

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT

1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road Palm Beach NSW, 2108

Garigal Country

Prepared for **PALMDEV PTY LTD** 31 August 2023

URBIS STAFF RESPONSIBLE FOR THIS REPORT WERE:

Director	Stephen Davies, B Arts Dip Ed, Dip T&CP, Dip Cons Studies, M.ICOMOS
Consultant	Annabelle Cooper, B Arts, M City Planning
	Darrienne Wyndham, B Arts (Ancient History), M Museum & Heritage Studies
Project Code	P34578
Report Number	01 – Issued 22.09.21 – Draft for client review
	02 – Issued 09.12.21 – Updated draft for client review
	03 – Issued 20.12.21 – Final
	04 – Issued 30.12.21 – Report update
	05 – Issued 04.07.23 – Report update with new DA drawings
	05- Issued 31.08.23 - Final

Urbis acknowledges the important contribution that Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people make in creating a strong and vibrant Australian society.

We acknowledge, in each of our offices, the Traditional Owners on whose land we stand.

All information supplied to Urbis in order to conduct this research has been treated in the strictest confidence. It shall only be used in this context and shall not be made available to third parties without client authorisation. Confidential information has been stored securely and data provided by respondents, as well as their identity, has been treated in the strictest confidence and all assurance given to respondents have been and shall be fulfilled.

© Urbis Pty Ltd 50 105 256 228

All Rights Reserved. No material may be reproduced without prior permission.

You must read the important disclaimer appearing within the body of this report.

urbis.com.au

CONTENTS

Exec	utive Sum	nmary	1		
1.	Introd	Introduction			
	1.1.	Background			
	1.2.	Site Location			
	1.3.	Heritage Listing			
	1.4.	Methodology			
	1.5.	Author Identification			
	1.6.	The Proposal			
2.	Site D	Description	12		
	2.1.	Site Setting	12		
	2.2.	Site Description	13		
3.	Histor	rical Overview	15		
	3.1.	Area History	15		
	3.2.	Site History			
	3.3.	Property Owners			
	3.4.	Date of Construction	21		
4.		ge Significance			
	4.1.	What is Heritage Significance?			
	4.2.	Significance Assessment			
	4.3.	Statement of Significance	25		
5.	Impac	ct Assessment			
	5.1.	Statutory Controls			
		5.1.1. Pittwater Local Environmental Plan 2014			
	5.2.	Pittwater 21 Development Control Plan			
	5.3.	Heritage NSW Guidelines			
6.	Concl	lusion and Recommendations	33		
7.		graphy and References			
	7.1.	Bibliography			
	7.2.	References			
Discl	aimer				

CI

FIGURES

Figure 1 - Locality map with the subject site outlined in red	2
Figure 2 - Extract from NSW Planning Portal with subject site outlined in red. Vicinity items indicated	3
Figure 3 - Extract from Perspective 01.	7
Figure 4 - Extract from Perspective 02.	7
Figure 5 - Extract from Perspective 03.	8
Figure 6 - Extract from Site Plan.	8
Figure 7 - Extract from Ground Floor Plan. Note: the heritage preservation area refers to an area of Aboriginal cultural significance and is not within the scope of this report.	9
Figure 8 - Extract from West Elevation	9
Figure 9 - Extract from North Elevation (Side).	10
Figure 10 - Extract from South Elevation (Side)	10
Figure 11 - Extract from East Elevation (Rear)	11

Figure 12 - Extract from Materials Sample Board.	11
Figure 13 – Overview of site setting with the subject site outlined in red	12
Figure 14 - View south along Barrenjoey Road from the subject site. Barrenjoey House marked with a red arrow.	13
Figure 15 - View north along Barrenjoey Road from the subject site	
Figure 16 - View of subject site from Barrenjoey Road with Barrenjoey house indicated	13
Figure 17 - View of carpark from Barrenjoey Road.	14
Figure 18 - Existing commercial buildings on site, now vacated	14
Figure 19 - Advertisement for the Palm Beach Estate.	
Figure 20 - Barrenjoey Lighthouse, Palm Beach c1900-1910	
Figure 21 - Beach Culture at Palm Beach 1960s.	
Figure 22 - Oblique aerial view of Palm Beach, 2008	18
Figure 23 Land owned by The Barrenjoey Company 1912	19
Figure 24 - Certificate of title Vol: 10688 Fol: 176	19
Figure 25 - Certificate of title Vol: 10688 Fol: 177	
Figure 26 - Certificate of title Vol: 10688 Fol: 178	
Figure 27 - Certificate of title Vol: 10688 Fol: 179	19
Figure 28 - Certificate of title Vol: 10822 Fol: 1	
Figure 29 - Certificate of title Vol: 12527 Fol: 3.	20

TABLES

Table 1 - Provided Plans	4
Table 2 - Property Owners	20
Table 3 Assessment of Heritage Significance	22
Table 4 - Assessment against the Pittwater Local Environmental Plan 2014	26
Table 5 - Assessment against the Pittwater 21 DCP	28
Table 6 - Heritage NSW Guidelines	30

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Urbis has been engaged by Palmdev Pty Ltd to prepare the following Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) for 1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach (subject site). The subject site is not a listed heritage item but is located in the vicinity of heritage items.

It is proposed to redevelop the existing property with a new multi-level residential development. Further details of the proposed works are included in Section 1.6.

This HIS has been prepared to determine the potential heritage impact of the proposed works on the heritage significance of vicinity items, *Barrenjoey House* located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road and *Wintern*, located at 21 Palm Beach Road.

