

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2022/2199
Proposed Development:	Demolition works and construction of shop top housing
Date:	19/10/2023
To:	Maxwell Duncan
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 20 DP 235980 , 19 Sydney Road MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
<p>The proposal has been referred to heritage as the subject property sits within the C2 - Manly Town Centre Conservation Area and is within the vicinity of a number of heritage items:</p> <p>Item I106 - Group of commercial buildings - All numbers, The Corso, Manly</p> <p>Item I108 - Group of commercial buildings - 41–45 The Corso, Manly</p> <p>Item I234 - Group of 5 commercial buildings - 39–47 Sydney Road, Manly</p> <p>Item I233 - Commercial and residential building - 12 Sydney Road, Manly</p>
Details of heritage items affected
<p>C2 - Manly Town Centre Conservation Area <u>Statement of significance</u> The Manly Town Centre Conservation Area (TCCA) is of local heritage significance as a reflection of the early development of Manly as a peripheral harbor and beachside village in the fledgling colony of New South Wales. This significance is enhanced by its role as a day-trip and holiday destination during those early years, continuing up to the present time, and its association with H G Smith, the original designer and developer of the TCCA as it is today.</p> <p>Item I106 - Group of commercial buildings <u>Statement of significance</u> The streetscape and its special qualities are of major significance to the state. The Corso has important historical links to the development of tourism and recreation which is still present and likely to continue. It's role as the pedestrian link between harbour and ocean, city and sea - for the tourist, is fundamental to Manly's status as a resort.</p> <p><u>Physical description</u> The Corso acts as a low scale horizontal corridor which steps down from the harbour to the ocean. The atmosphere of The Corso is of a 19th century place. Its special qualities include the contrasts of horizontal (low scale architecture) and vertical (planting) dimensions, and urban and natural elements.</p> <p>Item I108 - Group of commercial buildings <u>Statement of significance</u> The group is of major significance for its contribution to the streetscape of The Corso and as extant 19th century commercial architecture.</p>

Physical description

Group of (originally) five two storey brick buildings with painted stone face and mixture of slate, iron and tiled roofs. The buildings were originally constructed as a symmetrical group: the two end buildings bearing paired gabled ends over first floor with mock Tudor design in timber and render on the western end and intaglio design on the eastern. The buildings either side of the centre had triangular pediments above first floor windows and the central building has a segmental pediment of the same width containing two semi-circular windows with multi-paned glazing. The central building also has heavily ornamented pilasters at first floor level. Two (of a possible four) tall stone (?) chimneys survive. Two halves of the eastern end buildings have been demolished and the space infilled. Ground floor shopfronts are modern. (originally 41 The Corso entry SoS)

Other relevant heritage listings

SEPP (Biodiversity and Conservation) 2021	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	No	

Consideration of Application

The proposal seeks consent for the demolition of the existing structures and the construction of a three storey shop top housing development. The existing building on the subject site is not a listed heritage item but it is considered to be a contributory building, which is a three-storey inter-war shop building with contemporary shopfronts at the ground floor level and offices to the first and second floor.

The existing building is not a heritage item, however it is a contributory building, located within the Town Centre Conservation Area, therefore the proposed demolition is not supported. During the pre-lodgement meeting, Heritage advised to retain the front facade unless structural issues dictate that the façade on Sydney Road is to be demolished, then a reconstruction may be acceptable. However, the submitted documents do not include any statements for structural issues that support the demolition. The HIS submitted with the application concludes that "*The demolition of the building and construction of a sympathetically designed modern infill will not detract from the significance of the HCA. The proposed new building is contemporary in character but demonstrates respect for the key forms, architectural proportions, and materials of contributory buildings in the HCA.*" This approach could had been acceptable only if the proposal was for an infill building located in the HCA. However, the existing building is considered to be a contributory building; and contributory buildings are to be retained and conserved; alterations and additions to contributory buildings are to be designed to conserve the original form, scale, fenestration and fabric where visible from the public domain. All original elements and details of contributory or neutral buildings should be retained, especially on front façades. Loss of any building that contributes to the significance and character of a heritage conservation area would reduce the integrity and heritage values of the heritage conservation area, therefore, Council will not approve the demolition of the front facade unless it would not be technically feasible to retain it.

The proposed rear facade is considered acceptable, however, the retention or reconstruction-if the demolition is justified, of the front facade is required from a heritage perspective and the setback of

Level 3 from the front boundary is required to be minimum 3m.

Revised comments - 19 October 2023

Amended documents, submitted on 15 September 2023, includes a structural report by Northwood Consulting Engineers to justify the proposed demolition of the existing contributory building, which is considered to address earlier concerns. Therefore, the proposal can be assessed as an infill building. The proposed massing of the building and the use of a parapeted roofline - as seen from the street level and the materiality of the façades is considered to respond to the existing context, but the proposed Sydney Road facade could be improved with the reinterpreted corbelling details, which is considered to be an expression of the existing horizontal elements as part of the historical development of the existing building. The amended architectural drawings include a reduction to the height of the parapet walls, which have been reduced to be lower than the permissible height limit. Heritage recommends to not lower the parapet wall below the 12m height plane as this will allow the interpretation of the existing parapet wall treatment and help to reduce the visibility of the third level, otherwise the setback to the third level will have to be increased. The Market Place facade would also interpret the existing openings on the ground floor by replacing the proposed large opening with smaller openings, interpreting the existing ratio of solid to void.

Therefore, Heritage require amendments to the proposal.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of MLEP 2013.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

The proposal is therefore unsupported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

Nil.