on the prominent northern side of North Head, overlooking Manly and the surrounding area, St Patrick's has become a landmark recognised by locals and visitors alike. Despite recent redevelopments of parts of the site, and the adaptive reuse of the key buildings, the site has retained its integrity and still presents as a cohesive whole.

Physical description:

St Patrick's Estate is a complex cultural landscape comprising many significant components, including buildings, grounds, gardens and landscape elements (including walls, pathways, and significant trees). It is magnificently sited on the northern slopes of North Head, overlooking Manly and Ocean Beach, and it is a prominent and striking landmark in the Manly area.

Architecturally, the complex comprises a variety of Nineteenth and early Twentieth Century buildings primarily in Gothic Revival style. The most prominent of these is Moran House, a four storey symmetrical sandstone building with bell tower at the centre, above the main entrance, which is also flanked by a two storey colonnade. The kitchen wing was added in 1935. Key vistas include looking south east toward the building from the town centre, and from the front of Moran House looking north west towards the town centre.

Also remaining on the northern part of the site are:

- The former Recreation Centre (1910). This is a simple federation style building at the rear of Moran House, though it has undergone a number of changes over time, some of which has compromised its integrity.
- St Therese's Convent (1934). This is a two storey Edwardian building with rendered walls and stone trim, comprising the main residential area as well as a chapel. An unsympathetic addition was made in 1962.
- Kelly House (1954). Sited to the north east of Moran House and connected by a walk way, the four storey building is made from a simple face brick, and whilst does not exhibit the detail of the other earlier buildings, it is a neutral addition to the site, and does not detract from the key elements.

Other relevant heritage listings

Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	Yes	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	No	

Consideration of Application

The proposal is for alterations and additions the existing heritage listed dwelling, including the demolition of the existing garage and the maid's quarters, internal alterations and the construction of a two storey pavilion style addition with a new double garage, excavation for basement storage and

conversion of the existing roof space to a new attic level with north and south facing dormer windows. It also includes the construction of a swimming pool and new landscaping works.

It is considered, that the proposed dormer window addition to the front elevation will dominate the existing roof form, resulting in an adverse impact upon the significance of the heritage item. Any new development should be located set back behind the existing external walls, however the proposed additions are located further closer to the street, dominating the views to the heritage item.

Therefore, Heritage requires the following amendments to the proposal:

- overall height of the link between the heritage item and the new additions should be reduced (preferably lower than the original roof level) to be less visible
- proposed setback of the new additions to the College Street boundary should be increased by at least 200mm
- dormer window facing the street should be reduced in size to become a more traditional eye-lid dormer
- proposed RLs of the dormers should be provided
- surrounding original fabric to the existing fire place to be retained and noted on the plans
- diamond patterned leadlight casement windows which are proposed to be removed from the front verandah are recommended to be reused replacing the newer windows of the existing verandah facing College Street
- proposed attic level layout is preferred as presented in the amended PLM drawings, as it is considered to have less impact upon the heritage item

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of Manly LEP 2013.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? HIS provided with PLM has not been updated.

Conclusion

Heritage Revised Assessment for Amended plans received on 31 November 2021:

Amended plans were submitted on 30 November 2021 by the applicant. These amended plans have resolved some concerns that Heritage had with the proposal but there are remaining matters that need to be addressed:

- proposed setback from College Street should be increased at least by at least 200mm
- existing chimney should be retained and shown on the elevations not only on the plan
- top of the proposed dormers should be RL 32.44 - at least 300mm below the ridge height of the main roof and the width of the proposed dormer, facing Reddall Street, should not be any larger than 3500mm
- existing diamond patterned leadlight windows facing College Street should be retained in-situ and noted on the drawings
- proposed new fence along College Street to match existing

It is noted, that the new connection between the original house and the new addition could be further reduced in height. It is also noted, that considerations should be given to the reduction of the floor to ceiling height (2.7m for ground level and 2.4 for first floor level) to reduce the overall height, and therefore to minimise the impact upon the heritage items and the impact on the existing visual setting.

Therefore, no objections are raised to the proposal on heritage grounds, subject to 5 conditions.

The proposal is therefore supported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

CONDITIONS TO BE SATISFIED PRIOR TO THE ISSUE OF THE CONSTRUCTION CERTIFICATE

Photographic Archival Record

A photographic archival record of the site is to be made of all existing buildings and structures (including interiors and exteriors and their setting), generally in accordance with the guidelines issued by the NSW Heritage Division of the NSW Office of Environment & Heritage (OEH).

This record must be submitted and approved by the Certifying Authority prior to commencement of any demolition or works on-site.

The photographic record should be made using digital technology, submitted on archival quality CD-R disc, and should include:

- Location of property, date of survey and author of survey;
- A site plan at a scale of 1:200 showing all structures and major landscape elements;
- Floor plans of any buildings at a scale of 1:100;
- Photographs which document the site, cross-referenced in accordance with recognised archival recording practice to catalogue sheets. The extent of documentation will depend on the nature of the item.

Reason: To provide an archival photographic record of the site, including any buildings and landscape elements, prior to any works.

Details of the new fence

The proposed new fence along College Street should match the existing fence. Details of this fence must be provided to Council prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To preserve the significance of the heritage item.

Dormer windows

Top of the proposed dormers should be RL 32.44 - at least 300mm below the ridge height of the main roof and the width of the proposed dormer, facing Reddall Street, should not be any larger than 3500mm. Details, demonstrating compliance with this condition, are to be submitted to Council prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To preserve the significance of the heritage item.

Setback from College Street

The proposed setback to the new addition from College Street should be increased at least by 200mm. Details demonstrating compliance are to be submitted to Council prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To prevent the new addition from dominating the heritage item.

Existing chimney and windows

The existing chimney should be retained and shown on the elevations not only on the plan. The existing diamond patterned leadlight windows facing College Street should be retained in-situ and noted on the drawings. Details, demonstrating compliance with this condition are to be submitted to Council prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To ensure, that the existing/original features of the heritage item are preserved.