A detailed impact assessment of the proposed works has been undertaken in Section 5 of this report. The proposed development has been assessed to have no adverse impact on the heritage significance of the above items. Key aspects of the proposal assessment are listed below:

- The subject site does not contain any heritage items of built heritage identified under Schedule 5, Part 1 of the *Pittwater Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2014*. It is, however, located immediately south of local heritage item *Barrenjoey House*, located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road Palm Beach and west of local heritage item *Wintern (house)*, located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach. The site is not located within a heritage conservation area.
- The proposed façade articulation relies on a sleek curvilinear profile arranged over a terraced form, ensuring the bulk of the development is concentrated away from the street frontage, concealed by the heavily vegetated sloping site. The curved detailing remains sympathetic to the natural landscape of Palm Beach while the recessive, diminishing profile ensures neighbouring heritage items are adequately interpreted.
- The development employs a contemporary aesthetic comprising glass and masonry, light-weight battenstyle screening and low-impact greenery. The proposed materials are sympathetic to the natural setting of Palm Beach and generally contribute to a recessive, diminishing profile. Proposed materials and finishes are appropriately contemporary and do not detract from or obscure the character of neighbouring heritage items.
- The proposed development ensures adequate visual and physical separation from the heritage items. Local item *Wintern* remains separated from the development by a row of residential development to the rear of the subject site. The development is assessed to have no impact on the heritage significance of *Wintern*.
- The stepped profile of the proposed development ensures the bulk of the site does not visually intrude on the profile or character of *Barrenjoey House*. As such, views to and from *Barrenjoey House* are preserved along the commercial strip and beachfront. The development is assessed to have no impact on the heritage significance of *Barrenjoey House*.

Overall, the proposed development is assessed to have no adverse impact on neighbouring heritage items *Wintern*, located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach and *Barrenjoey House*, located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach.

For the reasons outlined above, the proposed works are recommended for approval from a heritage perspective.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. BACKGROUND

Urbis has been engaged by IPM to prepare the following Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) for 1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach (subject site). The subject site is not a listed heritage item but is located in the vicinity of heritage items.

It is proposed to redevelop the existing property with a new multi-level residential development. Further details of the proposed works are included in Section 1.6.

This HIS has been prepared to determine the potential heritage impact of the proposed works on the heritage significance of vicinity items, *Barrenjoey House* located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road and *Wintern*, located at 21 Palm Beach Road.

This HIS will accompany the DA to Council.

1.2. SITE LOCATION

The subject site is located at 1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road Palm Beach within the local government area (LGA) of Northern Beaches Council. The site is legally described as Lot 21 of Deposited Plan 571298.



Figure 1 - Locality map with the subject site outlined in red.

Source: SIX Maps, 2023

1.3. HERITAGE LISTING

The subject site is not a listed heritage item under the *Pittwater Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2014*. It is, however located in the vicinity of the following heritage items listed under Schedule 5, Part 1 of the Pittwater LEP 2014:

- Barrenjoey House (restaurant and accommodation), located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road (Item No. 2270076).
- Winten (house), located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach (Item No. 2270056).

The subject site is not located in or near a heritage conservation area.

The relationships between the subject site and the heritage items are shown below.



Figure 2 - Extract from NSW Planning Portal with subject site outlined in red. Vicinity items indicated.

Source: NSW Planning Portal

1.4. METHODOLOGY

This HIS has been prepared in accordance with the NSW Heritage Division guidelines 'Assessing Heritage Significance', and 'Statements of Heritage Impact'. The philosophy and process adopted is that guided by the Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter 1999 (revised 2013).

Site constraints and opportunities have been considered with reference to relevant controls and provisions contained within the Pittwater LEP 2014 and the *Pittwater 21 Development Control Plan (DCP)*.

Note that this HIS has been prepared to address built heritage only, with any Aboriginal cultural heritage management out of the scope of this report.

1.5. AUTHOR IDENTIFICATION

The following report has been prepared by Annabelle Cooper (Heritage Consultant) and updated by Darrienne Wyndham (Heritage Consultant). Ashleigh Persian (Associate Director) has reviewed and endorsed its content.

Unless otherwise stated, all drawings, illustrations and photographs are the work of Urbis.

1.6. THE PROPOSAL

The proposal seeks to demolish the existing buildings on the site and construct a six-level mixed-use development including one level of basement carparking, ground level retail and 7 apartments across four levels of residential floorspace.

Urbis has been provided with updated drawing documentation prepared by Koichi Takada Architects on 29 August 2023. This HIS has relied on these plans for the impact assessment included in Section 5. Extracts of the proposed plans are also provided overleaf. Full size plans should be referred to for detail.

Table 1 - Provided Plans

Author	Drawing No.	Drawing Name	Revision	Date
Koichi Takada Architects	A0000	Cover Page	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0001	Project Summary	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0002	Perspective 01	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0003	Perspective 02	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0004	Perspective 03	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0010	Context Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0011	Site Analysis Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0012	Site Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0013	Demolition Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0099	Basement 1 – Floor Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0100	Ground Floor – Floor Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0101	Level 01 – Floor Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0102	Level 02 – Floor Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0103	Level 03 – Floor Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0104	Level 04 – Floor Plan	С	29 August 2023

Koichi Takada Architects	A0105	Roof Plan – Floor Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0200	West Elevation (Barrenjoey Road)	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0201	North Elevation (Side)	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0202	East Elevation (Rear)	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0203	South Elevation (Side)	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0300	Section 01	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0301	Section 02	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0302	Section 03	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0400	Gross Floor Area Diagrams	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0410	Cross Ventilation Diagram	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0411	Solar Access Diagram	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0412	Sun Eye View Diagram – 21 June	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0413	Sun Eye View Diagram – 21 Dec	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0431	10m Height Plan Diagram	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0440	Excavation Diagram	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0450	Landscape Area Diagram	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0460	ESD Strategy	С	29 August 2023

Koichi Takada Architects	A0470	Shadow Diagrams – 1	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0471	Shadow Diagrams – 2	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0472	Shadow Diagrams – 3	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0480	View Analysis – Location Plan	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0481	View Analysis – View 01	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0482	View Analysis – View 02	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0483	View Analysis – View 03	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0484	View Analysis – View 04	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0485	View Analysis – View 05	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0486	View Analysis – View 06	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0487	View Analysis – View 07	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0488	View Analysis – View 08	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0489	View Analysis – View 09	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0490	View Analysis – View 10	С	29 August 2023
Koichi Takada Architects	A0500	Materials Sample Board	С	29 August 2023



Figure 3 - Extract from Perspective 01.

