
From: Lance Doyle [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, 31 July 2023 4:12 PM
To: Planning Panels - Northern Beaches
Subject: NBLPP 2ND AUGUST ITEM 5.4 Mod 2023/0171 1191 BARRENJOEY ROAD PALM BEACH
Attachments: LETTER TO NBLPP JULY 2023 RE MOD .pdf; JULY 2023 ENGINEERS ADVICE RE MOD FOR BOATHOUSE.pdf; Heritage Advice_Mod2023-0171_1191-1193 Barrenjoey Rd, Palm Beach.pdf

Categories: NBLPP

Please see attached correspondence for the consideration of the NBLPP Panel members over item 5.4 of Wednesdays meeting.

Kind regards

LANCE DOYLE

B.AppSc (UWS), M.Plan (UTS), RPIA, EPLA

REGISTERED PLANNER

[REDACTED]
DOYLE CONSULTING GROUP



Doyle Consulting Group

Planning and Development Services

ABN: 55278784425



31st July 2023

The General Manager

Northern Beaches Council

By email planningpanels@northernbeaches.nsw.gov.au

Re Mod 2023/0171

Address: 1191 Barrenjoey Road Palm Beach & 1193 Barrenjoey Road Palm Beach

Description: Modification of Development Consent DA2021/0669

Dear Panel members,

I am writing to you on behalf of The Trustee for London Lakes Trust, the applicant for the above modification,

This matter is listed for consideration by the NBLPP at its meeting of Wednesday 2nd August as Item 5.4.

The assessment of the proposal by an independent consultant is positive however the recommendation by Councils Heritage Advisor that the window and door leaves are to be constructed from wood to match frames and reveals has raised several issues and the purpose of this letter is to request the Panel to consider the implications of this condition if imposed and also the basis upon which this condition is proposed.

The condition as contained on page 346 of the agenda reads as follows -

38A. Window and Door Leaves

Window and door leaves are to be constructed from wood to match frames and reveals.

Details demonstrating compliance with the condition are to be provided to the Principal Certifying Authority

Reason: Maintenance of the heritage character of the building.

The concerns raised over this suggested condition are as follows-

The subject building, namely the Boathouse, was clearly described by councils' heritage advisor at the time as having no heritage value stating *Its significance is embodied in its provision of recreational uses, and their continued provision for the users of Governor Phillip Park and Pittwater since 1947.*

Since that time, the entirety of the building and supporting structure has been removed and replaced with contemporary materials however importantly retaining the original characteristics of the now demolished building. Therefore, the current building is not an item of heritage value.

As you will be aware from your site visit prior to the meeting, the building is nearing completion and has been constructed in accordance with the approved Schedule of Finishes endorsed by council in accordance with Condition 24 of the parent development consent. The approved Schedule of Finishes noted that windows are to be timber framed. No reference was made to the leaves of the windows or the doors being required to be constructed of timber and as such all windows and doors have been constructed in accordance with the Schedule of Finishes.

It is also important to note that the windows of the existing building prior to demolition were of aluminium.

The principle reason that the previous windows were of aluminium construction is the fact that the location of this building is in an environment that can best be termed as hostile due to its

significant risk from weather being exposed to significant prevailing winds, particularly from the South. along with permanent affectations from salt spray due to the building being constructed over the Pittwater waterway.

Importantly, the design life of the structure, as required by the consent is for a minimum of 50 years from the date of completion. The windows and all other materials being installed under the terms of the consent must satisfy this design life criteria. Further information on this aspect is contained within the attached letter from the qualified engineer overseeing the design and construction of the approved development.

To summarise, the proposed modifications are minor and have raised no concerns with the independent assessor nor generated any concerns from the public however the recommended condition is not supported and is contrary to the approved Schedule of Finishes and cannot be endorsed by the engineer supervising the development as the provision of timber framed windows cannot meet the relevant Australian Standard.

I have attached the comments from the applicant's Heritage Consultant and Consulting Engineer to provide additional more qualified information on this matter and to address reasons why this concern has been raised.

Any questions or clarification required at Wednesday's meeting are able to be addressed by the applicants representatives who are available for the Teams meeting.

LANCE DOYLE
M.Plan (UTS), B.AppSc (UWS),RPIA



Our Ref: 652329_230728

28 July 2023

Blue Pacific Construction
PO Box 626
MONA VALE NSW 1600

Attention: Peter Huben

Email: [REDACTED]

Dear Peter,

**1191 BARRENJOEY ROAD, PALM BEACH
WINDOWS AND DOORS**

We refer to the above project and note that one of the requirements of the Heritage Referral Report is that *"Window and door leaves are to be constructed from wood to match frames and reveals"*. The actual construction that is being used on site is aluminium windows with timber painted framed around windows on the outside. I am advised that this matches the construction of the building prior to demolition.

We are of the opinion that timber windows and doors are not suitable for this building and outline our reasons below.

- > The building is located partially above the high-tide level and the western elevation is subject to high westerly wind speeds across the open water surface. The windows and doors are hence subject to high wind forces and wind driven rain. Our view is that it would be very difficult to design timber windows that can meet the structural and water-tightness requirements for such conditions. We are of the opinion, that a timber window and door system would need to be subject to exhaustive testing to confirm the performance requirements.
- > The higher-than-normal levels of wind forces and wind driven rain for this building creates a very hostile environment. Timber windows and doors in this environment are expected to deteriorate at a higher rate requiring a high level of on-going maintenance.
- > We note that Flooding and Estuarine Risk Management Report has concluded that the *"still water and wave inundation of the lower deck area would occur in a future very severe ocean storm"*. The Architectural DA Flooding Statement notes that the site is subject to flooding and the *"Floor levels of the Boat Hire General Storage Room and Bin Room must be wet flood proofed..."* Timber windows and doors cannot be designed for such conditions as any such significant event will cause warping and damage, requiring full replacement.

