

Heritage Referral Response

Application Number:	Mod2022/0454
Proposed Development:	Modification of Development Consent DA2021/0668 granted for Alterations and additions to a dwelling house
Date:	20/12/2022
To:	Nick Keeler
Land to be developed (Address):	Lot 81 DP 8076 , 95 Bower Street MANLY NSW 2095

Officer comments

HERITAGE COMMENTS
Discussion of reason for referral
The proposal has been referred to Heritage as the subject site is in the vicinity of a number of heritage items: Item I131 - St Patrick's Estate - 151 Darley Road (Primary address, alternate address 106 Darley Road) Item I90 - Street trees (<i>Acaucaria heterophylla</i>) - Bower Street (from Cliff Street to College Street)
Details of heritage items affected
Item I131 - St Patrick's Estate <u>Statement of significance:</u> St Patrick's Estate is a site of national heritage significance. The unparalleled grandeur of the cultural landscape, including its setting, buildings and landscape components, as well as the history it embodies, reflects a unique physical manifestation of the Catholic Church in Australia, not seen in any other location in the country. The site exemplifies an important period in the Church's history in Australia, as well as the vision of Cardinal Moran, and for that reason has great significant to Australian Catholics, as well as the broader community. The built elements, particularly Moran House with its Gothic Revival architectural style, reflect both the romanticism of Cardinal Moran's vision for the Australian Catholic Church, as well as the austere nature of the Church at that time. Sited on the prominent northern side of North Head, overlooking Manly and the surrounding area, St Patrick's has become a landmark recognised by locals and visitors alike. Despite recent redevelopments of parts of the site, and the adaptive reuse of the key buildings, the site has retained its integrity and still presents as a cohesive whole. <u>Physical description:</u> St Patrick's Estate is a complex cultural landscape comprising many significant components, including buildings, grounds, gardens and landscape elements (including walls, pathways, and significant trees). It is magnificently sited on the northern slopes of North Head, overlooking Manly and Ocean Beach, and it is a prominent and striking landmark in the Manly area. Architecturally, the complex comprises a variety of Nineteenth and early Twentieth Century buildings primarily in Gothic Revival style. The most prominent of these is Moran House, a four storey symmetrical sandstone building with bell tower at the centre, above the main entrance, which is also flanked by a two storey colonnade. The kitchen wing was added in 1935. Key vistas include looking south east toward the building from the town centre, and from the front of Moran House looking north west towards the town centre. Item I90 - Street trees (<i>Acaucaria heterophylla</i>) <u>Statement of significance:</u>

Listed for its aesthetic importance to the streetscape. Continuity with the earlier street tree plants of Manly 'Village' area.

Physical description:

Norfolk Island pines (*Araucaria Heterophylla*). Appear to have been planted in the early 1900's.

Other relevant heritage listings

Sydney Regional Environmental Plan (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005	No	
Australian Heritage Register	No	
NSW State Heritage Register	No	
National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register	No	
RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance	No	
Other	No	

Consideration of Application

This application seeks consent for modifications to the approved DA2021/0668, involving modification to the first floor balustrade, to allow for the retention of the ground floor level gable; a new extension to the first floor bedroom and living room with a gable end facing Bower Street; deletion of the approved gable roof above the first floor terrace that replaced with a flat roof to covering a larger portion of the terrace; changes to windows and internal layouts.

Although, the proposed change of the existing pitch to the front gable, above the bay window, is considered disrespecting the original style and character of the existing building, the additional impact is considered acceptable, as at least this change allows a complete gable appearance.

The size of the proposed new gable to the first floor, above the main bed and living room, is recommended to be reduced to allow the pitch of this gable to match the pitch of the original roof. The proposed change to the fenestration of the retained ground floor rear elevation is considered acceptable subject to the use of timber framed windows matching the original windows style. The proposed new flat roof, covering the terrace, is recommended to be a slim profile in order to not further dominate the retained portion of the existing building. Overall, the additional impact of the proposed modifications are considered to be manageable, subject to the imposition of the conditions of consent.

Amended drawings - 28 November 2022

The applicant has amended the proposal to reduce the size of the projected first floor gable to the main facade and this reduction is considered acceptable. The overhang of the flat roof over the terrace has been deleted to reduce the impact on the existing building. The amended drawings also indicate that the existing bay window and the existing gable above the window have been collapsed during the and demolished to be rebuilt on a like for like basis.

It is noted, that the external walls to the entry porch is now proposed to be demolished in order to raise the floor level; it is required to be rebuilt to match existing and the existing entry door should be salvaged and reused in the same location.

It is also noted, that the existing window (W31) is now proposed to be replaced with a bi-fold window

and that is not supported by Heritage; all existing windows facing Bower Street should be retained and any necessary replacement should be on a like for like basis.

The first floor wall cladding had not been specified in the approved DA2021/0668 and the latest drawings of the MOD2022/0454 - Revision K - 16/11/2022 indicate vertical cladding with paint finish. Heritage require this to be changed from vertical to horizontal cladding to be compatible with the retained portion of the existing building and the heritage context.

The proposal does not provide sufficient information regarding the boundary fence. The existing stone boundary wall along College and Bower Streets should be retained and the details of the proposed boundary fence should be submitted for approval to ensure the character of the existing streetscape is retained.

Revised comments - 20 December 2022

The applicant requested the condition of consent by Heritage, regarding the first floor external wall cladding, to be reconsidered to retain the proposed vertical cladding form rather than the recommended horizontal form. Given the small percentage of the wall cladding at the street elevations and the amount of the modifications to the existing building, the adverse impact upon the heritage values of the original building and the streetscape is considered manageable.

Therefore, no objections are raised on heritage grounds, subject to three conditions.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of Manly LEP 2013.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

Further Comments

The proposal is therefore supported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:

CONDITIONS TO BE SATISFIED PRIOR TO THE ISSUE OF THE CONSTRUCTION CERTIFICATE

Boundary fence

The existing stone boundary wall should be retained along College and Bower Streets and the details of the proposed boundary fence should be provided to retain the character of the existing streetscape. Details demonstrating compliance with this condition are to be submitted to Council's Heritage Advisor for approval prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To preserve the character of the existing streetscape.

Retention of windows

The existing window (W31) is now proposed to be replaced with a bi-fold window and this is not supported by Heritage; all existing windows facing Bower Street should be retained and any necessary replacement should be on a like for like basis. Details demonstrating compliance with this condition are to be submitted to Council's Heritage Advisor for approval prior to the issue of the Construction Certificate.

Reason: To respect the heritage values of the existing building.

CONDITIONS TO BE COMPLIED WITH DURING DEMOLITION AND BUILDING WORK**Entry door**

The existing external wall to the ground floor entry porch is now proposed to be demolished in order to raise the floor level; Heritage require this wall to be rebuilt with the salvaged face brick to match existing and the existing entry door with side windows should be salvaged and reinstated in the same location.

Reason: To preserve the heritage values of the existing building.