Source: Koichi Takada Architects



Figure 4 - Extract from Perspective 02.



Figure 5 - Extract from Perspective 03.

Source: Koichi Takada Architects







Figure 7 - Extract from Ground Floor Plan. Note: the heritage preservation area refers to an area of Aboriginal cultural significance and is not within the scope of this report.

Source: Koichi Takada Architects



Figure 8 - Extract from West Elevation.



Figure 9 - Extract from North Elevation (Side).

Source: Koichi Takada Architects



Figure 10 - Extract from South Elevation (Side).



Figure 11 - Extract from East Elevation (Rear).

Source: Koichi Takada Architects





2. SITE DESCRIPTION

2.1. SITE SETTING

Barrenjoey Road is a two-way street extending through the northern beaches, terminating at Beach Road and the northern end of the Palm Beach peninsula. The peninsular is characterised by the beach front, bushlands, coastal cliffs, and Barrenjoey Head. Residential development is concentrated along the centre of the peninsular at Whale Beach, and further north Palm Beach.

The subject site is located on the western side of Barrenjoey Road on the western side of the Palm Beach peninsula. The subject site is located just south of the pedestrian crossing leading to the beach and carpark. Barrenjoey Road is characterised by predominantly residential development with a small commercial strip of commercial development located opposite the beach front. The commercial development along Barrenjoey Road comprised a fish and chip outlet (now demolished) at the southern end of the strip; followed by Barrenjoey House further north. The subject site is located immediately north of local heritage item Barrenjoey House.

Barrenjoey House comprises a "two-storey plastered brick building with pitched roof, built as a guest house in 1923. It features a sunny dining room with windows the length of one wall overlooking the water and a large terrace with canvas canopy for dinning. The interior retains traditional character including wallpaper and emu chandeliers."¹

East of the subject site, is local heritage item *Winten (house)*, accessed via Palm Beach Road which runs above Barrenjoey Road to the east. Winten is located on a steep site, with the view from the street screened by luxuriant vegetation creating a natural bush setting. Winten is a single storey cottage weatherboard to sill, asbestos sheet and battens with shingle gabled roof and casement windows."²



Figure 13 – Overview of site setting with the subject site outlined in red.

¹ State Heritage Register inventory form for "Barrenjoey House" (restaurant and accommodation).

² State Heritage Register inventory form for "Winten" (house).



Figure 14 - View south along Barrenjoey Road from the subject site. Barrenjoey House marked with a red arrow.

Figure 15 - View north along Barrenjoey Road from the subject site.

Source: Google Street View

Source: Google Street View

2.2. SITE DESCRIPTION

The subject site comprises several commercial shops which are currently vacant. The site includes the above ground carpark to the south accessed via Barrenjoey Road. The south-eastern portion of the site contains substantial vegetation.

An ancillary dwelling is located in the north-eastern quadrant of the site. The subject site does not contain any heritage items.



Figure 16 - View of subject site from Barrenjoey Road with Barrenjoey house indicated.

Source: Google Street View



Figure 17 - View of carpark from Barrenjoey Road. Source: Google Street View



Figure 18 - Existing commercial buildings on site, now vacated.

Source: Google Street View

3. HISTORICAL OVERVIEW

The following history has been reproduced from Virginia Macleod's contribution to The Dictionary of Sydney dated 2008.

3.1. AREA HISTORY

Palm Beach

The northern most coastal suburb of metropolitan Sydney, Palm Beach is in the Pittwater local government area, on the Barrenjoey Peninsula. It is renowned as a holiday spot for the rich and famous. Its stunning natural beauty is the setting for some spectacular houses, many with views to Pittwater or the Pacific Ocean.

Early History

The suburb was named after the cabbage tree palms, Livistona australis, which were common in the area an put to good use by the original residents, the Guringai People. Twisting strips of cabbage tree bark into lines, they were able to catch plenty of fish, from the shore and in the water too, patching leaks in their canoes with palm fronds. Their temporary shelters were roofed with palm leaves too.

The land now known as Palm Beach, Barrenjoey and most of Whale Beach was granted to James Napper in 1816, and on a map of 182 the southern end of the ocean beach is marked as Cabbage Tree Boat Harbour, a name it still bears today.

Fishing & Smuggling

In the early part of the nineteenth century, the isthmus was home to a few fishermen, who lived at Snapperman Beach, catching and drying fish. The Sydney Morning Herald noted in March 1867:

"On the eastern side of Pitt Water, between Barrenjoey and the farm of Mr Collins, there is a fishing station, of Chinese and Europeans, and even here the neatness of the huts and the care bestowed on the cultivation of flowers are really pleasing to contemplate."

To discourage smuggling into Broken Bay, the colonial government built a customs house at the base of the headland on the western (Pittwater) shore of the isthmus in 1843. Then, in 1881, it purchased the northernmost part of the isthmus, on which it built a stone lighthouse, designed by colonial architect James Barnet, to alert shipping to the entrance to Broken Bay and the Pittwater. The Barrenjoey lighthouse still stands.

Residential Development

In 1900 all the remaining land was divided into 18 large blocks and listed for sale as 'good grazing land', but none were sold. Then, in 1912, the land was again put up for sale in smaller residential blocks and marketed as offering 'fishing, sailing, golf and rowing'. All blocks were sold. Most houses were built from local sandstone, but other materials had to be shipped in. Some houses were built as guesthouses, but most were second homes for those Sydneysiders who could afford them.