The aluminium windows that have been used in this project have been specifically designed and detailed for the high wind forces, and provided with special sub-seals, wet seals and drop-down seals. The special details have been developed based on industry accepted understanding of the performance of detailing of aluminium windows and doors. The details provide a very high level of protection against the high wind forces and expected wind driven rain.

We do not believe that timber windows and doors are practical for this building and support the current construction approach to use aluminium windows.

Yours sincerely,



Praveel Prasad MIE(Aust) CPEng, NER (Structures and Civil)
Director
for PSP Consult

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

31 July 2023

Our Ref: H-20008

The General Manager

Northern Beaches Council

Attention: Jordan Davies

Jordan.Davies@northernbeaches.nsw.gov.au

Dear Jordan,

RE: HERITAGE ADVICE FOR THE BOATHOUSE WINDOWS & DOORS - MODIFICATIONS TO DA2021/0669 - 1191-1193 BARRANJEYOY ROAD, PALM BEACH NSW 2108
REF: MOD2023/0171

This Heritage Advice letter has been prepared in response to the recommended Condition of Consent 38A. Windows and Door Leaves associated with the s4.55 Mod2023/0171 seeking “Modification of Development Consent DA2021/0669 granted for Demolition works and construction of a new restaurant, carparking and associated uses”. The subject Condition reads as follows:

38A. Window and Door Leaves

Window and door leaves are to be constructed from wood to match frames and reveals. Details demonstrating compliance with the condition are to be provided to the Principal Certifying Authority.

Reason: Maintenance of the heritage character of the building

It is noted that Council's Heritage Officer has raised a concern in relation to the proposal to have the window and door leaves in aluminium but the frames and reveals in timber. Also noting that *the aluminium is considered to be a poor outcome for the overall presentation of the building and Heritage will condition them to be retained in wood.*

The subject s4.55 modification (Mod2023/0171) included changes to only a few windows and doors of the Boathouse, which is under construction and due for completion soon with most of the windows and doors have already been installed as per the approved finishes and materials. The new building was approved under the Consent issued for DA2021/0669, which included all windows to be made of aluminium and framed in with timber architraves and reveals to match the window and doors of the Boathouse café building that it replaced. The previous building had all of its windows and doors in aluminum with the reveals and architraves (surrounding frames) in the same aluminum, too.

The materials and finishes that were submitted in response to Condition 24 of the DA2021/0669, detailed in the letter dated 22 December 2021 by City Plan Heritage, were based on the previous Boathouse building with the exception of the windows and doors being nominated to be framed in timber with paint finish in Dulux Natural White. The subject letter did not make note of the window and door leaves as they were to match the existing aluminum windows and doors in the same colour as the proposed timber frames surrounding them. The window and door leaves were already being nominated, as noted above, to match the materials of the previous Boathouse building. The original windows of the Boathouse café building were

replaced at some point with aluminum windows and doors in response to the issue of durability in a hostile environment. This was a fundamental consideration and an important driver of the design and construction of the current Boathouse café building.

The previous aluminum windows and doors did not have architraves that framed them but rather had thin/narrow frames. Notwithstanding, the aluminium window and door leaves that are currently installed have been made in a manner that have a frame size/section that represent the size of a timber window and door leave sizes rather than thin/narrow aluminum frames as it was in the previous demolished building. The images below show the differences between the previous window and doors and the new building that has almost all of its windows and doors have been completed with the exception of a few windows and doors that are proposed for minor modifications under the current Mod2023/0171. Given consideration to the previously approved finishes/materials and almost completed nature of the building's construction, it is not found suitable to ask construction of the window and door leaves of the ones that are subject of Mod2023/0171 to be in timber. This will create a difference in the already constructed/installed windows and doors and the ones that are part of the current modification application.

It is believed that the installed aluminum windows and doors, which are framed in with timber architraves and reveals, with thicker mullion sizes represent the replacement Boathouse building and maintain and enhance its contribution to the Barrenjoey Heritage Conservation Area. Furthermore, it should be noted that there are a number of windows with louvers that all had to be constructed of aluminum. Changes of aluminum to timber for a few window and door leaves will also create inconsistency across the facades of the new Boathouse café building. It is also noted that the saltwater environment makes it unsuitable for timber window and door leaves.

I trust the above heritage advice and comments will clarify the reasons for the proposed materials and assist in the assessment of the proposed modifications under Mod2023/0171. Should you wish to discuss the matter further please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned on 8270 3500 or at [REDACTED]

Yours Sincerely,

[REDACTED]

Kerime Danis

Director - Heritage

ATTACHMENT: PREVIOUS & CURRENT IMAGES OF THE BOATHOUSE CAFÉ



Figure 1: Previous Boathouse Café images showing the existing aluminum windows and doors with thin and narrow architraves and leaves.



Figure 2: The new replacement Boathouse café building under construction with powder coated aluminum window and door leaves framed in with timber architraves and reveals.