

## Heritage Referral Response

|                                        |                                                                                                                                                             |
|----------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Application Number:</b>             | DA2023/0299                                                                                                                                                 |
| <b>Proposed Development:</b>           | Demolition works, subdivision of three lots into five and construction of five new dwelling houses with swimming pools, associated landscaping and parking. |
| <b>Date:</b>                           | 08/05/2023                                                                                                                                                  |
| <b>To:</b>                             | Jordan Davies                                                                                                                                               |
| <b>Land to be developed (Address):</b> | Lot 82 DP 8076 , 35 Reddall Street MANLY NSW 2095<br>Lot 83 DP 8076 , 31 Reddall Street MANLY NSW 2095<br>Lot 84 DP 8076 , 29 Reddall Street MANLY NSW 2095 |

### Officer comments

| HERITAGE COMMENTS                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Discussion of reason for referral                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| <p>The proposal has been referred to Heritage as the subject site is within the vicinity of a number of heritage items, listed in Schedule 5 of Manly Local Environmental Plan 2013:</p> <p><b>Item I131 - St Patrick's Estate</b> - 151 Darley Road, Manly (State)</p> <p><b>Item I220 - Item I220 – House “Logan Brae”</b> - 32 Reddall Street, Manly</p> <p><b>Item I01 - House, “Bower Hall”</b> - 101 Bower Street, Manly</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| Details of heritage items affected                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| <p>Details of the heritage items, as contained within the Northern Beaches Heritage Inventory are:</p> <p><b>Item I131 - St Patrick's Estate</b><br/> <u>Statement of significance</u><br/>           St Patrick's Estate is a site of national heritage significance. The unparalleled grandeur of the cultural landscape, including its setting, buildings and landscape components, as well as the history it embodies, reflects a unique physical manifestation of the Catholic Church in Australia, not seen in any other location in the country. The site exemplifies an important period in the Church's history in Australia, as well as the vision of Cardinal Moran, and for that reason has great significant to Australian Catholics, as well as the broader community. The built elements, particularly Moran House with its Gothic Revival architectural style, reflect both the romanticism of Cardinal Moran's vision for the Australian Catholic Church, as well as the austere nature of the Church at that time. Sited on the prominent northern side of North Head, overlooking Manly and the surrounding area, St Patrick's has become a landmark recognised by locals and visitors alike. Despite recent redevelopments of parts of the site, and the adaptive reuse of the key buildings, the site has retained its integrity and still presents as a cohesive whole.</p> <p><b>Item I220 – House “Logan Brae”</b><br/> <u>Statement of Significance</u><br/>           A spectacular and finely detailed example of Inter-War California Bungalow on a corner site. Featuring cobbled front, elaborate gable ends facing each. Street frontage. A fine example of California Bungalow Style building.<br/> <u>Physical Description</u><br/>           Single storey Inter-War California Bungalow on a corner site, constructed of dark face brick. Features</p> |

elaborate gable ends to each street frontage, cobbled finish to front verandah base and columns, diamond-pattern leadlight casement windows. Original dark face brick front fence. Diamond - pattern leadlight casement windows.

### Item I01 - House, "Bower Hall"

#### Statement of Significance

#### Other relevant heritage listings

|                                                         |    |                                                              |
|---------------------------------------------------------|----|--------------------------------------------------------------|
| SEPP (Biodiversity and Conservation) 2021               | No |                                                              |
| Australian Heritage Register                            | No |                                                              |
| NSW State Heritage Register                             | No | In the vicinity of St Patrick's Estate which is State listed |
| National Trust of Aust (NSW) Register                   | No |                                                              |
| RAIA Register of 20th Century Buildings of Significance | No |                                                              |
| Other                                                   | No |                                                              |

#### Consideration of Application

The proposal seeks consent for the demolition of all existing structures and landscaping on the subject site, the subdivision of three lots into five lots and the construction of five detached, two storey dwellings with basement level parking, swimming pools and storage areas.

The subject site sits on a prominent location at the corner of Reddall and College Streets. It is also located in close proximity to a state heritage item and a local heritage item. In general terms, Council promotes the retention and adaptation of existing buildings rather than demolition and replacement with new structures. Furthermore, any new developments should positively contribute to the historic context and rather than devalue it. The Heritage Impact Statement, by Weir Phillips Heritage and Planning, states that "*The existing buildings makes a neutral contribution to the streetscape and presents as three structures either highly modified from their original form, both in plan and elevation or as unexceptional example of the Inter-War architectural style.*" However the existing buildings are considered to maintain the original bulk and scale and the built form, therefore contribute to the heritage significance of the existing context and the streetscape. Heritage conservation requires the retention of an appropriate visual setting that contributes to the significance of the area and any new work must recognise and support the heritage significance of the context and respond in a positive way. The proposed buildings, within the existing historic context are expected to provide continuity in the building form, by respecting the old while reflecting the new and creating links between the past and the present, rather than seeking to create contradistinctive building form, in order to support a new development that positively contributes to the historic context and does not devalue it. In this regards, the proposal is considered to not respond to the established and valued setting, and the historic context, in terms of the building form, fenestration, existing patterns, setbacks and important views. The view corridor along Reddall Street towards the principal buildings of St. Patricks Estate will be impacted as the proposed buildings on Reddall Street do not sit comfortably within the existing streetscape; the proposed setbacks, built forms, roof forms and proportions of the buildings do not relate to the established character of the surrounding buildings. However, the proposed colours are supported by Heritage as they are neutral in tone, which is considered to be an appropriate response to the historic context.

Concerns were raised in the submissions made to Council regarding the proposed design and its effects upon the heritage items within the vicinity and the streetscape and how this new development

will impact the historic context. Considerations should be given to comply with the relevant controls of *Manly DCP 2013*, specifically *Section 3.2 Heritage Considerations, 3.2.1.1 Development in the vicinity of heritage items, or conservation area*.

Therefore, Heritage require amendments to the proposal.

Consider against the provisions of CL5.10 of Manly LEP 2013.

Is a Conservation Management Plan (CMP) Required? No

Has a CMP been provided? No

Is a Heritage Impact Statement required? Yes

Has a Heritage Impact Statement been provided? Yes

The proposal is therefore unsupported.

Note: Should you have any concerns with the referral comments above, please discuss these with the Responsible Officer.

**Recommended Heritage Advisor Conditions:**

Nil.