Development of the area was slow, because of its isolation and poor transport connections. Author Nancy Phelan has recounted her memories of visiting the area in the early decades of the twentieth century:

"When I first went to Palm Beach with my Aunt Amy there was no through road. We took trams to The Spit, to Manly, to Narrabeen, then a primitive bus over terrible roads to Newport harbour and a launch across Pittwater to Palm Beach, landing at Gow's Store...The journey took hours, but it was beautiful..."³

As Phelan notes, for many years Palm Beach wharf was virtually the only access point, reached by boat from either Newport or Bayview. As well, there was a ferry from Manly, which took day-trippers to Broken Bay.

Since World War II, the area has become more residential, but still remains a secluded peninsula, despite improved communications, including a seaplane wharf, for those who can afford this commuter transport to the centre of the city of Sydney.

³ Nancy Phelan, Setting out on the voyage: the world of an incorrigible adventurer, University of Queensland Press, St Lucia Qld, 1998.

The subject site originally formed part of the Crown grant awarded to James Napper in March 1816. By 1912, the land had been transferred to The Barrenjoey Company Ltd). In 1925, much of the land on the peninsular was subdivided for residential development under the ownership of Palm Beach Lands Limited. Over the course of the twentieth century land along the peninsular continued to be subdivided and developed. The subject site is yet to be developed and remains a vegetated slope extending from the rear of properties along Pacific Road west, down to the rear of a Fish and Chips outlet. Horden lived at Kalua, opposite the beach. Palm Beach Surf Life Saving Club, which was established in 1921, now has four houses on the beachfront.



Figure 19 - Advertisement for the Palm Beach Estate.

Source: Construction: Weekly Supplement to Building; Monday 16th December 1912, Page 8



Figure 20 - Barrenjoey Lighthouse, Palm Beach c1900-1910.

Source: State Library of New South Wales.



Figure 21 - Beach Culture at Palm Beach 1960s. Source: National Library of Australia, Jeff Carter.



Figure 22 - Oblique aerial view of Palm Beach, 2008.

Source: Airview; 0809-1620-39

3.2. SITE HISTORY

The subject site originally formed part of the land awarded to James Napper by Crown Grant in March 1816. In September 1912, the Barrenjoey Company Limited purchased a large portion of the peninsular (Figure 18).

The Barrenjoey Company began subdividing the land along the peninsula, including the land comprising the subject site which was subdivided sometime between 1912 and 1918. In 1918, Edith Muriel Maitland Swain, a spinster of Wollstonecraft purchased 2 parcels of land along Barrenjoey Road; lot 16 further north along the beachfront strip and lot 36, which would later form part of the subject site being lots 1, 2, 3 and 4 (Figure 19 to Figure 22). She subsequently purchased the land that would become lot 6 in October 1925.

The land that would become lot 5 of the subject site was purchased by The Mona Vale Land Company in 1905, before it was transferred to Alfred Birkett in April 1906.

Lot 5 was purchased by Edith Annie McDonald in February 1927. Estella McKechnie purchased lot 6 in November 1927 and lot 5 in September 1928. In November 1948, Joseph Tedeschi Wilson purchased lots 5 and 6 (Figure 23). By September 1950, lots 5 and 6 has been purchased by Craven and Ada Benn as joint tenants.

Between 1950 and 1981 the allotments were amalgamated into one site. In 1981 the site was purchased jointly by Harry, Maria & Tony Anastasopoulos. The site today comprises 1 single allotment (Figure 24).



Figure 23 Land owned by The Barrenjoey Company 1912. Source: NSW HLRV Vol: 2289 Fol: 43



Figure 24 - Certificate of title Vol: 10688 Fol: 176 Source: Dye & Durham



Figure 26 - Certificate of title Vol: 10688 Fol: 178. Source: Dye & Durham



Figure 25 - Certificate of title Vol: 10688 Fol: 177 Source: Dye & Durham



Figure 27 - Certificate of title Vol: 10688 Fol: 179 Source: Dye & Durham



Figure 28 - Certificate of title Vol: 10822 Fol: 1. Source: Dye & Durham

BORTES CO CHOC 7 D. P. 14538 1362 m² 37 D. P. 14538 10 Join 966 (B) 11 II 10 Join 966 (B) 13 62 m² 13 62 m² 13 62 m² 13 62 m² 10 Join 966 (B) 10 Join 966 (

Figure 29 - Certificate of title Vol: 12527 Fol: 3. Source: Dye & Durham

3.3. **PROPERTY OWNERS**

Table 2 - Property Owners

Reference	Owner	Date		
Lots 1,2,3 & 4 (formerly lots 34, 35 & 36)				
Crown Grant	James Napper	March 1816		
Vol: 2289 Fol: 43	The Barrenjoey Company Limited	September 1912		
Vol: 2823 Fol: 150	Edith Murial Matiland Swain	Feb 1918 – Oct 1925		
Vol: 2823 Fol: 150 (lot 36)	Charles Edward Blanks	March 1929		
Lot 5				
Vol: 1621 Fol: 203	The Mona Vale Land Company	July 1905		
Vol: 1621 Fol: 203	Alfred Birkett	April 1906		
Vol: 3972 Fol: 148	Edith Annie McDonald	Feb 1927		
Vol: 4195-165	Estella McKechnie	Sept 1928		
Vol: 5900 Fol: 126 (lot 5)	Joseph Tedeschi Wilson	Nov 1948		
Lot 6				
Vol: 3792 Fol: 148	Edith Muriel Maitland Swain	Oct 1925		
Vol: 4079 Fol: 99	Estella McKechnie	Nov 1927		
Vol: 5900 Fol: 128 (lot 6)	Joseph Tedeschi Wilson	Nov 1948		

Lot	5	&	6

Vol: 5900 Fol 126-129 inclusive	Craven Benn & Ada Benn as joint tenants	Sept 1950
Amalgamated Lots as the subject site		
Vol: 12572 Fol: 3	Harry, Maria & Tony Anastasopoulos	July 1981

3.4. DATE OF CONSTRUCTION

The buildings located on the subject site were likely constructed during the mid-to-late 20th century, after the amalgamation of the allotments (post 1950).

4. HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

4.1. WHAT IS HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE?

Before making decisions to change a heritage item, an item within a heritage conservation area, or an item located in proximity to a heritage listed item, it is important to understand its values and the values of its context. This leads to decisions that will retain these values in the future. Statements of heritage significance summarise the heritage values of a place – why it is important and why a statutory listing was made to protect these values.

4.2. SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT

The Heritage Council of NSW has developed a set of seven criteria for assessing heritage significance, which can be used to make decisions about the heritage value of a place or item. There are two levels of heritage significance used in NSW: state and local. The following assessment of heritage significance has been prepared in accordance with the 'Assessing Heritage Significance' guides.

Table 3 Assessment of Heritage Significance

Criteria	Significance Assessment
A – Historical Significance An item is important in the course or pattern of the local area's cultural or natural history.	The subject site originally formed part of the James Napper's Crown Grant (1816). While the land is inherently associated with the broader development of the Palm Beach peninsula, the buildings located on the site today maintain no meaningful association with the areas local history. The subject site is a pedestrian example of mid-to-late 20 th century development. There is no evidence of the subject site being connected to any particularly important historical phase or event. Accordingly the subject site does not meet the requisite threshold for heritage listing under criterion A.
Guidelines for Inclusion	Guidelines for Exclusion
 shows evidence of a significant human activity	 has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important activities or processes provides evidence of activities or processes that are of dubious historical importance has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
B – Associative Significance An item has strong or special associations with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the local area's cultural or natural history.	The subject site does not maintain any meaningful association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons of importance to the suburb of Palm Beach. The subject site does not meet the requisite threshold for heritage listing under criterion B.

Criteria	Significance Assessment
Guidelines for Inclusion	Guidelines for Exclusion
 shows evidence of a significant human occupation 	 has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important people or events
 is associated with a significant event, person, or group of persons 	 provides evidence of people or events that are of dubious historical importance has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
C – Aesthetic Significance An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in the local area.	The subject site is of simple construction and does not effectively demonstrate any particular aesthetic characteristics or high degree of technical merit. The subject site does not meet the requisite threshold for heritage listing under criterion C.
Guidelines for Inclusion	Guidelines for Exclusion
 shows or is associated with, creative or technical innovation or achievement 	 is not a major work by an important designer or artist
 is the inspiration for a creative or technical innovation or achievement 	 has lost its design or technical integrity
 is aesthetically distinctive has landmark qualities 	 its positive visual or sensory appeal or landmark and scenic qualities have been more than temporarily degraded
 exemplifies a particular taste, style or technology 	 has only a loose association with a creative or technical achievement
D – Social Significance An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in the local area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.	The subject site has likely been the location of a small group of commercial outlets since the amalgamation of the allotments sometime between 1950 and 1981. The subject site does not demonstrate any identifiable, meaningful associations with the community of Palm Beach, or any other particular cultural group of the local area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. The subject site does not meet the requisite threshold for
	heritage listing under criterion D.
Guidelines for Inclusion	Guidelines for Exclusion
 is important for its associations with an identifiable group 	 is only important to the community for amenity reasons
■ is important to a community's sense of place	 is retained only in preference to a proposed alternative

Criteria	Significance Assessment
E – Research Potential An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the local area's cultural or natural history.	The subject site has been constructed using conventional materials and techniques. The site is therefore limited in its potential to yield meaningful information about the cultural and/or natural history of Palm Beach. The subject site does not meet the requisite threshold for heritage listing under criterion E.
Guidelines for Inclusion	Guidelines for Exclusion
 has the potential to yield new or further substantial scientific and/or archaeological information 	 the knowledge gained would be irrelevant to research on science, human history or culture
 is an important benchmark or reference site or type 	 has little archaeological or research potential
 provides evidence of past human cultures that is unavailable elsewhere 	 only contains information that is readily available from other resources or archaeological sites
F – Rarity An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the local area's cultural or natural history.	The buildings that comprise the subject site are pedestrian examples of mid-to-late 20 th century development that have been highly altered to accommodate contemporary construction. The subject site cannot be considered rare in this context. The subject site does not meet the requisite threshold for heritage listing under criterion F.
Guidelines for Inclusion	Guidelines for Exclusion
 provides evidence of a defunct custom, way of life or process demonstrates a process, custom or other human activity that is in danger of being lost shows unusually accurate evidence of a significant human activity is the only example of its type demonstrates designs or techniques of exceptional interest shows rare evidence of a significant human activity important to a community 	 is not rare is numerous but under threat
G – Representative An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSWs (or the local area's):	The subject site comprises various mid-to-late-20 th century buildings which have been highly altered to accommodate contemporary development. The buildings located on the

Criteria	Significance Assessment
 cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments. 	subject site do not reflect well the characteristics of any particular typology. The subject site does not meet the requisite threshold for heritage listing under criterion G.
Guidelines for Inclusion	Guidelines for Exclusion
■ is a fine example of its type □	■ is a poor example of its type □
 has the principal characteristics of an important class or group of items 	 does not include or has lost the range of characteristics of a type
 has attributes typical of a particular way of life, philosophy, custom, significant process, design, technique or activity 	 does not represent well the characteristics that make up a significant variation of a type
• is a significant variation to a class of items \Box	
 is part of a group which collectively illustrates a representative type 	
 is outstanding because of its setting, condition or size 	
 is outstanding because of its integrity or the esteem in which it is held 	

4.3. STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

The subject site comprises several buildings of late-20th century development; which have been highly altered to facilitate contemporary development. The buildings on the subject site are limited in their technical or creative merit. The buildings on the subject site make no positive historical or aesthetic contribution to the Palm Beach peninsula. The buildings at 1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road are considered to have neutral impact on the immediate streetscape.

