

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2022/0971
Date:	02/11/2022
To:	Stephanie Gelder
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 7379 DP 1164856 , 0 Sydney Road MANLY NSW 2095 Lot 2502 DP 1143032 , 0 Sydney Road MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
This application has been referred as the subject site is a local heritage item and contains local heritage items: Item I162 - Ivanhoe Park (bounded by Sydney Road, Belgrave Street and Raglan Street), Manly Item I161 - The Ivanhoe Loop (former tram track route), Ivanhoe Park, Manly Both are listed in Schedule 5 of Manly LEP 2013. The site is also a listed State heritage item under the provisions of the Heritage Act, 1977: SHR #02029 - Ivanhoe Park (including Manly Oval) cultural landscape, Manly
Details of heritage items affected
Details of the heritage item, as contained within the Heritage Inventory, are: Item I162 - Ivanhoe Park (bounded by Sydney Road, Belgrave Street and Raglan Street) - (excerpt) <u>Statement of Significance:</u> Ivanhoe Park has historical significance at a Local level because it is a physical remnant of a nineteenth century pleasure garden from the period when the Manly village area was a seaside resort and an embodiment of local entrepreneurs who provided recreation (both leisure and sporting) facilities for prospective residents as well as for day-trippers from Sydney. It is also significant at a Local level as the site of the first Manly Council chambers building and the site of part of the Spit to Manly tram line. It is of historical significance at a Local level, and possibly at a State level, as one of the oldest cricket grounds still in use within the Sydney area, second only to the Garrison Cricket Oval, the Domain and the University Oval and one of the first to be formalised within in a suburban park. As the site of the renowned Manly Wildflower show held from 1881 onwards until 1893, the park still retains some of the ferns for which the park (and the area) was once known. Item I161 - The Ivanhoe Loop (former tram track route), Ivanhoe Park, Manly <u>Physical Description:</u> The tramline from Manly to the Spit left Manly via Raglan Street, entering Ivanhoe Park near the entrance to the Bowling Club, and then formed a reserved track curving around the north east corner of the Park as a passing loop or duplication. The site of the Loop survives at the northern end of Park Avenue, up which the original line continued until it reached Sydney Road. SHR #02029 - Ivanhoe Park (including Manly Oval) cultural landscape, Manly (excerpt) <u>Statement of Significance:</u> Ivanhoe Park (including Manly Oval) cultural landscape, is important in the course of New South Wales cultural history combining a 'pleasure garden' park, a traditional 'village green' community and sporting venue, and a passive recreational garden, demonstrating the principal characteristics of a Victorian-era park adapted to the Australian setting. This landscape is unique within New South Wales as a place with a combined history of Aboriginal heritage and 150 years of recreation, sport

and community use.

Ivanhoe Park (including Manly Oval) cultural landscape, is a diverse and complex site with its natural sandstone outcrops and watercourse, Victorian 'gardenesque' plantings, rich diversity of native and planted tree species, war memorial garden, traditional 'village green' oval, and sporting complex. Combined, it demonstrates an unusual yet pleasing aesthetic.

Other relevant heritage listings

Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	Comment if applicable
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	Yes	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	No	

Consideration of Application

This application is for demolition of the existing former child care building in the Botanic Gardens precinct of Ivanhoe Park (western end) as well as new landscaping works comprising the installation of interpretive paving and landscaping at the Park Ave entrance to the Park.

As the works affect a State heritage item, the application is an Integrated DA and comments under the Heritage Act, 1977 are required from Heritage NSW. Heritage NSW responded by letter dated 28 October 2022 and provided a number of General Terms of Approval, pursuant to Section 4.47 of the EP&A Act, 1979. This advice has been reviewed and all General Terms of Approval should be applied to any consent.

A Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) by Edwards Heritage Consultants (April 2021) was submitted with the application. This report concluded that the building proposed to be demolished does not satisfy the criteria for local heritage significance. Additionally, it concluded that while the building is located within the State listed Ivanhoe Park, it does not significantly contribute to the identified fundamental heritage features of the Park. It can be seen from the Statement of Significance for Ivanhoe Park that it is listed as a cultural landscape, rich in history as an area used for the last 150 years by the community for passive and active recreation. The former child care building does not greatly contribute to this historical significance. The HIS report has been reviewed and its conclusions agreed with.

While the building dates to 1963 and was designed by Edwards, Madigan & Torzillo Architects, the building has been deemed unsuitable for use as a child care centre due to issues with damp and black mould, as a consequence of the building being built over a natural watercourse. Alternative uses have been considered, however it has been determined that the building is unfit for continued use and is at the end of its useable life. It is also located in the centre of the Botanic Gardens area of Ivanhoe Park, making vehicular access difficult and intrusive on park users.

Ivanhoe Park is subject to an adopted Conservation Management Plan (CMP) prepared by GML Heritage (April 2021). This CMP graded this former kindergarten building as having little heritage significance and noted that it was proposed to be demolished. As an element identified as having little significance, the CMP policies allow for the buildings removal, as it will not have an adverse

impact upon the identified heritage significance of Ivanhoe Park. The CMP also identifies the primary function of Ivanhoe Park as an active and passive recreational space. Therefore removal of this building, now unfit for purpose, and recovery of the land for recreational use, will enhance the primary function of the Park. Policy 10.1 of the CMP specifically allows for the removal of building elements of lower significance, to provide opportunities for change. The area where the building is to be demolished will be replaced with soft landscaping. Heritage NSW do not have any objections to the demolition of this building.

The proposed landscaping works are in accordance with the adopted Ivanhoe Park Landscape Masterplan. The works involve the construction of a pathway and landscaping to interpret part of the former tram route which curved through this part of the Park. It is considered that the works will enhance the heritage significance of this part of Ivanhoe Park and add to the historical interpretation of the the former tram route, which is separately heritage listed.

Therefore no objections are raised on heritage grounds subject to photographic archival recording of the building to be demolished and its setting and the inclusion of all General Terms of Approval conditions required by Heritage NSW.

Further Comments

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of MLEP 2013:

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No Has a CMP been provided? Yes
Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided?
Yes

The proposal is therefore supported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

Photographic Archival Record

A photographic archival record the former child care building (including interiors and exteriors) and its setting within Ivanhoe Park, is to be prepared generally in accordance with the guidelines issued by the Heritage NSW, Department of Planning and Environment. This record must be submitted to Council's Heritage Officer for approval, prior to commencement of any demolition or works on-site.

The photographic record should be made using digital technology and should include:

- Location of property, date of survey and author of survey;
- A site plan at a scale of 1:200 showing all structures and major landscape elements;
- Floor plans of any buildings at a scale of 1:100;
- Photographs which document the site, cross-referenced in accordance with recognised archival recording practice to catalogue sheets. The extent of documentation will depend on the nature of the item.

Reason: To provide an archival photographic record of the building to be demolished and its setting, prior to any works.

