

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2023/0987
Proposed Development:	Demolition and construction of a shop top housing development with basement parking
Date:	10/08/2023
To:	Alex Keller
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 1 SP 14133 , 39 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 2 SP 14133 , 38 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 3 SP 14133 , 36 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 4 SP 14133 , 35 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 5 SP 14133 , 1 / 37 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 6 SP 14133 , 2 / 37 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 7 SP 14133 , 3 / 37 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 1 DP 100633 , 40 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 1 DP 104766 , 41 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 1 DP 34395 , 42 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 1 DP 719821 , 43 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095 Lot CP SP 14133 , 35 - 39 Belgrave Street MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
The proposal has been referred to Heritage as the subject site is located within the vicinity of a number of heritage items and a conservation area, all listed in Schedule 5 of Manly LEP 2013. Item I162 – Ivanhoe Park - Ivanhoe Park (bounded by Sydney Road, Belgrave Street and Raglan Street) Item I255 – Electricity substation No 15009 - 34A–36 Whistler Street, Manly Item I254 - St Mary's Church, presbytery and school - Whistler Street (corner Raglan Street), Manly C1 – Pittwater Road Conservation Area
Details of heritage items affected
Item I162 – Ivanhoe Park <u>Statement of Significance</u> Ivanhoe Park (including Manly Oval) cultural landscape, is important in the course of New South Wales cultural history combining a 'pleasure garden' park, a traditional 'village green' community and sporting venue, and a passive recreational garden, demonstrating the principal characteristics of a Victorian-era park adapted to the Australian setting. This landscape is unique within New South Wales as a place with a combined history of Aboriginal heritage and 150 years of recreation, sport and community use. With its natural land formation of sandstone outcrops and overhangs and watercourse flowing into

what was a low-lying swamp area, the site has high potential to reveal tangible Aboriginal heritage of the Kay-ye-my people, and with its close proximity to three identified aboriginal heritage sites the site relates to intangible cultural heritage of the local Aboriginal people.

Ivanhoe Park is one of the few planned colonial era 'pleasure grounds' surviving in New South Wales. Since its establishment in the 1860s Ivanhoe Park has been an important destination for pleasure and healthy recreation for vast numbers of visitors to Manly from Sydney and beyond. The 'village green' oval and Ivanhoe Park pavilion became the centre of sporting and community functions and events, not just for Manly residents but for the region and NSW.

Ivanhoe Park (including Manly Oval) cultural landscape, is a diverse and complex site with its natural sandstone outcrops and watercourse, Victorian 'gardenesque' plantings, rich diversity of native and planted tree species, war memorial garden, traditional 'village green' oval, and sporting complex. Combined, it demonstrates an unusual yet pleasing aesthetic.

Item I255 – Electricity substation No 15009

Statement of Significance

The Manly Zone substation is a fine and robust, well detailed face brick purpose designed and built structure. It is an excellent and externally intact representative example of the Interwar Art Deco style. It is considered to be a rare example of this style and of State Significance.

Physical Description

The Manly Zone substation is a fine and robust, well detailed face brick two storey building built on the street alignment. Stylistic elements of Interwar Art Deco include the extensive use of face brick and brick detailing in the stepped parapet and base of the projecting first floor oriel windows and the use of bold linear motifs. Decorative elements include the use of curved bricks to form unusual framing around windows and doorways. The building incorporates a residential unit titled #15101 RESEDENTIAL UNIT, 34a Whistler Street.

The Manly Zone substation is constructed in load-bearing face brick with cement render applied to the plant doorway reveals. Original windows are double hung timber multi pane.

Item I254 - St Mary's Church, presbytery and school

Statement of Significance

The listing covers a significant group of five religious and school buildings dating from circa 1890 to the 1950s, complementary in style. The group is of significance for Manly area for its historical, aesthetic and social reasons, and for the rarity and representativeness. The site has a long and ongoing spiritual association with the local Roman Catholic community since c.1890 when the church building was created. The site is a major landmark visible from a distance from both Raglan Street and Whistler Street. The complex makes a major contribution to the streetscape and to the townscape character, augmented as the group of buildings are adjoining each other at the site. The Church building, the Presbytery and School are each representative of their respective type of building around the date of creation, and the complex as a whole is a rare collection of five fine buildings with spiritual associations in the local area.

C1 – Pittwater Road Conservation Area

Statement of Significance

This street pattern is distinctive and underpins the urban character of the area. The streets remain unaltered in their alignment, although the names of Malvern, Pine and North Steyne are now names for what were Whistler, Middle Harbour and East Steyne respectively.

Physical Description

The streetscape of Pittwater Road is a winding vista of late 19th and early 20th century commercial and residential architecture of generally one or two floors - although there are exceptions such as the four storey private hotel. The streetscape provides a 19th century atmosphere due to it's scale, width and the number of extant Victorian structures. Within the streetscape there are a number of individually significant buildings which are listed separately. Adjacent streets generally comprise a consistent pattern of one and two story residential cottages, with the occasional terrace. Some

streets have intermittent street plantings and remnant stone kerbs. The flat topography is accentuated by the escarpment to the west which provides an important visual, vertical and vegetated backdrop.

Other relevant heritage listings

SEPP (Biodiversity and Conservation) 2021	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	No	

Consideration of Application

The proposal seeks consent for the demolition of the existing buildings on the site, and the development of a new 5-storey, mixed-use building incorporating ground-floor commercial tenancies, residential apartments at levels above and two levels of basement carparking.

The existing building at 35-39 Belgrave Street comprises a 2-storey Inter-War Mediterranean style building, with a frontage to Belgrave Street containing 4 commercial shopfronts with a central entry to the upper levels and 3 commercial tenancies at the upper level. An assessment of heritage significance for this building has been prepared by URBIS within the HIS submitted with this application and concluded that the existing building does not meet any threshold to warrant its listing as a heritage item, and the proposed demolition as part of this development will not generate any adverse heritage impacts. Therefore, the proposed demolition of this historic building is considered acceptable, subject to the requirement of a photographic archival record.

A pre-lodgement meeting was held for this application and heritage comments were provided in July 2023. The proposed façade treatment was recommended to be designed to reflect the existing subdivision pattern, as it provides the predominant rhythm of the building frontages. The proposed building mass was recommended to respect the height, bulk, density and grain of the heritage fabric in the locality. The proportions, materials and fenestration in the facade treatment is important and the new facade should respect the cohesiveness of the heritage context. In this regard, level 4 openings should not be larger than the lower level openings. The relationship with the heritage items and the HCA across the road is also important. The proposed height should be no higher than the neighbouring heritage buildings or the higher portions should not be visible from the public domain. The proposed upper level is already above the permissible height limits and the proposed vaulted roofline, extending to the edge of the building to cover the proposed terraces, adds on to the already excessive height. Heritage recommend to have a set back of minimum 2.5m from the street frontages (Belgrave, Raglan and Whistler) to minimise the visibility of the top level and reduce the bulk and scale to minimise the impact upon the heritage items (specifically "Electricity substation" the heritage item with state significance) in the vicinity and the Pittwater Road Conservation Area.

Therefore, Heritage cannot support the proposal in its current form and require amendments.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of MLEP 2013.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

The proposal is therefore unsupported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

Nil.