The subject site does not meet any of the requisite thresholds for heritage listing under the Heritage NSW criteria.

5. IMPACT ASSESSMENT

Below, the potential impact of the proposal is assessed against the applicable heritage-related statutory and non-statutory planning controls which relate to the site and the proposed development.

5.1. STATUTORY CONTROLS

5.1.1. Pittwater Local Environmental Plan 2014

The table below provides and assessment of the proposal against the relevant provision for heritage conservation as found in the Pittwater LEP 2014.

Table 4 - Assessment against the Pittwater Local Environmental Plan 2014

Clause	Response
 (1) Objectives The objectives of this clause are as follows: (a) to conserve the environmental heritage of Palm Beach (b) to conserve the heritage significance of heritage items and heritage conservation areas, including associated fabric, settings and views, (c) to conserve archaeological sites, (d) to conserve Aboriginal objects and Aboriginal places of heritage significance 	The assessment carried out in this HIS indicates the proposed works would have no impact on the heritage significance of vicinity items <i>Barrenjoey House</i> located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach and to a lesser extent <i>Winten (house)</i> , located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach. The scale, profile and materiality of the proposed development would not detract from or obscure significant elements of the heritage items, ensuring their historical contribution to the area remains unchanged.
 (2) Requirement for consent Development consent is required for any of the following: (a) demolishing or moving any of the following or altering the exterior of any of the following (including, in the case of a building, making changes to its detail, fabric, finish or appearance): (i) a heritage item, (ii) an Aboriginal object, (iii) a building, work, relic or tree within a heritage conservation area, (b) altering a heritage item that is a building by making structural changes to its interior or by making changes to anything inside the item that is specified in Schedule 5 in relation to the item, (c) disturbing or excavating an archaeological site while knowing, or having reasonable cause to suspect, that the 	The proposed development involves the demolition of the existing buildings on site to facilitate the construction of a six-level mixed use development including one level of basement carparking, ground level retail and 7 apartments across four levels of residential floorspace. This HIS has been prepared to assess the impact of the proposed development on local heritage items <i>Barrenjoey House</i> located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach and to a lesser extent <i>Winten (house)</i> , located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach.

Clause	Response
relic being discovered, exposed, moved, damaged or destroyed,	
(d) disturbing or excavating an Aboriginal place of heritage significance,	
(e) erecting a building on land:	
(i) on which a heritage item is located or that is within a heritage conservation area, or	
(ii) on which an Aboriginal object is located or that is within an Aboriginal place of heritage significance,	
(f) subdividing land:	
(i) on which a heritage item is located or that is within a heritage conservation area, or	
(ii) on which an Aboriginal object is located or that is within an Aboriginal place of heritage significance.	
(4) Effect of proposed development on heritage significance	This HIS has been prepared to allow the consent authority Northern Beaches Council to ascertain the
The consent authority must, before granting consent under this clause in respect of a heritage item or heritage conservation area, consider the effect of the proposed development on the heritage significance of the item or area concerned. This subclause applies regardless of whether a heritage management document is prepared under subclause (5) or a heritage conservation management plan is submitted under subclause (6).	degree to which the proposed development would impact the significance of vicinity items <i>Barrenjoey House</i> located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach and to a lesser extent <i>Winten (house),</i> located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach. The assessment included below concludes there is to be no impact on the above heritage items as a result of the development at 1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach.

5.2. PITTWATER 21 DEVELOPMENT CONTROL PLAN

The table below assesses the proposal against the relevant objective and provisions for heritage conservation as found in the Pittwater 21 DCP.

Table 5 - Assessment against the Pittwater 21 DCP

Provision	Response
B1 Heritage Controls	
B1.2 Heritage Conservation – Development in the vicinity of heritage items, heritage conservation areas, archaeological sites or potential archaeological sites	
C1. Any development application involving work likely to impact the heritage significance of a heritage item, heritage conservation area, archaeological site or potential archaeological site is to be accompanied by a Statement of Heritage Impact prepared by an appropriately qualified heritage professional. Guidance on preparing a Heritage Impact Statement (Statement of Heritage Impact) is available at NSW Office of Environment & Heritage in the NSW Heritage Manual or superseding publication.	This Heritage Impact Statement has been prepared to allow the consent authority, Northern Beaches Council, to ascertain the degree to which the proposed development may impact the heritage significance of locally listed item <i>Barrenjoey House</i> located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach and to a lesser extent <i>Winten (house),</i> located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach under the Pittwater LEP 2014. This Heritage Impact Statement finds the proposed development at 1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road to have no adverse impact on the above vicinity items and is therefore supported from a heritage perspective.
C2. Developments in the vicinity of a heritage item, heritage conservation area, archaeological site or potential archaeological site are to be designed to respect and complement the heritage significance in terms of the building envelope, proportions, materials, colours and finishes, and building alignment.	The proposed development at 1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road is assessed to be a considered response to existing surrounding development, including local heritage items, <i>Barrenjoey House</i> and <i>Wintern (house)</i> . The proposed development is to span 6 levels, 5 above ground, staggered in a recessive, terraced arrangement. The proposed development employs a modest, contemporary profile. The terraced form steps away from the street frontage, ensuring a diminishing scale and profile in its presentation to Barrenjoey Road. The bulk of the development is appropriately directed to the rear ensuring development along the beachfront including Barrenjoey House is not overwhelmed or overshadowed. The proposed development ensures appropriate proportions consistent with surrounding development. In conjunction with the terraced form, the profile and alignment of the development ensures heritage items are adequately interpreted such that their contribution to the Palm Beach peninsular remains unaffected. The proposed development employs low-impact, contemporary materials and finishes including lightweight timber awnings and soft greenery. The character of the development is generally compatible with the natural and

