

## Memo

### Development Assessment

**To:** NBLPP Members

**From:** Catriona Shirley – Principal Planner

**Date:** 4 May 2021

**Subject:** Agenda item 1.3 – DA2020/1621 - 1 West Promenade Manly - Alterations and additions to an existing commercial / retail building

**Record Number:** 2021/317221

---

Dear Panel Members

The applicant of Development Applicant DA2021/0119 provided a submission to the Northern Beaches Local Planning Panel dated 3 May 2021.

The Panel Chair requested that Councils Planning and Heritage Officers provide a response to the applicant's submission. As a result, the purpose of this memo is to clarify several matters raised by the Applicant to assist the Panel with its deliberations.

The applicant's submission has highlighted the following matters.

- ***We emphasise the word "minor" in terms of landmark significance. Whilst important and not to be ignored, it is not a major factor of cultural significance.***

Comment:

The landmark status of the heritage building is informed by the totality of its presentation to the street. The five (5) sail awnings proposed will remove the legibility of important items such as the columns and corbel ends of the porte-cochere and the fanlights on the main wall.

Concealing these important elements removes the overall legibility of the item and leaves only the gable end and tiles free from obstructed views.

Council is of the opinion that this would diminish its landmark status entirely and is not supported.

The five (5) sails as proposed are in direct conflict with the recommendations of the Conservation Management Plan (CMP).

- *Recommendation 16, future uses should expose original fabric to view and remove intrusive elements.*

- *Recommendations 31 and 32 detail that views to the front and side of buildings along Gilbert Street and West Promenade should be retained, as well as views to the place from the southern forecourt of Manly Town Hall.*

Based on the above recommendations from the CMP, Council cannot support

the five (5) sail proposal. The proposed sail awnings B1, B2 and B3 are considered to detract from the building and its significance and will interrupt views to the item as well as its significant features. As a result, Council considered the removal of these three (3) awnings via conditions appropriate in this instance.

- ***The building will still be clearly visible when viewed from the town hall forecourt area. The visual relationship still remains despite the inclusion of the sails.***

Comment:

The CMP adopted for the site is particularly clear on the presentation to Gilbert Street, West Promenade and through to The Corso and Manly Town Hall and the need to avoid any interruption to these views.

These sails would interrupt the views and hide parts of the building, diminishing its landmark status. As a result, the sails would only allow views to the gable end and roof tiles which is not acceptable nor supported by Council.

- ***The visual impact zone resulting from the inclusion of the sails is considered minor. The height of the building to the underside of the roof gutter is approximately 3.2m and the height of the building itself is approximately 6.3m. The proposed depth of the PVC sail zone will be in the order of 430mm to 450mm, a very small proportion of the building's visual character.***

Comment:

The proposed development involves the addition of five (5) sail awnings that detract from the building's heritage significance, interrupt views to the significant features of the heritage item which does not retain or conserve the cultural significance of Manly.

There are previous examples within the Northern Beaches LGA of sail awnings installed on a similarly low scale heritage item, that have demonstrated a poor visual Heritage outcome.

The heritage listed former uniting church building at 65 Albert Street Freshwater has had a similar style of sail awnings erected around the building. As demonstrated in the photo below, the sail awnings remove the legibility of important features such as the windows, brick banding, piers and the projecting front gable entrance to the church.



*Photo 1: Heritage Listed 65 Albert Street Freshwater.*

As such, the visual impact of the five (5) sails awnings are not considered to be minor, nor consistent with DCP controls and do not retain or conserve the cultural significance of Manly.

- ***The proposed sails will be fixed to the building at a fixed series of points only which are easily removed. The holes are easily repairable when no longer required with no lasting impact on the building fabric.***

Comment:

Council has no concerns with the construction or location of the fixed points of the proposed sail awnings.

- ***We also note that there is nothing preventing the club from installing freestanding umbrellas in the outdoor areas, which would also be visible from the town hall forecourt area.***

Comment:

The fixed sails would be a permanent visual interruption to the Heritage item. Council agrees that proposed umbrellas would be more appropriate solution particularly as the umbrellas are not a fixed structure and can be manually put up and down as required.

- ***The club is a good and responsible neighbour and takes feedback from its neighbours seriously. Whilst the club complies in every sense of its obligations, it wants to reduce any perceived impacts to the absolute minimum.***

Comment:

No information has been provided to Council in regard to the acoustic amenity impacts from the outdoor terrace areas of the Manly Civic Club.

A search of Councils records reveals no acoustic complaints from surrounding residential dwellings regarding noise from the Manly Civic Club.

The proposal received no submission of support for the application.

One submission of non-support was received from an adjoining neighbour.

Within the Statement of Environment Effects the applicant did not provide any history of acoustic complaints from residential dwellings, or information in regards to how feedback was obtained from the surrounding residential dwellings, nor how the PVC sail awnings are an acoustic solution.

No Acoustic Report was provided to demonstrate the acoustic benefits of the PVC sail awnings.

As a result, there is no record of acoustic impacts being an issue of concern, and as a result the remaining two sail awnings that can be supported by Council will provide a solution to the applicants "perceived impacts".

### Conclusion

Council appreciates the effort the Manly Civic Club and their project partners have made regarding the retention and adaption of the Auckland Garage building.

Heritage Officers agree with the point that over time the use of the garage as part of the club will likely become part of the cultural and social significance of the site.

However, Council does not support B1, B2 & B3 sail awnings as they detract from the aesthetic character and interrupt views and the significant features, such as the columns, the corbel ends to the porte-cochere and the fanlights.

The CMP adopted for the site is particularly clear on the presentation to Gilbert Street, West Promenade and through to The Corso and Manly Town Hall and the need to avoid any interruption to these views.

These sails would interrupt these views and hide parts of the building as well as diminish its landmark status. If the sails were to proceed the view would become mostly of the gable end and roof tiles which is not acceptable.

As a result, Council continues to hold the opinion the conditioned development (as conditioned) is satisfactory in relation to character, streetscape, and heritage impact.

The proposal is recommended for approval subject to conditions (i.e. the removal of sail awnings B1, B2 & B3).