

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	DA2021/0668
Date:	30/07/2021
To:	Rebecca Englund
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 81 DP 8076 , 95 Bower Street MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
The proposal has been referred to Heritage as the subject property is within the vicinity of a number of heritage items: Item I131 - St Patrick's Estate - 151 Darley Road (Primary address, alternate address 106 Darley Road) Item I90 - Street trees (<i>Acaucaria heterophylla</i>) - Bower Street (from Cliff Street to College Street)
Details of heritage items affected
Details of the heritage items as contained within the Northern Beaches inventory is as follows: Item I131 - St Patrick's Estate <u>Statement of significance:</u> St Patrick's Estate is a site of national heritage significance. The unparalleled grandeur of the cultural landscape, including its setting, buildings and landscape components, as well as the history it embodies, reflects a unique physical manifestation of the Catholic Church in Australia, not seen in any other location in the country. The site exemplifies an important period in the Church's history in Australia, as well as the vision of Cardinal Moran, and for that reason has great significant to Australian Catholics, as well as the broader community. The built elements, particularly Moran House with its Gothic Revival architectural style, reflect both the romanticism of Cardinal Moran's vision for the Australian Catholic Church, as well as the austere nature of the Church at that time. Sited on the prominent northern side of North Head, overlooking Manly and the surrounding area, St Patrick's has become a landmark recognised by locals and visitors alike. Despite recent redevelopments of parts of the site, and the adaptive reuse of the key buildings, the site has retained its integrity and still presents as a cohesive whole. <u>Physical description:</u> St Patrick's Estate is a complex cultural landscape comprising many significant components, including buildings, grounds, gardens and landscape elements (including walls, pathways, and significant trees). It is magnificently sited on the northern slopes of North Head, overlooking Manly and Ocean Beach, and it is a prominent and striking landmark in the Manly area. Architecturally, the complex comprises a variety of Nineteenth and early Twentieth Century buildings primarily in Gothic Revival style. The most prominent of these is Moran House, a four storey symmetrical sandstone building with bell tower at the centre, above the main entrance, which is also flanked by a two storey colonnade. The kitchen wing was added in 1935. Key vistas include looking south east toward the building from the town centre, and from the front of Moran House looking north west towards the town centre.

Item 190 - Street trees (*Araucaria heterophylla*)

Statement of significance:

Listed for its aesthetic importance to the streetscape. Continuity with the earlier street tree plants of Manly 'Village' area.

Physical description:

Norfolk Island pines (*Araucaria Heterophylla*). Appear to have been planted in the early 1900's.

Other relevant heritage listings

Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	N/A	

Consideration of Application

The proposal seeks consent for alterations and additions to the existing dwelling, including substantial demolitions and a first floor addition. Although, not a listed under Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013, the property appears to contain elements of an Inter-war Californian bungalow style building. It is noted that, the original features of the existing dwelling, including most of the internal original fabric, has been preserved and still intact. This proposal is for substantial alterations and additions to the existing building, changing the existing building form from single storey to a two storey building by removing the existing roof and adding a second floor.

The subject site is not a listed heritage item under the Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013, however it is considered that the property appears to contain elements of a substantial Inter-war Californian Bungalow. Therefore, the potential heritage significance should be taken into consideration in accordance with Manly DCP 2013:

Clause 133.2.1.2 Potential Heritage Significance

If the property is assessed as having merit as a potential heritage item, the heritage controls and considerations in this plan will apply. (3.2.1 Consideration of Heritage Significance)

The application includes a Heritage Assessment by Damian O'Toole Town Planning and Heritage Services, which has assessed both the potential heritage significance of the site and the impact of the proposed development on identified heritage items in the vicinity. The report has determined that the house is not of significance and that the proposal is acceptable when assessed against the identified significance of the heritage items in the vicinity. However, the building itself has been identified as "*representative of Inter-War Californian Bungalow Style*" in the same report and the following statement from the same report demonstrates that the property has moderate significance in accordance with the assessment of significance against the criterion set by the NSW Heritage Office: "*The subject site has moderate heritage significance as a substantial Inter-War dwelling house which formed part of the original mid-20th century development following the subdivision of the wider St Patricks Estate. Whilst the dwelling is largely intact externally, it is probable, based on visual inspection of on-site fabric, that changes have been made to the internal floor plan that have affected its overall significance*".

The Heritage Guidelines by NSW Heritage Office states that *"The level of heritage significance at State or local levels can only be determined by comparison with other like items. The attributes described for criteria (f) and (g) will assist in the determination of significance. A heritage item is not to be excluded on the ground that items with similar characteristics have already been entered on a statutory list"*, and the Heritage Assessment report by Damian O'Toole Town Planning and Heritage Services states in the criteria (g) that *"The subject site has moderate representative value representative significance as an original mid-20th century Inter-War period dwelling which has many features of the Inter-War period."*

The report continues as *"Whilst the site has moderate aesthetic significance, with many features of the Inter-War period (including internal decoration and details) largely intact, it is noted that there are other better examples of the style in the vicinity, with more substantial features and decoration, and in better condition."* and concludes as *"The site does not meet the threshold for Local heritage listing as an individual item."*

However, an item will be considered to be of State (or local) heritage significance if it meets one or more of the criterion set by Heritage Council of NSW, and the report states that the property meets the criteria in more than one criterion:

Criterion (A) - Historical Significance

Comments – The subject site has moderate historical significance as mid-20th century dwelling, which form part of later phase of development in the area following the subdivision of the St Patricks College Estate. The site therefore has some historical association with the college site.

Criterion (C) - Aesthetic Significance

Comments – The subject site has moderate aesthetic significance as an original mid-20th century Inter-War period dwelling which has many features of the Inter-War period, with internal decoration and details largely intact. However, it is noted that there are other better examples of the style in the vicinity and the estate, with more substantial features and decoration, and in better condition.

Criterion (G) - Representativeness

Comments – The subject site has moderate representative value representative significance as an original mid-20th century Inter-War period dwelling which has many features of the Inter-War period.

Therefore, the conclusion stated in the Heritage Assessment report is inconsistent with the "NSW heritage assessment criteria".

it is believed that, as stated above, the possibility of a moderate significance of the existing building should be taken into consideration in designing the internal alterations and the new additions as outlined below:

- retention of the original fire place and the adjoining art-deco style cabinetry in the living room
- retention of the internal original fabric including the plaster ceilings with some ceilings with plaster decoration, original lights fittings with some ceiling roses, picture rails, cornices, skirting boards where possible
- retention of the original timber doors or timber with multi-paned glazing doors
- retention of the original windows where possible
- a more considerate approach to the first floor addition - retention of part of existing roof for interpretation of the original single level bungalow
- deletion of the southern roof terrace and the external stairs leading to this terrace

Therefore, heritage requires amendments to the proposal.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of Manly LEP 2013.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

Further Comments

COMPLETED BY: Oya Guner, Heritage Advisor

DATE: 30 July 2021

The proposal is therefore unsupported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

Nil.