Provision	Response
	built environment. The façade articulation employs soft curvilinear forms, sympathetic to the natural features of the peninsula whilst remaining visually contemporary against the historic character of Barrenjoey House.
 C3. Developments in the vicinity of a heritage item, heritage conservation area, archaeological site or potential archaeological site are to minimise the impact on the heritage significance by providing: an adequate buffer zone, 	The proposed development is located immediately north of Barrenjoey House and below (west) of local item <i>Wintern.</i> The proposed development is sited close to the street frontage along Barrenjoey Road. The terraced form of the building ensures the bulk of the development is concentrated towards the rear of the site such that the building appears recessed into the escarpment behind. The natural slope of the site ensures buildings to the rear along Palm Beach Road and those at street level along Barrenjoey Road are sufficiently interpreted. The physical curtilage around the heritage items is therefore preserved and their contribution to the character of the Palm Beach Peninsula maintained.
 maintaining and respecting significant views to and from the heritage item, heritage conservation area, archaeological site or potential archaeological site. 	Views towards Barrenjoey House from the beachfront are assessed to remain unchanged as a result of the proposal. Additionally, the proposed development ensures views from the south looking north towards Barrenjoey House remain uninterrupted. The massing of Barrenjoey House is concentrated along the street frontage whilst the proposed building ensures development is terraced over a recessive form set back into the naturally sloping land. As such, views to Barrenjoey House from the north are to remain unimpacted.
	Development associated with the subject site is found to have no impact to primary view catchment areas of Barrenjoey House. Furthermore, the proposed development will be somewhat concealed as a result of the heavily vegetated slope to the rear and the proposed additional landscaping, further reducing visual impact to Barrenjoey House from the north.

5.3. HERITAGE NSW GUIDELINES

The proposed works are addressed in relation to relevant questions posed in Heritage NSW's (former Heritage Office/Heritage Division) 'Statement of Heritage Impact' guidelines.

Table 6 - Heritage NSW Guidelines

Clause	Discussion
Clause The following aspects of the proposal respect or enhance the heritage significance of the item or conservation area for the following reasons:	 Discussion The proposed development at 1112-1116 Barrenjoey Road does not contain any heritage items. It is located immediately north of local heritage item Barrenjoey House and west of <i>Wintern (house)</i>. The proposed development employs a strong recessive form ensuring minimal visual and physical impact to the small commercial strip opposite the beach front. The proposed development remains adequately separated from heritage item <i>Wintern</i> (east) by a row of residential development to the rear of the subject site. The development is assessed to have no impact on the heritage significance of local heritage item <i>Wintern</i>. The terraced form is set well into the sloping site reducing physical and visual bulk to both Barrenjoey Road and Palm Beach Road development. The terraced form ensures the profile and character of Barrenjoey House remains uninterrupted when viewed from street level. As such the development is assessed to have no adverse impact on the contribution of these items to the character of the Palm Beach Peninsula.
	The proposed development employs appropriately contemporary materials and finishes including glass, masonry, light-weight timber awnings and landscaping. The façade articulation remains detailed, relying on a sleek curvilinear profile. The development remains distinct from the historic character of Barrenjoey House and is at no risk of overwhelming the site. The lightweight, diminishing appearance of the development additionally benefits from heavily vegetated surrounds. The proposed development is found to have no adverse impact on the heritage significance of local item <i>Wintern</i> , located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach or Barrenjoey House, situated at 1108 Barrenjoey Road,
	Palm Beach.
The following aspects of the proposal could detrimentally impact on heritage significance. The reasons are explained as well as the measures to be taken to minimise impacts:	The proposed development offers a considered response to the vicinity heritage items. The contemporary scheme mitigates heritage impacts by employing appropriate form, scale, profiles and materiality.

Clause	Discussion
The following sympathetic solutions have been considered and discounted for the following reasons:	The proposed development is assessed to have no impact on vicinity heritage items. No further sympathetic solutions have been considered or discounted for this reason.
 New development adjacent to a heritage item How does the new development affect views to, and from, the heritage item? What has been done to minimise negative effects? How is the impact of the new development on the heritage significance of the item or area to be minimised? Why is the new development required to be adjacent to a heritage item? How does the curtilage allowed around the heritage item contribute to the retention of its heritage significance? Is the development sited on any known, or potentially significant archaeological deposits? If so, have alternative sites been considered? Why were they rejected? Is the new development sympathetic to the heritage item? In what way (e.g. form, siting, proportions, design)? Will the additions visually dominate the heritage item? How has this been minimised? Will the public, and users of the item, still be able to view and appreciate its significance? 	The proposed development employs a terraced form, softened by contemporary curves. Massing is concentrated towards the rear of the site, away from Barrenjoey Road. The building generally appears recessive, benefiting from the heavily vegetated sloping site. The development employs a contemporary aesthetic comprising glass and masonry, light-weight batten-style screening and low-impact greenery. The proposed materials are sympathetic to the natural setting of Palm Beach and generally contribute to a recessive, diminishing profile. The development employs appropriate contemporary materials that do not detract from or obscure the character of neighbouring heritage items. The proposed façade articulation relies on contemporary curves, arranged over a stepped profile. The curvilinear detailing remains sympathetic to the beachfront setting, whilst the stepped profile preserves existing views up and down the commercial strip. The development remains separated from local heritage item <i>Wintern</i> (east of the subject site. As, such <i>Wintern</i> remains adequately interpreted with sufficient curtilage such that its contribution to the Palm Beach peninsula remains unchanged. Along the beachfront at ground level, views from the south towards heritage item <i>Barrenjoey House</i> are assessed to remain unimpacted by the proposed development. Views from the beachfront (west) towards <i>Barrenjoey House</i> is concentrated along the street frontage. The massing of the proposed development ensures the profile and character of <i>Barrenjoey House</i> remain unobscured when viewed from the north. Additionally, the development ensures appropriate visual and physical curtilage around <i>Barrenjoey House</i> such that its contribution to the development ensures appropriate visual and physical curtilage around <i>Barrenjoey House</i> such that its contribution to the development ensures approprise visual and physical curtilage around

Clause	Discussion
	character of the Palm Beach peninsula remains unchanged.
	The proposed development responds appropriately to the natural and built environment of Palm Beach. The development remains appropriately contemporary, ensuring it does not detract from or obscure the character of surrounding heritage items. The development is assessed to have no impact on the heritage significance of vicinity items <i>Barrenjoey House</i> located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach and to a lesser extent <i>Winten (house),</i> located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach.

6. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A detailed impact assessment of the proposed works has been undertaken in Section 5 of this report. The proposed development has been assessed to have no impact on the heritage significance of local item *Wintern (house)* located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach (east of the subject site), or *Barrenjoey House* located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach (immediately south of the subject site).

Key aspects of the proposal assessment are listed below:

- The subject site does not contain any heritage items of built heritage identified under Schedule 5, Part 1 of the Pittwater LEP 2014. It is, however, located immediately south of local heritage item *Barrenjoey House*, located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road Palm Beach and west of local heritage item *Wintern (house)*, located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach. The site is not located within a heritage conservation area.
- The proposed façade articulation relies on a sleek curvilinear profile arranged over a terraced form, ensuring the bulk of the development is concentrated away from the street frontage, concealed by the heavily vegetated sloping site. The curved detailing remains sympathetic to the natural landscape of Palm Beach while the recessive, diminishing profile ensures neighbouring heritage items are adequately interpreted.
- The development employs a contemporary aesthetic comprising glass and masonry, light-weight battenstyle screening and low-impact greenery. The proposed materials are sympathetic to the natural setting of Palm Beach and generally contribute to a recessive, diminishing profile. Proposed materials and finishes are appropriately contemporary and do not detract from or obscure the character of neighbouring heritage items.
- The proposed development ensures adequate visual and physical separation from the heritage items. Local item *Wintern* remains separated from the development by a row of residential development to the rear of the subject site. The development is assessed to have no impact on the heritage significance of *Wintern*.
- The stepped profile of the proposed development ensures the bulk of the site does not visually intrude on the profile or character of *Barrenjoey House*. As such, views to and from *Barrenjoey House* are preserved along the commercial strip and beachfront. The development is assessed to have no impact on the heritage significance of *Barrenjoey House*.

Overall, the proposed development is assessed to have no adverse impact on neighbouring heritage items *Wintern*, located at 21 Palm Beach Road, Palm Beach and *Barrenjoey House*, located at 1108 Barrenjoey Road, Palm Beach.

For the reasons outlined above, the proposed works are recommended for approval from a heritage perspective.

7. **BIBLIOGRAPHY AND REFERENCES**

7.1. **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

NSW Department of Finance and Services, Spatial Services, available at: https://maps.six.nsw.gov.au/

Google Maps 2020, Aerial view of subject site, available at: ">http://maps.google.com.au/maps?hl=en&tab=wl>.

Nancy Phelan, Setting out on the voyage: the world of an incorrigible adventurer, University of Queensland Press, St Lucia Qld, 1998.

7.2. REFERENCES

Apperly, R., Irving, R. and Reynolds, P. (eds) 2002, A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present, Angus and Robertson, Pymble.

Australia ICOMOS 1999, The Burra Charter: 2013 The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, Australia ICOMOS, Burwood.

Heritage Office and Department of Urban Affairs & Planning 1996, NSW Heritage Manual, Heritage Office and Department of Urban Affairs & Planning (NSW), Sydney.

Heritage Office 2001, Assessing Heritage Significance, Heritage Office, Parramatta.

[Note: Some government departments have changed their names over time and the above publications state the name at the time of publication.]

DISCLAIMER

This report is dated 31 August 2023 and incorporates information and events up to that date only and excludes any information arising, or event occurring, after that date which may affect the validity of Urbis Pty Ltd **(Urbis)** opinion in this report. Urbis prepared this report on the instructions, and for the benefit only, of Palmdev Pty Ltd **(Instructing Party)** for the purpose of a development application **(Purpose)** and not for any other purpose or use. To the extent permitted by applicable law, Urbis expressly disclaims all liability, whether direct or indirect, to the Instructing Party which relies or purports to rely on this report for any purpose other than the Purpose, and to any other person which relies or purports to rely on this report for any purpose whatsoever (including the Purpose).

In preparing this report, Urbis was required to make judgements which may be affected by unforeseen future events, the likelihood and effects of which are not capable of precise assessment.

All surveys, forecasts, projections and recommendations contained in or associated with this report are made in good faith and on the basis of information supplied to Urbis at the date of this report, and upon which Urbis relied. Achievement of the projections and budgets set out in this report will depend, among other things, on the actions of others over which Urbis has no control.

In preparing this report, Urbis may rely on or refer to documents in a language other than English, which Urbis may arrange to be translated. Urbis is not responsible for the accuracy or completeness of such translations and disclaims any liability for any statement or opinion made in this report being inaccurate or incomplete arising from such translations.

Whilst Urbis has made all reasonable inquiries it believes necessary in preparing this report, it is not responsible for determining the completeness or accuracy of information provided to it. Urbis (including its officers and personnel) is not liable for any errors or omissions, including in information provided by the Instructing Party or another person or upon which Urbis relies, provided that such errors or omissions are not made by Urbis recklessly or in bad faith.

This report has been prepared with due care and diligence by Urbis and the statements and opinions given by Urbis in this report are given in good faith and in the reasonable belief that they are correct and not misleading, subject to the limitations above.